# Problems of Translating Buddhist Texts in Pali, with Special Reference to Therigāthā

**Submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Translation Studies**

**by**

**S.K.M.D. Dharshani Gunathillake**

**(03HAPT03)**

**Centre for Applied Linguistics and Translation Studies**

**University of Hyderabad**

**Hyderabad (A.P.), India**

**December 2009**

Centre for Applied Linguistics and Translation Studies
University of Hyderabad
Hyderabad, 500046, (A.P.), India

## Certificate

This is to certify that I, *SKMD Dharshani Gunathillake,* have carried out the research embodied in the present thesis titled "*Problems of Translating Buddhist Texts in Pali, with Special Reference to Therigāthā,*" for the full period prescribed under the Ph.D. ordinances of the University.

I declare to the best of my knowledge that no part of this thesis was submitted for the award of any degree to any other institution or University.

(Signature of the candidate)
(03HAPT03)

(Signature of the Supervisor)
Prof. Shivarama Padikkal

(Signature of the Co-supervisor)
Dr. C.B. Varma, D.Litt.

(Signature of the Doctoral Committee Member)
Prof. Padmakar Dadegoankar

(Head of the Department)
Prof. Uma Maheshvar Rao

(Dean, School of Humanities)
Prof. Mohan G. Ramanan

## Acknowledgements

It is a pleasure to convey in my humble acknowledgment my heartfelt gratitude to a great number of people who have contributed in varied ways to the research.

First, let me offer my sincerest gratitude to my supervisor, Prof. Shivarama Padikkal, for his supervision, advice, and intuitive suggestions from the earliest stages of this research. He supported me throughout my thesis with his calm patience and vast knowledge whilst allowing me the room to work in my own way.

I would like to record my gratitude to my co-supervisor Dr. C.B.Varma for giving me constant encouragement and support in various ways. I am grateful to his guidance, which exceptionally inspired and enriched my growth as a researcher.

I gratefully thank Prof. Padmakar Dadegaonkar, my doctoral committee member for his kind understanding. I am fortunate to have experienced such kindness coupled with intellectual advice.

It is a pleasure to pay honor to Prof. P.R. Bapuji, Prof. Panchanan Mohanty, and the present Head of the department, Prof. Uma Maheshvar Rao, for advising and encouraging me to meet my target.

I deeply acknowledge Prof. Mohan G. Ramanan, the dean of the School of Humanities, University of Hyderabad, for his kind interventions to solve various administrative problems that I faced. The last phase of my stay in the hostel would not have been so pleasant without his help.

Advice and crucial contribution given by Prof. Piyaseeli Wijemanna, was the backbone of this research. I am very much grateful to her in every possible

way for encouraging me to select the subject, department, and the country to study.

I am extremely grateful in every possible way to Prof. W.M. Sirisena, former dean, University of Peradeniya, for selecting me to be trained in this particular field, providing all monetary assistance.

I thankfully acknowledge Prof. Probal Dasgupta, a former dean and my previous co-supervisor, for allowing me to start this research in his Institution, the Central University of Hyderabad.

The involvement of Prof. Sudarshana Senevirathne, the Director General in Archeology in Sri Lanka, with his originality, has nourished my intellectual maturity to a great extent.

I humbly pay my gratitude to Prof. W.M. Gunathilake for his guidance. I am very much thankful to Prof. U.P. Meddegama for helping me in various ways while being the appointed co-supervisor for NCAS grants.

I gratefully acknowledge Prof. John Halt and Dr. Sripadma Halt for funding me in the first half of the research through the ISLE programme.

The second half of the research was fulfilled by the funds allocated by the National Centre for Advanced Studies in Humanities and Social Sciences, an affiliated institution of the University Grant Commission, Sri Lanka. Their invaluable contribution is the very foundation of the success of this research.

I am very much thankful to the administrative staff as well as the other officials of the libraries I visited in Sri Lanka and India: the library at the University of Peradeniya, the Indira Gandhi Memorial Library at the University of Hyderabad, the library of CIEFL (EFLU), The Indira Gandhi National Centre for Arts in New Delhi, and the Central Institute of Indian Languages in Mysore.

I convey my deepest gratitude to Prof. Aloka Parasher for guiding and helping me at the initial stage of my research. Introducing her best student Dr.

Aruna, she helped me find one of my best friends. Aruna granted me her time for many intellectual discussions from which I benefit now as also then.

I am very much grateful to Prof. K.P. Rao and his family and Dr. M.N. Rajesh and his mother for their invaluable help related to travel, administration, and bureaucratic matters. Their tremendous patience and help made my stay very comfortable in India.

I am very much thankful to the former registrar (Academic) Mr. Ramakrishna Rao, and the present registrar, for smoothening out official problems that came up my way. I deeply admire the understanding of the officials, Mr. K. Subbarao, Mr. Aleem from Arts Block and Mr. Murthi and Mr. Apparao from CALTS.

I specially and wholeheartedly thank Prof. M.K. Ramachandran Nair and his whole family, including his daughter, my divine best friend, Dr. R. Vijayalekshmi, for all their help. I consider the unconditional love and affection we share to be a great blessing of God.

It is a privilege to pay my gratitude to Prof. Manager Pandey from JNU for providing me accommodation and all possible facilities in Delhi. His daughter, my sweet friend, Dr. Rekha Pandey became a beam line in my life with her unexplainable love.

Many thanks go in particular to my dear friend Lavanya Nemana and her entire family. Her divine, helping hands and unending affection was the main cause for my good health.

The Sincerity and concern of my dear friend Binumol abraham took many burdens off from me. I am very much thankful to her for bearing troubles for me.

The Understanding, love and care of Vasudhara, Dr. Suma Scaria, Dr. M. R. Beena, Usha, Padma, Jyoti, Bhargavi, Rajyasri, Malleshwari, Saraswathi,

Habeeb, Sapna and Swathi did not allow me to think even for a moment that I am in a foreign country.

The utmost care, corporation and advice of Ganga is beyond thanks. She helped me meet my thesis deadlines contentedly.

The feeding hands of Gouse with her loving commands made my life happy and healthy. I owe her in many, many ways.

I am extremely grateful to all of my friends who supported me so lovingly to see the end of my research. I consider myself immensely fortunate to have experienced such deep love and affection from all my friends.

The moral support that I got from my family is beyond expression. My husband and two sons, my mother and brother, are very much deserving of my deepest love and gratitude.

Finally, I would like to thank everybody who was helpful to me in one way or the other in the successful realization of my Ph.D. work. Let me also express my apologies for all errors of omission and commission from my part, which also include inadvertent omissions of all those who are not mentioned here, due to space constraints complementing human lapses.

28th December 2009 Dharshani Gunathillake

# Contents


| | | Page |
|---|---|---|
| Abbreviation | | 12 |
| Transliteration Table | | 14 |
| **Chapter One: Introduction Part I** | | 15 |
| 1.1 | Title and Scope of the Research | 15 |
| 1.2 | Aims and Objectives | 21 |
| 1.3 | Methodology | 24 |
| | 1.3.1 Criteria for Selection of Texts | 24 |
| | 1.3.1.1 Primary Texts | 24 |
| | 1.3.1.2 Secondary Texts | 27 |
| | 1.3.2 Clarifying the Key-words | 27 |
| | 1.3.2.1 Purpose | 28 |
| | 1.3.2.2 Buddhist Methodology | 32 |
| | 1.3.2.3 Interpretation and Translation | 37 |
| | 1.3.3 Literature Survey | 45 |
| | 1.3.4 Structure of the Thesis | 51 |
| | 1.3.4.1 Concepts and Technical Terms | 51 |
| | 1.3.4.2 Process of Demonstrating the Method in Nettippakaraṇa | 41 |
| | 1.3.5 Chapter Plan | 55 |
| **Introduction Part II** | | 57 |
| 1.4 | Attempts of Preserving Buddhist Teachings | 57 |
| 1.5 | Problems of Translating Buddhist Texts in Pali into English | 65 |
| **Chapter Two: The Buddhist Interpretation Method** | | 73 |
| 2.1 | Introduction of the Methodology of Nettippakaraṇa | 73 |
| 2.2 | Method of Nettippakaraṇa | 76 |
| 2.3 | Sixteen Modes of Conveying Meaning | 79 |
| | 2.3.1. Desanā hāra: the Mode of Teaching | 80 |
| | 2.3.2. Vicaya hāra: the Mode of an Investigation | 85 |

2.3.3. Yutti hāra: the Mode of a Construing 87
2.3.4 Padaṭṭhāna hāra: the Mode of Footings 88
2.3.5 Lakkhaṇa hāra: the Mode of Characteristics 90
2.3.6 Catubyuha hāra: the Mode of a Four-fold Arrangement 90
2.3.7 Āvatta hāra: the Mode of Conveying a Conversion 92
2.3.8 Vibhatti hāra: the Mode of an Analysis 92
2.3.9 Parivattana hāra: the Mode of a Reversal 93
2.3.10 Vevcana hāra: the Mode of Synonyms 94
2.3.11 Paññatti hāra: the Mode of Concepts 95
2.3.12 Otaraṇa hāra: the Mode of Ways of Entry 95
2.3.13 Sodhana hāra: the Mode of a Clearing up 96
2.3.14 Adhiṭṭhāna hāra: the Mode of Terms of Expression 96
2.3.15 Parikkhāra hāra: the Mode of Requisites 97
2.3.16 Samāropaṇa hāra: the Mode of Co-ordination 97
2.4 Five Guidelines 99
2.4.1. Nanditāvatta 99
2.4.2. Disālocana 104
2.4.3. Sīhavikkhīḷita 111
2.4.4. Tipukkhala 113
2.4.5. Aṅkusa 115
2.5 Description of the Root Terms 116
2.6 The Summery of the Text 119

**Chapter Three: Nibbāna as the Final Goal of Women in Therigāthā** 122

3.1 Introduction 122
3.2 Authorship and the Structure of the Text 125
3.3 Purpose of the Text 127
3.4 Reasons for Embracing Homelessness 143
3.4.1 Craving 143
3.4.2 Consequences of Craving 145
3.4.2.1 Social Problems 134
3.4.2.2 Problems Created by the Body 137
3.4.2.3 Understanding the Truth 139
3.5 Escape from Sufferings, the Path of Wisdom 142
3.6 Description of the Goal, the Nibbāna 146

**Chapter Four: Discussion of English Translations** 150

4.1 Organization of Translated Texts 151
4.1.1 Psalms of Sisters 151
4.1.2 The Elders Verses II 153
4.1.3 Effect of Organizing Factors on Translations 154
Style of the Translated Texts 157
4.2 Procedures of Translating Source Texts 160

**Chapter Five: Application of the Nettippakaraṇa, a Method** 166

5.1 Demonstration I-: Applying Sixteen Modes on a Single Verse 166

5.1.1 Desanā hāra: the Mode of Teaching 168
5.1.1.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 169
5.1.1.2 Translation Procedure 171
5.1.1.3 Translation 176
5.1.1.4 Constraints of the Mode 179
5.1.2 Vicaya hāra: the Mode of an Investigation 180
5.1.2.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 180
5.1.2.2 Translation Procedure 181
5.1.2.3 Translation 184
5.1.2.4 Constraints of the Mode 186
5.1.3 Yutti hāra: the Mode of a Construing 187
5.1.3.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 187
5.1.3.2 Translation Procedure 188
5.1.1.3 Translation 191
5.1.3.4 Constraints of the Mode 194
5.1.4 Padaṭṭhāna hāra: the Mode of Proximate Cause

5.1.4.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 194
5.1.4.2 Translation Procedure 195
5.1.4.3 Translation 197
5.1.4.4 Constraints of the Mode 197
5.1.5 Lakkhaṇa hāra: the Mode of Characteristics 198
5.1.5.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 198
5.1.5.2 Translation Procedure 199
5.1.5.3 Translation 200
5.1.5.4 Constraints of the Mode 200
5.1.6 Catubyuha hāra: the Mode of a Four-fold Arrangement 201
5.1.6.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 201

5.1.6.2 Translation Procedure 201
5.1.6.3 Translation 202
5.1.6.3 Constraints of the Mode 202
5.1.7 Āvatta hāra: the Mode of Conveying a Conversion 203
5.1.7.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 204
5.1.7.2 Translation Procedure 204
5.1.7.3 Translation 207
5.1.7.4 Constraints of the Mode 208
5.1.8 Vibhatti hāra: the Mode of an Analysis 208
5.1.8.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 209
5.1.8.2 Translation Procedure 210
5.1.8.3 Translation 212
5.1.8.4 Constraints of the Mode 213
5.1.9 Parivattana hāra: the Mode of a Reversal 214
5.1.9.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 214
5.1.9.2 Translation Procedure 214
5.1.9.3 Translation 215
5.1.9.4 Constraints of the Mode 216
5.1.10 Vevcana hāra: the Mode of Synonyms 216
5.1.10.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 216
5.1.10.2 Translation Procedure 217
5.1.10.3 Translation 218
5.1.10.4 Constraints of the Mode 219
5.1.11 Paññatti hāra: the Mode of Concepts 220
5.1.11.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 220
5.1.11.2 Translation Procedure 220
5.1.11.3 Translation 221
5.1.11.4. Constraints of the Mode 222
5.1.12 Otaraṇa hāra: the Mode of Ways of Entry 223
5.1.12.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 223
5.1.12.2 Translation Procedure 223
5.1.12.3 Translation 226
5.1.12.4 Constraints of the Mode 229
5.1.13 Sodhana hāra: the Mode of a Clearing- up 230
5.1.13.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 230
5.1.13.2 Translation Procedure 231
5.1.13.3 Translation 231
5.1.13.4 Constraints of the Mode 232
5.1. 14 Adhiṭṭhāna hāra: the Mode of Terms of Expression 232
5.1.14.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 232

5.1.14.2 Translation Procedure 233
5.1.14.3 Translation 234
5.1.14.4 Constraints of the Mode 234
5.1.15 Parikkhāra hāra: the Mode of Requisites 235
5.1.15.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 235
5.1.15.2 Translation Procedure 236
5.1.15.3 Translation 237
5.1.15.4 Constraints of the Mode 238
5.1.16 Samāropaṇa hāra: the Mode of Co-ordination 238
5.1.16.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode 238
5.1.16.2 Translation Procedure 229
5.1.16.3 Translation 241
5.1.16.4 Constraints of the Mode 244
5.2. Conclusion for Demonstration- I 244
5.3 Instructions on Applying the Method on the Full Text 249
5.3.1 Positing Modes for the Verses in the First Category 251
5.3.2 Positing Modes for the Verses in the Second Category 253
5.3.3 Positing Modes for the Verses in the Third Category 257
5.4 Conclusion on Applying Modes on a Full Text 259

**Chapter Six: Conclusion** 261

6.1 Chapter-wise Summary 263
6.2 Suggestions for Future Studies 276

**Bibliography** 278

## Abbreviations

1. References

| | |
|---|---|
| A | *Aṅguttara Nikāya* (ed. H. Hardy and R. Morris. 5 Vols. PTS. 1885-1900) |
| Abhs-S | *Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha Sarūpa* (ed. C.B.Varma. SIP. 2002) |
| Bond | *Nettippakaraṇa Summary* (Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies, Vol. 7, 1996) |
| CSDS | *Chaṭṭha Saṅgāyanā* CD-ROM (ed. S.N Goenka, Vipassana Research Institute, Igatpuri, India) |
| DN | *Dīgha Nikāya* (ed. T.W. Rhys Davids and J.E. Carpenter. 3 Vols. PTS. 1890-1911) |
| DOP | *A Dictionary of Pāli*, (ed. Margaret Cone. Part I. PTS. 2001) |
| Dpv. | *Dīpavaṃsa* (ed. trans. P. Ñāṇānanda, Sri Lanka, 1927) |
| EBT | *Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge* ( K.N. Jayathilleke, 1980). |
| JSTOR | *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* (Oxford University Press) |
| Mhv. | *Mahāvaṃsa* (ed. Batuvantudawa and Sumangala, Colombo, 1808). |
| M | *Majjima Nikāya* (eds. T. Trenckner and R. Chalmers, 3 Vols. PTS. 1887-1901: |
| Ñāṇamoli | *The Guide* (trans. *Nettippakaraṇa.* PTS, 1962). |
| Netti | *Nettppakarana* (ed. trans. Labugama Lankananda Thero, Colombo, 1980). |
| PED | *Pāli-English Dictionar*y (ed. T.W. Rhys Davids and William Stede. 2007) |
| PEG | *A Pāli-English Glossary of Buddhist Technical Terms* (ed. Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli, Srl Lanka, 1980) |

| | |
|---|---|
| RETS | *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies* (ed. Mona Baker, Routledge, 1998). |
| S | *Saṃyutta Nikāya* (ed. L. Free. 6 Vols., PTS. 1884-1904). |
| *Thig* | *Therigāthā* ( ed. Halgastota Devananda Thero. Ceylon. 1970). |
| TSR | *Translation Studies Reader*, (ed. Laerence Venuti. Routledge. 2003) |
| TT-1 | *Psalms of Sisters* (trans. of Therigāthā, C.A.F. Rhys Davids. 1948. |
| TT-2 | *Elders Verses II* (trans. of Therigāthā. K.R. Norman. PTS.1969). |
| UCR | *University of Ceylon Review* (University of Peradeniya, Sri Lanka). |
| Varma | *Dictionary of Abhidhammic Terms,* foreworded by G. Cardona (ed. C.B. Varma. SIP. 1981). |

2. Publishers

| | |
|---|---|
| BJT | Buddha Jayanti Tipiṭaka Series, Sri Lanka. |
| BPS | Buddhist Publication Society, Kandy, Sri Lanka. |
| PTS | Pāli Text Society, London. |
| SHB | Simon Hewavitharana Bequest, Sri Lanka. |
| SIP | Sineru International Publications, Ranchi, India. |
| MB | Mothilal Banarsidass, New Delhi. |

3. Grammatical Terms

| | |
|---|---|
| ed. | edited by. |
| Govt. | Government. |
| No. | number. |
| trans. | translated by. |
| Vol (s). | Volume(s). |

## Transliteration Table

The Sysetem of Transliteration followed herein is based on the Library of Congress Model for Sanskrit and Prakrit in Devanagari Script, which Dr. C.B. Varma has adopted for his Abhs-S. [1]

Vowels and Diphthongs

a, ā, i, ī, u, ū, e, o

Consonants

| | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Guttarals: | ka | kha | ga | gha | ṅa |
| Palatals: | ca | cha | ja | jha | ña |
| Cerebrals: | ṭa | ṭha | ḍa | ḍha | ṇa |
| Dentals: | ta | tha | da | dha | na |
| Labials: | pa | pha | ba | bha | ma |
| Semi Vowels: | ya | ra | la *or* ḷa | | va |
| Sibilant: | sa | | | | |
| Aspirate: | ha | | | | |

Transliterations in quotations and works cited have been retained as such.

[1] Abhs-S, 12.

Chapter One

# Introduction (Part I)

## 1.1. Title and Scope of the Research

Translation of scriptures and religious texts is the most challenging yet less researched area in Translation Studies. Unlike other genres of texts, religious texts are considered as sacred as they embody the great teachings of Prophets and great religious personalities such as Jesus, Mohammad, the Buddha, Mahaveera and the like. This is why we find great anxiety attendant upon attempts at the translation of religious texts the world over. Often it is the differing understandings of texts that have led to the birth of different religious sects. Alleged violation of accepted or established modes of reading as well as approaches has often resulted in translators inviting the wrath of emperors and kings. Some of the translators or interpreters even have had to lose their lives for their supposedly transgressive readings and approaches. The goal of translation in the area of religion, thus, has always been to arrive at the 'correct' interpretation leading to an exact translation.

Religious texts regulate human life by way of providing a code of living for the members of respective religious communities. Therefore, the question 'faithful version' gains importance in the interpretative practice of religious texts. Towards that end many religions and linguistic communities have developed their own method of elucidation that provides guidelines to decipher sacred texts. Buddhism too has its own methodology of interpretation and translation.

Our aim in this dissertation is to foreground the Buddhist theory of interpretation and translation, because the discipline of translation today is mostly determined by the western theories. Some of these theories are not at all helpful in

the translation of Buddhist texts. A few western scholars have translated Buddhist texts into English and other European languages. We appreciate their interest in Buddhism and their painstaking work. However, some of these translations are not satisfactory, as the translators determine the meanings of Buddhist texts from their own cultural experience and interpretative traditions. So, there is an immediate need to envisage and bring to the fore a Buddhist method of translation that would help translators of Buddhist religious texts. In this dissertation, we have not only attempted to explain the method of translation as provided by Netti but also tried to demonstrate its application value. In this sense, this may be one of the pioneering works in the direction of understanding Buddhist texts.

Translation is conceptualised and theorised in many different ways these days. To name a few, questions of re-writing, difference, identity, gender, nation, empowerment, ethnicity, education, social equity, postcoloniality and diaspora are inquired into in the field of translation studies, thus making it a truly interdisciplinary field of research. All these endeavours are interesting and worth doing. However, we do not envisage any such projects in this dissertation. Wefeel that basic and archival research on earlier interpretive traditions also need to be carried out along with the current 'trend' in translation studies. This is very crucial in the Asian context because our conception of language, interpretation, translation, literature, aesthetics etc. are very different from that of the West. There is a need to retrieve these traditions critically and productively. Such an enterprise would certainly enrich the field of translation studies. Therefore, we stick to the elaboration of the Buddhist method of interpretation and translation in our theoretical inquiry.

Titled, 'Problems of Translating Buddhist Texts in Pali, with special reference to *Therigāthā*,' the study intends to scrutinize the questions, which are

mentioned above in the light of the Buddha's teachings. It analyses the problems that occur in the procedure of translating Buddhist teachings especially keeping in mind the reader, who represents a non- Buddhist English community. The proposition here is made concerning the non- acquaintance of the reader with the Tipiṭaka, the Theravāda Buddhist canonical texts, which record the Buddha's teachings in the language of Pali.

The term '*tipiṭaka*' is to be understood in the tradition of Theravāda Buddhism. The prefix '*ti*' in Tipiṭaka denotes 'three' and the term '*piṭaka*' stands for 'divisions' or 'sections.' Tipiṭaka means 'three main sections' or the 'baskets' of Sutta or 'threads,' Vinaya or 'the code of conduct' and Abhidhamma or 'the higher doctrine.' [2]

Theravāda' sect in Buddhism is claimed as the 'tradition of the elders' and the earliest. Their canon or the Pali Tipiṭaka is also considered as 'the authoritative texts.'[3]

> i) 'The 'theravāda' however refers to that school of Buddhism, which supposedly" adheres to the most original and purest form of the Buddhist teachings," advocated by those *therās* who obtained the erudition directly through the Master.'[4]

---

[2] T.W.Rhys Davids and William Stede, eds. PED. (1905, London: Oxford; New Delhi: Asian Educational Services, 2004) 457.

[3] Frank K Reynolds and Charls Hallisey, 'Buddhism: An Overview,' The Encyclopaedia of Religion, ed. Mircea Eliade, Vol. 2 (New York: Macmillan Publishing Company; London: Collier Macmillan company, 1987) 340.

[4] C.B. Varma, ed. Dictionary of ABhidhammic Terms. (Ranchi: Sineru International Publications) 6.

'The literary, linguistic, ideological, sociological and historical evidence still points to the high antiquity and authenticity of the Pali canon,'[5]

The dialect, in which the Buddha announced his doctrine in 528 BC,[6] is presently known as Pali.[7] It is a Middle Indo-Aryan language, which originated in Northern India.[8] The dialect seems closely related to Indo-Aryan Vedic and Sanskrit dialects but has not obviously originated from either of these and is certainly older than Sanskrit.[9] The Buddha accepted the regional language as his medium, which was used by the natives of the Magadha region, where he lived. Thus, it was also called Māgadhi.

> 'Further they used the *bhāsā* Māgadhika or the *mūla bhāsā* (the original language) to record the original text or the *pariyāya* (the text of the canons). The term *pariyāya* however, when abbreviated, became *Pāri* or Pāli; and in course of time was applied to denote the language of the entire gamut of the canons; and the exegeses and other compositions on those texts having the same language.'[10]

Thus, the Pali language was consecrated as the instrument, as it is called the 'Buddha's words' by the tradition. [11]

---

[5] K.N. Jayatillake, EBT, (1963, Delhi: MB,1980)10.
[6] K.N. Jayatillake, The Message of the Buddha, ed. Ninian Smart (Sri Lanka: BPS, 2000) 17.
[7] Kate, Crosby, The Origin of Pāli as a language Name in Medival Theravada Literature, Journal of Buddhist Studies, (Sri Lanka: Centre for Buddhist Studies, 2004) Vol. 2. 101.
[8] 'Buddhism,'The New Encyclopaedia Britannica, Vol. 2 (2007) 603.
[9] 'Buddhism,' The New Encyclopaedia Britannica, 695; Wilhelm Geiger, Pali Literature and Language, trans. T. Ghosh. (1943, Culcutta: Culcutta University Press; New Delhi:Munshiram Manoharlal Publishers Pvt. Ltd, 1978)1.
[10] Varma, 6.
[11] G.P. Malalasekera. The Pāli Literature in Ceylon, (1923, Sri Lanka: BPS, 1994) 1.

Some significant factors of the translation history in India and Sri Lanka (earlier known as Ceylon) can be identified in the light of translating the Pali Tipiṭaka. It is said that the Greek to Latin translations (270-200 BC) are admired as the earliest literal translations that survive today in the world.[12] Those Greek original texts are identified as the texts, which remained relatively accessible to the (Greek) reader for a long time.[13]

The antiquity of the Buddhist Tipiṭaka and their translations must be recognised in this context. The traverse of the Buddhist teachings across continents and across centuries (to reach the contemporary era) was a parallel movement with the Greek translations. The teachings, which originated from central India in the 6th century BC, spread to many regions during the life span of the Buddha (approximately 528-488 BC).[14]

The second major event of translation was the Buddhist missionary work started by Emperor Asoka (270-232BC) about 250 BC onwards[15] as a part of his mission of 'Sacred Majesty' (*dhamma vijaya*). The thirteenth Edict of Asoka describes how he succeeded in sending the message of the Buddhist teachings to Egypt, Syria, Macedonia, Epirus, Kyrene, South India and Ceylon.[16] The countries received the doctrine through groups of well trained Indian Buddhist monks[17] and the Buddhist teachings were obviously translated into the native languages of the respective countries.

---

[12] Douglas Robinson, 'Literary Translation,' RETS, ed. Mona Baker, (London & New York: Routledge,1998) 125.
[13] Mona Baker, Introduction, RETS, xvi
[14] 483 BC: (Ñāṇamoli, xii), (Varma,1).
[15] Ramesh Krishnamurthi, 'Indian Tradition,' RETS, 466.
[16] Malalasekere, Pāli Literature, 22.
[17] Malalasekere, Pāli Literature, 37.

In Sri Lanka, the texts were in oral tradition translated from Pali to 'the language of the land' (*dīipa bhāsā*),[18] where the mission had been remarkably successful since 252 BC. Those Pali canonical texts were well-formed long before, as early as the second council held in the 4th century BC. It was approximately one hundred years after the demise of the Buddha. Thus, they could be regarded as the earliest accounts subjected to translation, which are duly accessible to the world today.

History assumes that 'translation had come to be thought of as definitively literal by the mid-first century BC, when Cicero first theorised translation for the education of the orator.'[19] The Sinhalese translations made out of Tipiṭaka, called *Sihaḷaṭṭhakathā* or *Heḷaṭuvā* in Sri Lanka since the 3rd century BC contributes to the matter remarkably. Some of them were indeed literal translations though they do not exist.[20] The important task now is that of theorising the subject matter of translation and its period. According to the Buddhist records, the method of translation including the literal style, commenced and got established in India from the 6th century BC onwards, in India[21] thus taking the history of translation back to centuries before Cicero's work.

However, India lost the Buddhist tradition completely by the 4th century AD and re-established it only in the 5th century AD by receiving the entire set of

---

[18] Malalasekera, Pāli Literature, 72.

[19] Robinson, 'Literary Translation,' 125.

[20] Walpola Rahula, History of Buddhism in Ceylon: The Anuradhapura Period, 3rd century BC- 10th Century AC, (1956, Colombo: M.D. Gunasena & Co. Ltd, 1966) xxv.

[21] There were two types of experts in language according to Digha Nikāya: experts in words (*padako*); experts in grammar (*veiyakarano*). However, it seems that the Buddhist tradition appreciated and accepted the latter. For instance, only one mode (10-Mode of Synonyms) allows using a single word for conveying meaning in *Netti,* but encouraging adding more than one synonym. Besides, in its four-fold classification of persons on their skills in understanding, Aṅguttara Nikāya (posits 'padaparama' as the fourth and the lowest category, that is: 'One whose highest attainment is the word of the text, not the sense' (PED, 408). The category is not included in Netti among appropriate listener to understand the teachings. (See D. Vol. 1. 88) and (A. Vol. 2. 135).

Pali Tipiṭaka from Sri Lanka. Approximately, after twelve centuries from the event, again India and Sri Lanka, where the texts were preserved, were subjected to colonization in the 16th century AD.[22] Ever since, the Pali canonical texts were exposed to the Western readers and yet again 'translation became an important part of transmitting the Buddha's teachings.'[23] Nevertheless, the inadequacies of the methods used by most of the colonial and postcolonial translators made the teachings complicated. A cautious approach is therefore needed at this point to identify the methods, which early Buddhism adopted in translating Buddhist texts.

## 1.2 Aims and Objectives

Religious teachings foreground certain factors that are established in the community. Formal, informal and non-formal educational systems assist the person to acquire the essence of the religion. In Sri Lanka, for instance, the atmosphere at home, school and the society is conducive to grasp Buddhist teachings from one's childhood onwards. Sinhalese literature and culture reflect Buddhist teachings intuitively. It builds an understanding, which could develop cognition and spirituality. Such opportunities are obviously absent in a non-Buddhist community. A non-Buddhist reader, who is alien to the religious and cultural ethos of Buddhism, would not be capable enough to obtain the same through mere learning.

---

[22]The Portuguese entered into Sri Lanka in1505 and The British East India Company, which turned into exercise political power established in India in 1600. Krishnamurthi, 'Indian Tradition,' RETS, 470.

[23] Krishnamurthi, 'Indian Tradition,' RETS, 466.

The translator is therefore obliged to enlighten the readers, who belong to other communities. Therefore, translations of the Buddhist canonical works must be very clear in meaning, which the source text intends to convey. In contrast, translators engaged in continuing experiments on various methods individually, are neglecting and/or are not being associated with the available method in the Buddhist system. Appreciation of the utility of a canonical discourse is a pre-requisite for starting the process of translation. Translators in the current field of translation have hardly understood the importance of the Buddha's teachings in this light.

Quite often, the intended meaning and the instructional tenor of the ST (source text) is lost in many of the recent translations, as they have followed their own methods, which often fail to decipher the meaning of the source text.

In the first phase, the attention paid on the field of translating Buddhist canonical texts in Pali is surprisingly less. The conference held on Buddhist Hermeneutics in California in 1984 clearly underlines the insufficiency of the extant researches in the field, which made the first attempt of its kind to date. It was a collaborative project, which discussed the Buddhist translations with the different Buddhist schools worldwide. Scholars from various ancient Buddhist schools had contributed their perspectives on the theme. However, a relatively lesser discussion had taken place on the texts of Theravāda Buddhist tradition than the Mahayanists.[24] The field of literary translations has also expended much effort to discuss Sanskrit Buddhist texts while the Pali texts have been less explored. [25]

---

[24] Scholars from India, China, Southeast Asia, Korea, Tibet and Japan attended the conference. http://www.jstor.org/about/terms.html.

[25] Raymond S.C. Lie, 'Buddhist Sacred Texts in English Translation,' Encyclopaedia of Literary Translation into English, ed. Olive Classe, Vol. 1 (London & Chicago: Fitzroy Dearborn Publishers, 2000) 190-192.

Hence, problems that normally occur in the process of English translations are spelt out in three segments in the light of the perusal of the works of the translators:

i) The English translators are hardly concerned with the degree of comprehensive skills of the reader regarding the Buddhist doctrine
ii) The mainstream English translators have largely neglected the main purpose of the Buddhist canonical texts
iii) The English translators are not acquainted with the ancient Buddhist methodology, which clarifies the purpose and the method of interpretation and translation

The translation becomes devalued when the intention demanded by the Buddhist system is absent. Therefore, the following factors must be actively incorporated in the process of construing Buddhist teachings to produce a worthy translation.

i) Realising the main purpose of a Buddhist canonical text
ii) Being well-acquainted with the particular methodology
iii) Adopting the methodology for current translations on Buddhist canonical texts

This study analyses the problems that occur in the procedure of translating Buddhist teachings especially for the reader, who represents a non- Buddhist English community. The proposition made here is the non- acquaintance of the reader with the Pali Tipiṭaka, the Theravāda Buddhist canonical texts. The translator, who translates the text into English, must be acquainted with the

particular methodology before venturing to translate a Buddhist canonical text. The study will therefore be an attempt:

i) At discussing the defects arising out of ignorance of the purpose of a Buddhist canonical text
ii) At asserting the results of the non-existence of a common systematic method
iii) At introducing the efficacy of a method to the translator with a demonstration of it on a sample text

Accordingly, the study will attempt to minimize certain problems that occur in the process of translation and may guide translators - and interpreters - in producing Buddhist canonical translations, which emphasise the intended message of the Buddha within the context of Theravada Buddhist system.

The ensuing chapters of this thesis are devoted to an elaboration and explication of the factors mentioned above.

## 1.3 Methodology

### 1.3.1 Criteria for Selection Texts

#### 1.3.1.1 Primary texts

Peṭakopadesa, the other text, claimed to embody the methodological value, has not been selected for the study.[26] The method is not systematic though the authorship is traditionally attributed to the Mahakaccāyana. For many scholars,

[26] George D. Bond, 'Peṭakopadesa: Summary,' Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies, Vol.7 (1996, Delhi: MB, 2006) 381.

Peṭakopadesa was written after compiling *Netti*.[27] For some, it belongs to an early period.[28] However, being distinct from *Netti*, the eight chapters of the text do not follow a proper arrangement. It has unclear terminals of chapters though it was introduced as a shadow of *Netti*.[29] The printed versions of *Peṭakopadesa* teem with the errors contained in the manuscripts.[30] In brief,

> "The *Netti* is economical, neat and not uningenious in the marshalling of its complex exemplifying subject-matter, never redundant though sometimes elliptic, careful to avoid tangled discussions, and successful in differentiating the individualities of the 16 Modes. The *Pe* (*Peṭakopadesa*) on the other hand is sometimes redundant, does not always subordinate well the exemplifying matter to the elements, fails to exploit the 16 Modes fully and so has to multiply its chapters, sometimes rambles into distracting and incomplete combinations,…"[31]

*Netti* is systematic and complete and hence is cited and scrutinised in the research. The *Netti,*

i) Directs the translator/interpreter to select the target reader and make them aware of the very purpose of Buddhist teachings
ii) Guides how to provide descriptions without deviating from the purpose of Buddhist teachings
iii) Is applicable to the whole set of the Buddhist canonical texts

---

[27] A. Barua, ed. Petavatthu (London: PTS1949) iii., See for details: Ñāṇamoli, xiii,
[28] Ñāṇamoli, xxviii.
[29] George, D. Bond, 'The Netti-Pakarṇa: A Theravāda Method of Interpretation' Buddhist Studies: in honour of Walpola Rahula, eds. Somarathna Balasuriya, Richard Gombrich, Andre Bareau, Siri Gunasinghe, Udaya Mallavarachchi, Edmund Perry, (London: Gordon Fraser,1980), p.16
[30] Ñāṇamoli, xiv-xxvi.
[31] Ñāṇamoli, xxiii.

Unlike the methodological text, any canonical text would be appropriate as a sample that belongs to the 'Nine-fold Divisions of Dispensation.' of the Pali Tipiṭaka to demonstrate the method. However, happiness, which Buddhism highlights as Nibbāna – opposite to misery, caused by unhappiness - is one of the most challenged concepts. Western scholars and theologists since the beginning of the nineteenth century were not interested in including the Buddhist doctrine among the paths to happiness, as it was constructed upon the law of dependent origination. Buddhist philosophy was dubbed Pessimism whereas it identified reality with the sufferings of beings.[32] There cannot be much difference in changing this opinion even today.

The *Netti* has selected a verse from the division *Udāna*, the Joyous utterances – from the Nine-fold Divisions of Dispensation - to demonstrate its methodology.[33] Apart from that, the best examples for elucidation of the concept of happiness in the Buddhist canonical literature are *Theragāthā* and the *Therigāthā*, collections of verses attributed to the *Arahant* monks and the *Arahant* nuns respectively. They are among the finest sources to know the final state of the mind of those monks and nuns, who reached the purest mental state through relinquishment. They themselves express their utmost joy after realizing Nibbāna, the Joyous utterances as a fruit of their noble lives.

An interest in describing how women could reach the highest goal of Nibbāna certainly inspired to narrow down the scope to *Therigāthā* (*Thig*) as the sample. The content of the text has much relevance to the aims of the research, because the text is a clear and inspiring combination of the three factors of the Buddhist doctrine: the reasons for misery or suffering, techniques to eliminate suffering, and the mental state one perceives after the cessation of suffering.

---

[32] H.Oldenberg, Buddha: his life, his doctrine, his order, (1882, London: Calcutta, 1927) 212
[33] Ñāṇamoli, 119.

Along with the original Pali texts of *Netti* and *Thig*, their English and Sinhalese translations will also be selected as primary sources. Selection of such translations will be governed by the criteria or standards of authenticity and not their antiquity or popularity. *The Guide* is the only available English translation of *Netti* done by Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli published by PTS, in 1962. The summary of *Netti* produced by George D. Bond for the sixth volume of Encyclopaedia of Indian Philosophies in 1996 is selected for comparison.

*The Psalms of Sisters* by C.A.F. Rhys Davids and *Elders Verses II* by K.R. Norman, recognised by the PTS, London as Standard English translations of *Thig* would be selected for the discussion. Apart from that, the Sinhala translations of *Netti*, published by the Tipiṭaka Trust, Government of Ceylon are also considered.

### 1.3.1.2 Secondary Sources

Pali canonical works will be referred as supportive sources for the research excluding Pali commentaries as they stand for an individual literary tradition. The texts named *Paramatthadīpani*, the commentaries of *Netti* and *Thig* composed by Dhammapāla in the 6$^{th}$ AD, will not be taken into consideration.

Selecting secondary sources will also be governed by the same criteria of standard and trustworthy nature of the works and not based on antiquity or popularity. Further, authentic texts brought out by authorised publishers are preferred for references.

## 1.3.2 Clarifying Key-words

Three fundamental terms will be clarified further as each has a significant meaning within the system of Theravāda Buddhism.

### 1.3.2.1 The Purpose

Many theoretical approaches on 'purpose' and the 'intended meaning' are viewed particularly concerning the translated text (TT) rather than the ST source text (ST) in the field of current translation studies.[34] Nida's view on 'the purpose or purposes of the author and by proxy, of the translator' is one of the three basic factors he points out as differences in translating.[35] The content of the ST in this account plays an important role. Reiss discusses the purpose or intention of the ST under functional equivalences and emphasises that 'if the SL text is written to convey contents, these contents should also be conveyed in the TL text' and 'what is conveyed implicitly in the SL text should be explicated in the TL and vice versa.'[36]

However, the idea that finally linked with 'preserving originals,' has been criticised thoroughly and those 'misunderstandings and misconceptions' that might occur in the TT are suggested to be accepted as a fact of literature – or even life. Further, an argument is that:

> 'How many lives, after all, have been deeply affected by translations of the Bible and the Capital?'[37]

---

[34] For instance, the Skopos theory mainly deals with 'the purpose of the translated text' and 'the intended reader,' largely constrained by the target text user and his/her situation and cultural background. Christina Schaffner, 'Skopos Theory,' RETS, 236.

[35] The other two factors are 'the nature of the message' and 'the type of audience. See for details, Eugine Nida, 'Principles of Correspondence,' TSR, ed. Lawrence Venuti (2000, London & New York: Routledge, 2003) 127.

[36] Katharina Reiss, 'Decision Making in Translation,' TSR, 167.

[37] Andre Lefevere, 'Mother Courage's Cucumbers,' TSR. 235.

This opinion would be appropriate regarding literary works such as fiction, poetry, drama etc., which are focused on secular needs but not for religious scriptures that aim at the well-being of humanity. Some religious systems have strictly avoided the chances of being exposed to the threat of losing their original purpose. For instance, unlike the Bible and the Tipiṭaka, 'the Koran has never supported a serious translation movement anywhere in the world, because of the belief in its untranslatability!'[38]

In this context, priority has been given to the purpose of the ST, as it is pregnant with an instructional tenor. Purpose (*adhippāya*) of the Buddhist teachings is duly defined as conveying 'true dhamma,' the 'righteousness.'[39] This term has been elaborated in many ways in Tipiṭaka as well as in *Netti* further in terms of 'being self-controlled by following a right path.'[40] The Buddhist doctrine is inexorable with its practical requirement as a conduct of life.

The theme of the teachings is for the 'good and happiness of many, out of compassion for the world and for the welfare of gods and men.'[41] The *Ariyapariyesana Sutta* explains how the Buddhist mission started to set up the Rules of Righteousness *(dhamma cakkaṃ pavattetuṃ).*[42] Practicing Eight-fold āryan path by avoiding the two extremes of luxurious as well as the self-tormented ways of living are deemed identical principles since the first sermon of the Buddha.[43] Nibbāna, the achievement of the practice is termed as 'peaceful,

---

[38] Mona Baker, Introduction, RETS. xvi.
[39] Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli., trans. The Guide: (Netti-ppakaraṇaṃ), (London: PTS, 1962) 56.
[40] Faculty restraint and path: (Ñāṇamoli, 56, 55-57).
[41] Mahāvaggapāli. Vol. 1. (Sri Lanka: SHB) 112.
[42] Ariyapariyesana Sutta, M, Vol. 1. (London: PTS) 160-75.
[43] Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta, S. V. 5. (London: PTS) 420 ff.

excellent, stilling all *saṇkhāra* or volitional activities, relinquishment of all assets, destruction of craving, detachment, cessation, and extinction.[44]

There are four groups of human beings in the world, who will be benefited by the tenets of the doctrine. They are monks (*bhikku*), nuns (*bhikkhunī*), laymen disciples (*upāsaka*), and the laywomen disciples (*upāsikā*). The division is based on only biological differences. The men and women who entered the Buddhist order are called *bhikku* and *bhikkunī* while laymen and laywomen who are engaged in worldly activities while following the religious path are called *upāsaka* and *upāsikā* respectively.

Another criterion is used according to the spiritual attainment of humans. A monk, a nun, a layman or a lay-woman who has encountered the doctrine for the first time is called Stream-enterer (*sotāpanna*). He eradicates three Fetters (*saṃyojana*) namely false-view, inducement-by-mere rites and rituals, and doubt.[45] The one who weakens two other fetters namely sensual passion and aversion is called Once-returner (*sakadāgāmi*) as he can be born once more.[46] The one who has destroyed the two fetters namely sensual pleasure and aversion is a Never-returner (*anāgāmi*) as he is never reborn in this world.[47] The one who has destroyed all the ten fetters is called *Arahanta*.[48]

The men, women, monks and the nuns who could not reach the state of Stream-enterer are ordinary mortals (*putujjanā*).[49] This division does not reflect differences engendered by time and space such as gender, language, and geography. However, those ordinary people are considered mentally ill, as they

---

[44] *etaṃ santaṃ etaṃ paṇītaṃ yadidaṃ sabbasaṅkhārasamatho sabbupadhipatinissaggo taṇhakkhayo virāgo nirodho nibbānaṃ*: Mahāmāluṅkya Sutta, M. Vol.1. 436

[45] (Ñāṇamoli, 307), (Varma,156).

[46] (Ñāṇamoli, 304), (Varma, 148).

[47] (Varma, 18); non-returener (Ñāṇamoli, 289).

[48] (Varma, 23); arahantaship (Ñāṇamoli, 291).

[49] (Varma, 156); ordinary men (Ñāṇamoli, 300).

are blind to see the Noble Truths due to the attachment to the conditional world. Their mind is like an open sore as opposed to the ones, who have reached the Stream entry.[50] The tears shed by human beings in their innumerable rounds of rebirth (*saṃsāra*) due to the pain, misery or discontent (*dukkha*)[51] is greater in quantity than the waters of the four oceans.[52]

Thus, Nibbāna is the solution, and the supreme bliss (*nibbāaṃ paramaṃ sukhaṃ*), according to the Buddhist view. One can experience it in this very life. Human beings can attain Nibbāna by following the doctrine in three steps: 'listening,' 'comprehending' and 'pursuing' (*sunātha dhāretha carātha dhamme*). Thus, it is important to understand the instructions and techniques that aim at one's inner transformation. Once this core message is lost on the reader, the purpose of the translated text too will become fruitless. The audience were not encouraged on doing evaluations or engaging in baseless arguments regarding the doctrine and such attempts were rejected completely.[53] Criteria resembling literary excellence and aesthetic appeals, linguistic and gender perspectives etc. will therefore be inappropriate or out of place in searching the purpose of the Buddhist teachings.

The Buddhist doctrine must be enunciated as a code of conduct for life, which leads people to attain happiness and peace. Hence, one of the translator's wish that 'may this translation help to bring an inner transformation by an awakening to the true values of life' is vital in this context. [54]

---

[50] Aruka sutta, A. Vol. 1, (London: PTS) 123f.
[51] Suffering, pain, un-pleasure: (Ñāṇamoli, PEG. 51); suffering, misery (Varma, 168, 68).
[52] Assu sutta, SN, Vol, 2. (London: PTS)179-80.
[53] Questions like 'does the *Thatāgathā* exist, or 'did the *Thatāgathā*' exist, or 'will *Thatāgathā* be exist' and so on. Bhikkhu Ñāṇananda, Concept and Reality in Early Buddhist Thought, (1978, Sri Lanka: BPS, 1997) 17-18.
[54] Bhikkhu Katukurunde Ñāṇananda, is a versatile Sri Lankan scholar in Pali and Buddhist Studies translates Buddhist canonical texts into English. He has highlighted this idea in each

### 1.3.2.2 Buddhist Methodology

Many contemporary scholars, translators and interpreters have hardly paid their attention to *Netti* as a legitimate method while dealing with the Buddhist canonical texts. It may be due to:

i) Not recognising the method in *Netti* and its efficacy caused by a misidentification

ii) Applying numerous methods for interpreting and translating texts

According to the oldest available chronicles of Sri Lanka, *Dīpavaṃsa* (4th century AD), the Pali commentaries of Buddhaghosa (5th century AD) and *Mahāvaṃsa* (8th century AD) confirm the fact that the Tipiṭaka was brought to the country in the third century BC by Arahat Mahinda, the son of Indian emperor Asoka. It also says that Mahinda carried *aṭṭhakathā* as well.[55] *Mahāvaṃsa* further explains how Mahinda had learned all the Tipiṭaka along with their 'commentaries' from his teacher, Moggaliputtatissa before reaching Sri Lanka.

The key word in those verses is *aṭṭhakathā* and/or *sāṭṭhakathā*. Modern scholars translated the word correctly as 'along with the commentary.'[56] Nevertheless, they interpreted it mistakenly in two ways:

i) *Aṭṭhakathā* as a separate set of commentaries, composed in India at the first council[57]

---

canonical and non-canonical translation that he completed. For his translations: http://www.beyondthenet.net

[55] Aṭṭhakathā,' Encyclopaedia of Buddhism, ed. G.P. Malalasekera, Vol.1. (Ceylon: Government of Ceylon, 1961) 335.

[56] Malalasekera, Pāli Literature, 90-91.

ii) *Aṭṭhakathā* as 'exegetical styles' which are included in the Tipiṭaka

Interpreting the term *aṭṭhakathā* only as a 'commentary'[58] in each context is one of the major reasons for not recognising the method its validity and antiquity. The interpretation confused many scholars in the East and the West. Some argued 'how the whole Tipiṭaka and their commentaries were kept in the memory of only four monks.'[59] It caused to underestimate the exclusive technique of recollection used by Indian religious masters to carry vast literatures throughout the history. Besides, separate commentaries expand the volume and the idea is against the codification of oral traditions, which prefer the minimum content and length.

*Aṭṭhakathā*, has another set of meanings that stands for 'exposition of the sense,' and 'explanation.'[60] It would be more meaningful if the second set of meanings were considered because the idea certainly tallies with the adjective clause, *atthappakāsanatthaṃ* which literary means 'with the intention of conveying meaning.' Therein, the contextual meaning would be the 'ways of expositions' or else 'the methodology.' In fact, the significance of the method, which is initiated for preserving the doctrine, is almost akin to Buddhist teachings. It is difficult to believe that the *Arahantas* and Emperor Asoka would deny sending the methodology to the host countries since they were much alien to both the teachings and their method. Besides, no reference could be found in the Tipiṭaka regarding *aṭṭhakathā*.

---

[57] Malalasekera, Pāli Literature, 335.
[58] Rahula, xxv.
[59] Richard F Gombrich, Theravāda Buddhism, (1988, London & New York: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd., 2002) 153.
[60] (PED, 24); *aṭṭhakathā*: (Encyclopaedia of Buddhism, 335).

The second assumption that views the Tipiṭaka texts as their own commentaries also is not correct.

> i) The earliest beginnings of exegetical literature can be traced to the canon itself. They are in the nature of answers to questions. There are numerous instances in the *nikāyas* where the Buddha (and in his absence his leading disciples) are approached for clarification of various doctrinal points. The result is a detailed exposition of the point raised. Examples of such expositions by the Buddha are to be found in the *Mahākammavibhaṅga sutta, Koṭṭika sutta, Sīvaka sutta, Aggivacchagotta sutta* and *Sallekha sutta*."[61]
>
> ii) The development of the exegetical activity can best be traced in the Vinaya piṭaka. First, there were the rules or laws, the *Pātimokkha* which had to be observed by the *bhikkhus* and *bhikkhunīs*. The *Sutta-vibhaṅga* not only is a verbal commentary of the text of each rule given, but also an account of the incident, which led to its promulgation. A still further development is seen in the *Mahāvagga* and *Chullavagga*, where much more than a series of offences is found. Passages of commentarial nature and fragments of commentaries can also be traced throughout the *nikāyas*." [62]

The various exegetical styles, included in the Tipiṭaka can be identified not only in the improvements of previous methods, but also in the individual applications of the very method, initiated by the system. In spite of all, if the commentaries were already included in the Tipiṭaka, it would not be necessary to refer the Tipiṭaka

---

[61] Aṭṭhakathā, Encyclopaedia of Buddhism.336.
[62] Aṭṭhakathā, Encyclopaedia of Buddhism.336-7.

attributing two different terms: Tipiṭaka and *aṭṭhakathā*.[63] This second assumption diverted the attention from finding the authentic and legitimate method of interpretation.

The question as to which methodology the system has accepted is yet to be clarified in this context. Evidently, the method, employed at the time of the Buddha is identical with the one included now in *Nettippakaraṇa* (*Netti*). The work is already characterised as 'a Theravāda Method of Interpretation.'[64] The Buddha firmly addressed the problem of interpreting and translating the doctrine as discussed in the previous section. Mahākaccāyana was the most skilled in the interpretation, especially of the teachings that were cryptic and difficult for others to understand. He was able to explain the full meaning of the Buddha's teachings in brief. The Buddha, saying he himself would have explained meanings as Kaccāyana the Great did it, complimented his skill.[65] The last verse of the *Netti* states that the text composed and presented by Mahākaccāyana, was accepted as such by the Buddha.[66] The Mandalay manuscript as well proves Mahākaccāyana's authorship of *Nettippakaraṇa*.[67] Further, the text claimed that its method was chanted and approved by the first council (*mūlasaṅgīitiyam saṅgitāti*).[68] This reference is not conflicting with the verses of *Dipavaṃsa* and the Pali translations or the commentaries of Buddhaghosa that the First and the following two councils endorsed the *aṭṭhakathā.*

---

[63] *Piṭakattaya pāliñca tassa aṭṭhakathāpi ca.*' Dpv. Ed. Trans. P. Ñāṇānanda, (Panadura, Sri Lanka: Star Press, 1927) cp. XX, 20-21.

[64] Bond, 'Theravāda Method,'16.

[65] Madhupiṇḍika Sutta, MN. Vol, 1. (London: PTS) 108.

[66] '*Netti yā āyasmatā Mahākaccāyanena bhāsitā bhgavatā anumoditā mūlasaṅgīitiyaṃ saṅgīitāti,*' Nettippakaraṇa. trans. ed. Labugama Lankananda Mahanayaka Thero (1980, Colombo: The Democratic Socialist Republic of Sri Lanka, 2005) 288.

[67] K.L. Hazra, Pāli Language and Literature: A Systematic Survey and Historical Study. New Delhi: D.K. Print World, 1994) 463.

[68] Ñāṇamoli, xiii.

*Aaṭṭhakathā* in this context therefore is neither a bulk of commentaries nor a collection of exegetical features in the Tipiṭaka, but separately constructed methods, which were appended to it. Mahinda introduced this method, the same as seen in *Netti* to Sri Lanka, along with the Tipiṭaka as the sources mentioned. Some scholars believe that the *Netti* is a later work than the Tipiṭaka, which was brought from India to Sri Lanka. However, they agree with the idea that 'the third century BC could be the earliest possible date when this transmission took place.'[69] Eventually this period coincides with Mahinda's arrival to the island.

Sri Lankan tradition has treated the treatise as an individual work, admiring its methodological value.

> 'None of the lists of Tipiṭaka books given in Achariya Buddhaghosa's works mention either book, *Nettippakaraṇa* or *Peṭakopadesa* and in Ceylon the two – like the Miḷindapañha - have remained outside the Tipiṭaka.[70]

These texts continue to be accepted as having the same level of authority, which the Tipiṭaka enjoys. The antiquity and the authenticity of the texts have been acknowledged by the Burmese Theravāda Tradition that includes *Netti* and Petakopadesa among the texts of Tipiṭaka believing them to be 'the words of the Buddha.'[71]

Therefore, the method in *Netti*, which was formulated to guide the interpreter and the translator in adopting techniques is considered here as the Buddhist methodology.

---

[69] The lowest margin of the time would be 4th AD as Buddhaghosa quotes Netti in his work, Visuddgimagga in the 5th century AD: see Ñāṇamoli, xiii.
[70] Ñāṇamoli, xii.
[71] Ñāṇamoli, xii.

## 1.3.2.3 Interpretation and Translation

Interpretation, the activity, which stands for 'clarification, explaining and/or perceiving the significance of meaning'[72] is conceived in traditional reading practice that is actively employed in religious and academic disciplines in countries like India and Greece for centuries. Not many attempts have emerged in contemporary studies to re-define the process as 'interpreting while translating.'[73] Religious texts are 'rather different from other text-types due to their unique, sacrosanct nature' and interpretation is admired as a method for 'translating sacred Buddhist texts.'[74]

According to the classification of Jakobson's, 'interpretation of verbal signs by means of other signs of the same language' is called Intralingual.[75] Nevertheless, Intralingual interpretation demands a proper evaluation.

> 'Intralingual translation is not such a minor issue as the existing literature on translation might suggest. Intralingual translation figures far more prominently in the Greek tradition than interlingual translation: ….We do have classifications such as Jakobson's, which alert us to the possibility of such things as intersemiotic and intralingual translation, but we do not make any genuine use of such classifications in our research.'[76]

---

[72] Reader's Digest Universal Dictionary, Ed. David Crystal (London: Reader's Digest, 1987) 803.
[73] C.T. Indra, 'Horizon of Expectations: Hermeneutics and Translation,' Translation, Text and Theory: The Paradigm of India, ed. Rukmini Bhaya Nair, (New Delhi: Sage Publications; London: Thousand Oaks, 2002) 153. 153-170
[74] Lie, 192.
[75] Roman Jakobson, 'On Linguistic Aspects of Translation,' TSR, 114.
[76] Mona Baker, Introduction, RETS, xvii.

According to this account, the Buddhist view on translations is akin to Jakobson's view. Since its very inception, Buddhism has been a missionary religion. In the Mahāvagga, the Buddha proclaims that:

> '.. Preach, monks, the Doctrine which is lovely in the beginning, lovely in the middle, lovely in the end, in the spirit, and in the letter; proclaim the consummate life of holiness, perfect and pure,'[77]

The Buddha was a teacher for all humankind and god (*satthā devamanussānaṃ*). His whole life was devoted to the aim of educating. Seeing that the harvest was great, but the labourers or the messengers were few, he directed that 'no two monks should take the same road.' [78] Sixty *Arahantas* were included in the first missionary group, which was sent to sixty different places, just after three months subsequent to attaining the Buddhahood. The number of the people rapidly increased, as the new religion treated human beings alike irrespective of caste and gender discriminations.[79]

The Buddhist system did not accept any language autonomy, as the 'truth' or the doctrine of the Buddha is based on utility. Truth has been delineated by the formula of the 'Four Noble Truths': the truth of misery or suffering; the truth of a reason for suffering; the truth of cessation of suffering; the path to cessation of

---

[77] Malalasekera, Pali Literature, 28.

[78] Mahāvagga, Vinya Pitaka, See. James De Alwis, The Buddhist Scriptures and Their Language, The Pali, (1861, Sri Lanka :Colombo Observer, 1862) 40.

[79] Hinduism was the main religious practice in India during the time of the establishment of Buddhism. People who belonged to lower castes and the women were not allowed to practise Vedic religion, S. Radhakrishnan and C.A. Moore, Ed. A Source Book in Indian Philosophy, (1957, Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1973) 189. [Quoted from The Laws of Manu, The Sacred Books of The East, Vol. 25, chap. 3 (Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1886) 84-85].

suffering.[80] They are the shared phenomenon that describes the fundamental principles of the universe. The epistemology, according to the Buddhist teachings is the contact between the six senses and their agreeable six sense objects.

| Senses | Sense objects |
|---|---|
| Eye | Visible objects[81] |
| Ear | Sounds |
| Nose | Smell |
| Tongue | Taste |
| Body | Touch |
| Mind | Cognizable objects[82] |

The infinite worldly substances are limited to the realm of the sense objects. However, a prolonged practice of mindfulness bestows the wisdom of realising three major qualities in sense objects: impermanence, painfulness and non-self. This basic phenomenon, which can be identified as universal, is construable irrespective of biological, geographical and language differences in humanity. Hence, dissimilarities of languages were considered as barriers to comprehend the teachings for two reasons: the universality of the doctrine; the richness of the methodology. Thus, the Buddhist mission since its commencement was entirely based on two domains:

a. Interpretation
b. Translation

There are a few terms, which refer to the meaning of interpretation in Tipiṭaka. *Mahāvagga Pāli* in Vinaya uses the term '*aṭṭhakathā,*' as interpretation.[83]

[80] Catu ariya sacca: Dukkha, Samudaya, Nirodha, Magga.
[81] Rūpa: visible objects (PED, 105); sight (Varma, 33); form (Ñāṇamoli, 302).
[82] Dhamma: cognizable objects (PED, 5), (Varma, 33).

However, this term is largely used in the post Tipiṭaka literature to convey the meanings such as of 'method of interpretations,' 'interpretation' and 'commentary.'[84] '*Vitthāra*' is another word, which denotes meaning in 'expansion' and 'in detail.'[85] '*Attha Vaṇṇnā*' is applied as a general term for 'explanation of the text as regards the meaning of words.'[86] The technique of *padavaṇṇnā* or rendering word meaning also is included in this broad category. Nevertheless, the term *Attha Saṃvaṇṇnā* especially stands for detailed explanations than the *padavaṇṇnā* since the prefix '*saṃ*' specifialy means 'better' or 'more.'[87]

*Netti* uses a general term '*pariyeṭṭhi*' for searching and testing the entire possibilities of constructing meaning (*Netti*, 2) and the term '*vitthāranā*' for 'detailing' (Ñāṇamoli, 260). There are six subordinative terms in *Netti,* employed for interpretation, considering its different contexts (Ñāṇamoli, 18).

Explaining[88] (*saṅkāsana)*

Displaying[89] (*pakāsana*)

Divulging[90] (*vivaraṇa*)

Analysing[91] (*vibhajana*)

Exhibiting[92] (*uttānikamma*)

Describing[93] by concepts (*paññatti*)

---

[83] (DOP, 74).
[84] Thesis, 29
[85] (PED, 621); mayā saṅkittena bhāsitassa vitthārena atthaṃ ajānissati (DOP, 74)
[86] (PED, 597); commentary, explanation (DOP, 75)
[87] Atthasamvannana: explanation, exigisis (PED, 24); explaining meaning (DOP, 76).
[88] Explaning, illustrating (PED, 662).
[89] Explannig, (providing) informations, making known (PED, 379).
[90] Uncovering, unfolding, revelation (PED, 627).
[91] Dividing, going into detail (PED, 629).
[92] Diclearing, expositing, manifestating (PED, 131).
[93] Describing, (PED, 390)

These principles can be regarded as various techniques of interpretations also.

Interpretation therefore, was a systematic mode that was inextricably used in the process of resolving doctrinal matters.Many discussions in the Tipiṭaka are dedicated to the subject. Accordingly, many monks and lay disciples, who required detailed explanations on what the Buddha had spoken, frequently re-approached the Buddha, a senior monk, or a senior nun for further clarifications while few of the disciples were satisfied with abridged versions. Sāriputta, Mahākoṭṭhita[94] and the nuns named Dhammadinnā[95] and Patācārā[96] were highly appreciated by the Buddha for providing correct interpretations of his teachings. Besides, the *Arahat* Mahakaccāyana, a versatile teacher, was considered as 'the most skilled for explaining various styles of communication that the Buddha adopted for the discourses.'[97]

The Buddhist method of explication had been formed on the four-fold ingenious methods:[98]

i) Fundamental characteristics[99] (*lakkhaṇa*)

ii) Basic function (*rasa*)

iii) Manifestation[100] (*paccupaṭṭhāna*)

iv) Proximate Cause (*padaṭṭhāna*) [101]

The last two characteristics respectively refer to the 'cause' and 'effect' relationship, a vital theory of the Buddha's teachings. The *Netti*, a text that

---

[94] G.P. Malalasekera, ed. The Dictionary of Pāli Proper Names, Vol.1 (1937, London: John Murray; New Delhi: Asian Educational Services, 2003) 485-486.
[95] Malalasekera, The Dictionary of Pāli Proper Names, Vol.1. 1143.
[96] Malalasekera, The Dictionary of Pāli Proper Names, Vol.1. 113.
[97] Malalasekera, The Dictionary of Pāli Proper Nouns, Vol. 2. 468-470.
[98] Jayathilleke, EBT, 295.
[99] (Varma, viii), (Ñāṇamoli, 302) ; Essential Characteristics (Jayathilleke, EBT, 295).
[100] (Varma, viii), (Ñāṇamoli, 298); antecedent condition (Jayathilleke, EBT, 295).
[101] (Varma, viii); footing (Ñāṇamoli, 302) ; Resultant condition (Jayathilleke, EBT, 295).

expresses the highest methodological features, has been construed following the same.

> "The *Nettippakaraṇa* undoubtedly places great stress on the concepts of lakkhaṇa and padaṭṭhāna, which it classifies among the 'sixteen guides (to salvation),' (soḷasa-hāra), which are its main topics of investigation, but some of the definitions do mention the concept of paccupaṭṭhāna as well."[102]

However, some interpreting strategies are suggested for translating Buddhist texts. For instance, following Steiner's notion, it is said that 'no grammar or dictionary is of much use to the translator; and only the context, in the fullest linguistic-cultural sense, certifies meaning.' [103] The method in *Netti* is reasonably deviated from this idea, thus employing both the aspects of 'Phrasing' and 'Meaning' variations.

> 'The interpretation of the phrasing element calls for ways of recognizing the unity of meaning behind the verity of phrasing. The two main categories employed in the method of interpretation to accomplish these tasks are the Guideline (*naya*) and the category (*hāra*).'[104]

The Interlingual act or 'translation proper' has been an active function in the Buddhist system. Translation is considered in brief as an 'expression in another

---

[102] Jayatilleke, EBT, 295.
[103] Lie, Encyclopaedia of Literary Translations, 192.
[104] G.D. Bond, 'Nettippakaraṇa summary,' Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies, ed. Karl H. Potter Vol. 7 (1996, Delhi: MB, 2006) 403-416.

language and a systematical retaining of the original sense.'[105] In Buddhism, monks interpreted the teachings using the same language as well as using the verbal signs of regional languages. In *Chullavagga* of *Vinaya*, a statement of the Buddha is that:

> 'I allow you, monks, to learn the word of the Buddha each in 'his own dialect' (*anujānami bhikkhave 'sakāya niruttiyā' buddhavacanam pariyāpuṇitum*)."[106]

The Pali term, '*sakāya nirutti*' denotes other languages in this context. '*Sakāya*' means 'one's own'[107] and '*nirutti*' herein stands for 'a language.'[108] Mostly the later scholars followed a definition given by Buddhaghosa[109] and wrongly interpreted the term, '*sakāya nirutti*.' The scholars like Rhys Davids, Oldenberg, Geiger and Horner have translated it as 'to learn the sacred texts in his (the Buddha's) own language.'[110] This interpretation is directly opposite to what the Buddha intended. Confirming this wrong view, Rhys Davids and Oldenberg in their introduction to the translation of Vinaya raise suspicions about 'the story of the Buddha's permission of translating'.[111]

In another event, two monks made a request to the Buddha 'not to allow monks that entered into the order from various tribes and castes, 'to corrupt the teachings by studying it in their own dialects.' However, it was firmly rejected.[112]

---

[105] Universal Dictionary, 1600.
[106] Chullavagga, Vinaya Pitaka, Vol. 2 (London: PTS) 139.
[107] Ñānananda, Concept and Reality, 46.
[108] PED, 370.
[109] Buddhaghosa interpreted the term 'to mean that the Buddha wished everyone study the dharma in Buddha's own language.'Ñānananda, Concept and Reality, 46.
[110] Ñānananda, Concept and Reality, 46-47.
[111] Ñānananda, Concept and Reality, 46-49.
[112] Ñānananda, Concept and Reality, 46-48.

Moreover, the Buddha had talked on the matter of translating his teachings in detail. In *Araṇavibhaṅga sutta*, he refers to a series of dialectical variations, which were used at that time and instructed the monks how to deal with them.

> "When it is said that 'one should not affect the dialect of the countryside it simply means that one should not deviate from recognized parlance,' in reference to 'what it is said?' And what, monks, is affectation of the dialect of the countryside and the departure from recognized parlance?
>
> In this case, monks, in different districts they use (different words for the same object):'*Pāti, Patta...Vittha...Sarāva...Dhāropa Pona...Pisilā*.'[113] Thus, as they know the word as this or that in these various districts, so does a person, obstinately clinging to it and adhering to it, explains:'this indeed is the truth, all else is falsehood.' Thus, monks, is affectation of the dialect of the countryside and departure from parlance. In this case, monks, in different districts they know *Pāti, Patta...Vittha...Sarāva...Dhāropa, Pona...Pisilā*, yet although they know the word as this or that in these various districts a person does not cling to it but explains: 'these venerable ones definitely express it thus.' Thus, monks, is non-affectation of the countryside and non-departure from recognized parlance.' [114]

The idea of clinging to one language was entirely rejected by this statement. The system had already granted permission for translating the Buddha's words and it fairly tallies with his mission of disseminating the doctrine for the

---

[113] Dialectical variations for the Pāli word 'patta' or the 'bowl.'

[114] The translation of the Pali passage quoted from Ñānānanda, Concept and Reality, 48-49.

welfare of all beings. It emphasises the idea further that 'the doctrine that the Buddha taught illumines only when it is exposed.'[115]

The talent in rendering the meaning of the teachings was highly appreciated in the Buddhist system. Mastering components of the languages such as nouns, tenses, gender, number, etc. and the proficiency of both the structures of Phrasing [116] and meaning[117] were considered skilfulness. The four highest achievements of the Arahanthhood were completely based upon excellence in language skills. [118]

Translation was not an independent act in the Buddhist system, but was invariably corporate with interpretation. Interpretation became fundamental in the process. In other words, 'translation' during that time represented both the acts: interpretation and translation. Thus, the study as well follows the same definition.

### 1.3.3 Literature Survey

Interpreters and translators of the new era have hardly adhered to the Buddhist Guidelines of *Netti*. An extensive survey has failed to unearth any complete treatise or research article on the topic. According to my knowledge, the attempts at 'the problems of translating Buddhist texts in Pāli with special reference to Therigatha' are not available. Therefore, the survey is divided into two broad divisions as:

i) The texts on the Theravada Buddhist Methods of Interpretation

ii) English translations of *Thig*

---

[115] (*thatāgathappavedito bhikkhave dhammavinayo vivato virocati, no paticchanno*): A. I. Tika Nipata. (London: PTS) 9.ff.
[116] *Byañjana*:phrasing (Ñāṇamoli, 55).
[117] *Attha*: meaning (Ñāṇamoli, 55).
[118] *Attha paṭisambhidā*: meaning in what is spoken (Jayathilleke, EBT,311); discrimination of meaning (Ñāṇamoli, 298).

There is a scarcity of texts in the first division. For instance, Theravāda Methods of Interpretation on Buddhist Scriptures, the work started by Dr. V. Nimanong in 2004, is unfortunately in progress, and hence her opinion is inaccessible.[119] An introduction of *Netti*, provided by websites, is incomplete.[120] However, a few materials have been collected on methodological aspects in the *Netti*. Some of them discuss both Theravada and Mahayana traditions while one text discusses only Mahayana texts. The latter is chosen owing to the efforts it displays at bringing Buddhist canonical texts into the field of modern translation studies.

A Roman script edition of *Netti* was introduced to the western scholars first by E. Hardy in 1902.[121] The English translation, *The Guide (Nettippakaraṇam)*, done by Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli, a distinguished scholar in Pali and Buddhist Studies, was published in 1962. It is a significant event in the field of Interpretation and Translation According to the Buddhist methods because the preface of the translation remarkably discusses the value of the text. The translator claims that the text 'seeks to exercise the ideas so discovered while at the same time preserving them intact and preventing their changes and loss.'[122] Introduction is dedicated to the sub-titles on the functional features, practical use, and how the Pali commentaries are indebted to the method. The author invites scholars to undertake research exploring the relationship with the text and Indian methods of exegesis.

In his article titled *Buddhist Hermeneutics* (1978) Robert A.F. Thurman discusses how the Buddha himself and the other teachers like Nagarjuna, Asanga, Chih I, Chandrakirthi, Fa Tsang, Santarakshita, and Tsong Khapa propagated

---

[119] See: http://www: the buddhadharma.com/issues/2009/panel.html
[120] http://en.wikiped.ia.org/wiki/Paracanonical_texts_
[121] E. Hardy, Ed. Nettippakarana, (London: PTS, 1902).
[122] Ñāṇamoli, viii.

Buddhist teachings in India, China, Tibet and Japan for two and a half millennia.[123] He exemplifies the engagement of the four principles of Reliance (*catumahāpadesa*) on the scriptures, as a profound method. His observation that there is a total absence of a detailed analysis on the texts of Hinayāna tradition in Sri Lanka and Burma, where the traditions flourished, is notable. However, he does not include Mahākacchāyana among the teachers or the *Netti* as a method, which provides paradigms and demonstrations to embody the four principles of Reliance.

George D. Bond, who published a significant article titled '*The Nature and Meaning of the Netti-Pakaraṇa*' in 1979, has made a careful analysis of the methodological value and surveyed the linguistic and meaning aspects of the text. In 1980, he introduced the text as the Theravāda Method of Interpretation with his article '*The Netti-Pakaraṇa: A Theravada method of Interpretation*.' This is a further elaboration of his arguments set forth in his earlier article. For him, *Nettippakaraṇa* shows the clear path to Nibbāṇa uniting the diverse theories in the canon. The methodology is designed for understanding the essence of the passages of the doctrine. He clearly points out how the method represents the Theravāda tradition by its function while fulfilling the need of preserving the orthodoxy in Buddhism.

Bond's paper titled '*The Gradual Path as a Hermeneutic Approach to the Dhamma in the Nettippakaraṇa and in the Peṭakopadesa*' represents the Theravada tradition in the conference held on Buddhist Hermeneutics in California in 1984. It contains a comparison between the two texts and the analysis on *Netti* is similar to

[123] Robert, A.F. Thurman, 'Buddhist Hermeneutics,' JSTOR, Vol. 46, No.I, (Mar,.1978), 19-39.

his earlier publications. The paper is published in *Buddhist Hermeneutics* (1988), the collection of articles presented in the conference. [124]

Bond's overall contribution, including the summary of *Netti*, provided for the *Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies* (1996), is remarkable. His attempt breaks a new ground for a total understanding of the texts. Recognizing the text as constituting the methodology of the Theravāda Buddhist tradition was a productive contribution to the field. However, not only the practical side or the application of the theory but also the discussion of the matter itself is missing in his work. Explaining the method of demonstrations of the first two modes out of sixteen in *Netti,* he concludes:

> 'The rest of this section applies the methods of the remaining categories to the same Udāna passage. These are all done in very brief fashion – even cryptically - and so do not add either to the sample exegesis or the explanation of these categories in the previous section.' [125]

Hence, the question 'how an interpretation and/or translation would be construable following the method' still demands further analysis and assessment.

Besides the Theravāda tradition, the text titled *Buddhist Translations; Problems and Perspectives* (2001), edited by Doboom Tulku is a pioneering attempt at discussing the Mahayāna Buddhist texts in Tibet and China in this light. It discusses the problem of misinterpretation and brings current approaches on Buddhist translations as well as the strategies of interpretations. The article, titled

---

[124] Bond, 'The Gradual Path as a Hermeneutical Approach to the Dhamma,' Buddhist Hermeneutics, ed. Donald S. Lopez, Jr.(Delhi: MB,1988) 29-46

[125] Bond, 'Netti Summary,'411.

'*Comparison as a Principle of Knowledge and its Application to the Translation of Buddhist Texts,*' is a clear case in point:

> 'We shall focus first on the notions of comparison in the writings of contemporary historians of religion, such as J. Z. Smith and then turn to a discussion of the Indian philosophical concept of upamāna usually translated in Western scholarly literature as 'analogy' or 'comparison.' In this way we hope to come to some conclusions about the nature and workings of comparison as a form of knowledge, conclusions of which we will apply to the realm of translation theory, and more specifically to the translation of Buddhist texts from the Tibetan.'[126]

The concept, upamāna, which is just one of the methods is not sufficient to render the meaning of a canonical text, as the ways of defining knowledge are varied.[127] Each scholar has suggested a method dictated by his or her individual inclination. None of the articles examines whether there has been a methodology, which has common application to the process of translations. Prof. Bond's assertion is relevant at this point:

> 'Of all the works in the canon or in literature, the *Nettippakaraṇa* is probably one of the least read and least understood, yet it holds potentially great insights into both the Dharma and Theravada Buddhism'[128]

---

[126] Doboom Tulku, ed. Buddhist Translations: Problems and Perspectives, (1995, Manohar Publishers: New Delhi) 59.
[127] For a detailed discussion on upamāna: see Jayatilleke, EBT, 75-76.
[128] Bond, Nature of Netti, 29.

It is valid and much relevant even today, approximately thirty years after his observations.

The Literatures on English translations of *Thig,* are less. Either the critic has paid attention on the literary features of the text[129] or the linguistic aspects. Such discussions on the uniformity of the language, the syntax and the style and the comparison of the text with other canonical works such as *Itivuttaka*, *Dhammapada, Jātaka Pāli* have not helped to highlight its main theme. [130]

R. Pischel first edited and introduced *Thig* in Pāli as a transliteration of the Roman script in 1833. The preface to this edition has served as a useful introduction to the western reader. It discusses three main factors in details: the authorship; the number of nuns included as authors; and the antiquity of the verses. No special attention is paid to the content and the purpose of the text.

The first English translation of *Thig*, *The Psalms of Sisters*, done by C.A.F. Rhys Davids, was published in 1909 and reprinted in 1948 and 1964. The text was introduced as 'an expression of a higher state of mind of the sisters, within the Buddhist religious background.'[131] The verses have been translated with the help of the commentary of *Thig*, Paramatthadīpanī composed by Dhammapāla in the 6th century AD.

K.R. Norman, a distinguished Pali scholar, prepared the second English translation for *Thig* in 1971. He looked at the text through the lens of historical, linguistic and stylistic variations. The introduction of the text set out to construct a relationship between the text and its metrical variations. Some confusion over the

---

[129] 'Therigatha,' Women Writing in India: 600 B.C. To The Present, ed. Susie Tharu and K. Lalita, Vol. 1. (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1993) 65-69.
[130] N.A. Jayawickrama, 'Some Linguistic Peculiarities of the Therigatha,' UCR, 1955,17-23
[131] C.A.F. Rhys Davids. Psalms of the Early Buddhist: Psalms of the Sisters, (1909, London: PTS, 1948) xviii. (TT-1),

fundamental meanings of Buddhist concepts can be clearly identified in this translation.

### 1.3.4 Structure of the Thesis

The main theme of the study, 'Problems of Translating Buddhist Texts in Pali, with special reference to Therigāthā' will be discussing the problems inherent in the act, introducing and demonstrating the ancient Buddhist method in *Netti* as a solution. The need for applying the method will be highlighted in terms of the utility of the Buddhist teachings.

We shall not deal with criteria such as aesthetic value, linguistic and/or stylistic features, and historical or socio- cultural aspects like gender in this research though some of those issues have an import on Translation. The main aim here is to demonstrate the Buddhist method of Interpretation and Translation, which has not been much discussed in the discipline of Translation Studies til date. We believe that an effort of this kind would certainly throw light on the Religious/Philosophical doctrines of earlier times and help to remove some of the discrepancies in the translations.

#### 1.3.4.1 Concepts and Technical terms

Whatever concepts that emerged from this research will be defined according to the criteria and the definitions of *Netti*. The motives are:

i) To discuss how the purpose of the Buddhist teachings can be depicted by any canonical text

ii) To exhibit the conceptual richness of the text, which can be useful for current translations

For instance, *Thig* will be viewed in the light of *Netti*, where Nibbāna is the final goal of women: why women had chosen homelessness, (Origin of misery and its Fruit – gratifications vs. disappointments); how women escaped from misery (by Escape- cessation of unhappiness); how women achieved the goal (by Path - Means and Injunctions).

References will be provided, not from the Pali text but from *The Guide*, the only available English translation of *Netti*, considering the degree of its accessibility. Modern theories of translation studies will be brought only to clarify some key terms and to evaluate the English translations of *Thig*, as those texts follow the same theories.

Technical terms included in The Guide will be used in the main text of the thesis, after comparing them with three standard dictionaries. Terms will begin with capital letters. Alternative translations of those words will be illustrated in the footnotes for further clarifications. Pali terms also will be included within brackets in the main text when a specification is required. This is to avoid any possible confusion with regard to its meaning.

### 1.3.4.2 Process of Demonstrating the Method in *Netiippakaraṇa*

The study will not produce a separate translation for *Thig*, but will discuss and demonstrate how the Buddhist method of interpretation and translation would adopt the *Thig*. The sixteen modes will be demonstrated independently, following the section of the Combined Treatment of *Netti*:

i) To assess the method on a text/verse, which belongs to another division of Tipiṭaka by excluding the verse and the division that *Netti* demonstrated

ii) To exhibit significances, similarities and differences among the modes

iii) To select suitable modes for each collection of verses in *Thig*

The demonstration has two components:

1) Applying each of the sixteen modes on the same single verse selected from *Thig*
2) Suggesting applicable modes for all the collections of verses in *Thig*, following the constraints of the previous application

In the first component, the first step is to select a verse or a piece of a text, which is condensed, by the criterion of *Netti*. Characteristics of the condensed text include minimization of the teachings or the message meaningally and phrasingally. Such texts demand detailed and in-depth explications. The target group of the study, the non-Buddhist English reader, may fall into the group, which *Netti* recommends for more details. Besides, a brief piece is suitable, as it facilitates the translator who is new to understand the method without much effort.

As the second step in the demonstration, the verse will be paraphrased in order to provide its literal meaning as prescribed by the Mode two in *Netti*. Then each mode will be exemplified as an individual piece and the process of translation will be shown systematically with instructions at the beginning. Subsequent drafts of translations will be shown in order to make the procedure logical. Page numbers of The Guide will be included in between the process to assist the translator to connect a passage to the concepts in *Netti.* In the end, the sub-drafts will be combined to finalise the text of translation. Page numbers and footnotes given in the drafts will be omitted from the translated text.

As the third step, the constraints will be analysed at the end of each mode, considering two decisive factors:

i) To which group of readers, the mode would be appropriate

ii) To which type of a text, the mode would be suitable

Finally, those sixteen modes will be divided into three main groups to provide an idea of selecting mode/s for readers, who may fall into any one of the three groups mentioned in *Netti*.

Subsequently, only the Modes, which are suitable for a non-Buddhist English reader, would be focused in the study. They will be classified into three optional categories, considering the style of expression of the text. The translator would be able to select an option for the mentioned reader according to his or her interest, but knowing its limitations.

The second component will discuss modes applicable for the whole verses in *Thig,* employing the categories of Modes produced by the component one. Firstly, the seventy-three collections of the verses in the *Thig* will be divided into three categories, considering the style of expressions:

i) Collections of verses, which are condensed in meaning

ii) Collections of verses, which are expanded in meaning

iii) Collections of verses, which are detailed in meaning

The three groups are ascendant in terms of clarity of meaning. The first category implies the briefest descriptions on teachings in the text, thus demanding more clarifications than the other two. The second and the third categories are

clear in meaning to certain degrees. Thus, those categories will be treated in the application process in two ways, considering such variations.

In brief, the study will discuss problems, introduce the method, demonstrate it, and finally conclude it by applications.

### 1.3.5. Chapter Plan

The research project consists of six chapters. The first chapter, the Introduction is constituted of two parts and the former will be dedicated to a discussion on methodology. The second part will discuss important factors under two subtitles. 'Attempts of Preserving Buddhist Teachings' will examine the efforts made by India, forming three councils, and Sri Lanka, by translating and converting the texts into written form. 'The Problems of Translating Buddhist Texts into English' will consider the ideologies in colonial and post-colonial periods briefly and their impact on Buddhist canonical translations.

The second chapter, 'the Buddhist Interpretation Method,' is comprised of five sub sections. Introduction to the *Nettippakaraṇa*, will discuss the author and the authority of the text. In the other three sections, the methodology of *Netti* will be summed up, including the sixteen modes of conveying meaning, five Guidelines, and their correlation with the root terms. Functions, applicability, benefits of Modes and the examples will be included in this section. In the end, the whole method in *Netti* will be concluded.

The third chapter will be a discussion on Nibbāṇa as women's final goal in *Therigāthā* with six sub-sections. 'Introduction to the Text' will deal with the historical background of ancient Indian women who recited those verses and the establishment of nunnery in Buddhism. 'Authorship and the Structure' will

discuss the debate on authorship, content, and the arrangements of the chapters of the text. 'The Main Purpose of the Text' will be a discussion on how the text depicts its aims in the light of Buddhist teachings. The other three subsections, 'Reasons for Embracing Homelessness,' 'Escape from Suffering,' and the 'Description of the Goal' will concern the reasons of misery peculiar to women, techniques of emerging from misery and the nature of happiness or the bliss they experienced attaining Nibbāṇa.

The fourth chapter will be a 'Discussion on English Translations,' which includes six sections. 'Organisation of Translated Texts' will illustrate the outline of those texts and then each translation will individually be taken care of. 'Effect of the Organising Factors on the Translation,' 'Style of the Translated Texts' and 'Procedures of Translating' will describe how those aspects influenced the translation.

The fifth chapter, 'Application of *Nettippakaraṇa*, the Method' is comprised of four sub sections. The first one is 'Demonstration - I: Applying Sixteen Modes on a Single Verse', which demonstrates the sixteen Modes of *Netti* on a single verse. Each application procedure includes instructions, drafts of translations, final product of translation, and constraints. 'Conclusion of the Demonstration – I' analyses the Modes according to the group of the reader. 'Instructions of Applying the Method for the Full Text' has three sub sections, which represent each collection of verses in *Thig*. 'Conclusion on applying modes on a Full Text' finally discusses how to deal with optional categories of Modes.

The sixth chapter would be a summing up of the earlier chapters and a few remarks on the future of this particular research area.

# Introduction- Part II

## 1.4. Attempts at Preserving the Buddhist Teachings

Once the interpretation cum translation becomes the sole medium, there arises the need to preserve the core meaning of the teachings. The frequent usage of the method by many in different places certainly tended to give rise to deviations. Misconstruing was therefore the threat that Buddhism faced since its announcement. The problem was addressed at the initial stage. According to the *Netti* there are two main factors, which could damage the meaning of the teachings-[132]

i. The word order, which is ill- placed
ii. The meaning, which is ill- conveyed

In other words, a Guideline can be applied only for a well-placed word order, which conveys the meaning properly. The interpreter or the translator must be acquainted with both the phrasing and meaning structures to construct the meaning. If not, misinterpretations or erratic interpretations will be the outcome. Compiling a method as seen in the *Netti* was a cardinal attempt taken by the order in the last phase of the lifetime of the Buddha. Hence, the teachings and its methodology became the very breath of the order after the demise of the Buddha. The threat posed by time to the essential meaning of the message was met by:

[132] (Ñāṇamoli, 35); the idea is in the Bāla Vagga, A., Vol. 1. 116.

i) Chanting the doctrine along with its methodology in the councils

ii) Preserving teachings by certain groups of monks and their lineages

The first council was held in the city of Rājagaha, three months after the Buddha's demise. The president, *Arahant* Mahā Kassapa, was the seniormost monk in the order at that time. His greatness was considered second only to that of the Buddha. The main purpose of the council was to preserve the authenticity and the genuineness of the teachings. Approximately, five hundred *Arahant*as participated in the council. They discussed the important terms along with the methods of interpretation of the doctrine.[133]

The second council was held at Vesāli after about hundred years. It was a historical event in which was confirmed the authority of early monkshood in the verification and purification of the doctrine. The chief monks who followed the Buddha's orthodox teachings expelled a large group of monks who partially rejected and reinterpreted the original teachings. Later, the monks who were expelled from the order formed a separate sect and were called Mahāsāsaṅghikās.[134] The monks who preserved the scriptures in order to consolidate the Buddha's teachings with its method of interpretation believed that they should be upheld as the authentic tradition and were called the Theravādins.

About 274 century BC, King Asoka succeeded to the vast empire of India after a devastating war in about 262 BC and later became a Buddhist.[135] He is the first king who made Buddhism the state religion in India. [136] The third council was

---

[133] Mallasekere, Pāli Literature, 90.

[134] Nikāysaṅgrahaya, Ed. Simon de Silva, Mendis Gunasekera and W.F. Gunawardhana (Ceylon: Ceylon Govt. Press, 1907) 7-8.

[135] Rahula, 3.

[136] See for details on the Bhabru Edict and Pillar Edicts of Sārānath, Kausambi and Sānchi: Rāhula, 6.

conducted at Pāṭaliputta in the 3rd century BC with the zealous assistance of Emperor Asoka. The purpose of the council was 'to settle authoritatively the canon of the scriptures and rid alien, metaphysical and/or theological doctrines.'[137] The teachings were divided into three sections: *Sutta* (threads/discourses), *Vinaya* (discipline/code of conduct) and the *Abhidhamma* (the most advanced and specialised doctrine)[138] for the convenience of teaching and preservation. The third council confirmed the authenticity of the Theravāda tradition for the third time[139] and Sri Lanka received Tipiṭaka soon after this event.

Meanwhile, the monks, who were expelled from the mainstream, set up different sects against the Theravāda tradition. They cloned themselves into eighteen sects in the later period. Various techniques of interpretations were suggested and applied by them for the teachings. Their attempts were very much responsible for the mutilation of the original teachings of the Buddha in India especially after the reign of Asoka. [140]

Socio-religious environments in India and other Theravāda Buddhist countries led to increasing diversion from the early method of interpreting Buddhist texts to new traditions. The countries where the teachings survived at the time of Asoka, received both, the doctrine and the method. The solidity of the methodology was important, when the texts were exposed to the vastly different geographical, socio-cultural or ideological environments of the recipient cultures.

---

[137] Sir John Marshell's findings on the Monuments of Sāṅchi, I: Rāhula, 12.

[138] For a descriptive analysis of the term, see (Varma, 2-4).

[139] Rahula, 12.

[140] 'The community of monks had been divided into the two sects of Theravādins and Mahāsāṅgikas at the time of the 2nd Council. The number of branches increased up to 18 within a period of hundred years. They further divided into many more, in between the period of the 3rd Council and the 5th century AD.' For clarifications: Rāhul Sankrityāyana, 'The Rise and Fall of Buddhism in India.' Selected Essays of Rahul Sankrityāyana (New Delhi: People's Publishing House, 1984); Aggamahapandita Polwatte Buddhadatta Thero, Theravada Bavuddha Darshanaya, (1960, Colombo: Ratna Book Publishers, 2002) 2-27.

Categorization of canonical works itself shows how the differences in communication occurred outside India. For instance, the Theravāda tradition of Myanmar accepted *Netti* and Peṭakopadesa as canonical works while Sri Lanka considers them non-canonical.

Furthermore, there were countries, which were deeply affected by other sects of Buddhism, which were more powerful than the Theravāda sect was. The monks of other sects could easily dominate the Theravāda ideology and the traditional methodology was not treated as important. Original scriptures were neglected. This led to the fading away of the Buddhist teachings within a period of 800 years in India and outside. None of the other countries out of nine, which received Buddhism in the 3rd BC, could provide India with the original versions of the Buddha's teachings in the 5th century except Sri Lanka. This clearly shows how other countries neglected or lost the Tipiṭaka texts completely.

However, the Sri Lankan Buddhist translations could play an important role at that time in re-establishing the lost tradition. It is very important to discuss how Sri Lanka did preserve the orthodoxy of Buddhist texts not allowing them to undergo deterioration. In fact, for the Sinhalese chronicle Mahāvaṃsa, Emperor Asoka gifted the Buddhist teachings to Sri Lanka with a special intention. The king of Ceylon, Tissa, had already established a close friendship with Asoka, by conferring on him a honorific title '*devānampiya*,' the beloved of the Gods, by which epithet Tissa came to be known thereafter.[141] Asoka had made arrangements for a second but complete crowning ceremony for Devānampiyatissa providing all requisites from India.[142] Deciding that Buddhism was the best gift for his intimate friend, Asoka sent his own son Mahinda after

[141] Asoka's Rock Edict VIII refers to the Sinhalese King Devanampria. Rahula, 27.
[142] Rahula, ii.

training him in certain cultural aspects of the Sinhala country.[143] Besides, accepting the request of Devānampiyatissa, he sent his daughter Sanghamittā, the Arahat nun, for the establishment of the nunnery in Sri Lanka.[144] Asoka's involvement with Sri Lanka was more personal than the other countries that were entertained. The situation also influenced to preserve the doctrine carefully.

> Wherever they went, the Indian Buddhist missionaries were successful…But Ceylon was the most fertile of all fields for the Buddhist activities of Asoka. (According to his inscriptions) Asoka dispatched his *Dūtas* or messengers to prosecute his scheme of Dharma Vijaya or Moral Conquest (in Ceylon).[145]

Devānampiyatissa, who was already familiar with the teachings through his friend Asoka, could exhibit a higher intelligence and capacity for understanding the teachings at the very first conversation with Mahinda.[146] The king acknowledged the doctrine with great respect and gratitude. He provided every possible facility suggested by Mahinda for the development of the new religion and very soon, Buddhism was declared as the state religion of the country. Meanwhile, a strong foundation for safeguarding the orthodoxy of the teachings was laid by Mahinda with the assistance of the native scholars in the country. The attempt was not much obstructed by the medium of communication because:

> 'If we compare the language of Asoka's inscriptions and the inscriptions of Ceylon in the third century BC, we can see that the two languages were almost

[143] Vinaya Pitaka. Vol. 5 (London; PTS) 3.
[144] The nun reached with a sapling of the Bodhi tree and 18 groups of workers who belonged to certain castes for tending Bodhi Tree. They settled down at the kingdom of Anurādhapura in Sri Lanka. Mhv, xvi. 12-25.
[145] Rahula, 13.
[146] Mhv. xiv, 16-21.

> similar. There were slight differences between the two, but it was possible for the speaker in one language to follow without much difficulty the ideas expressed by the other.'[147]

Mahinda started translating the Pali Tipiṭaka into the 'language of the land' for the benefit of the native people of the land. The tradition of translating continued, accumulating new materials at least up to the 2nd century AD.[148] The translations called *Heḷatuvā* or the Sinhalese Expositions are admired as the first and foremost literary works in Sri Lanka. They were available until the 10th century AD.[149] The processes of teaching and preserving the doctrine extensively complemented the formal education system in the country. The institution (pariveṇa) Mahinda formed at the heart of the Anurādhapura kingdom[150]transformed into a well-established centre named Mahāvihāra.[151] It functioned as the main authoritative centre for Theravāda Buddhism in the country and became famous in the world as a Theravāda Buddhist monastery for centuries.[152]

'The fourth council,' according to the texts such as *Sāratthadīpanī* Vinaya commentary probably written in the 12th century AD and *Sāsanavaṃsa* written in Burma in 1861 AD, is 'the event of writing the books in Sri Lanka.'[153] This major event in the history of preserving Tipiṭaka took place in the country in 80th century

---

[147] Rahula, 60.
[148] Rahula, xxv.
[149] Aṭṭhakathā, Encyclopaedia of Buddhism, vol.1. 336-7.
[150] According to Mahāvaṃsa, the small tattered building named as Kālapāsāda Pirivena where the teaching and other literary activities used to take place. Later it became the main centre of education. Thus, it was called MahāVihāra, the large or the main temple.
[151] Structure of the Pirivena (academic institution) could be seen even now near by Mahāthūpa, or the Ratnamāli stūpa at Anurādhapura city in Sri Lanka.
[152] Mhv. xv. 27-172.
[153] 'Theravādin Tradition and Pali Literature,' Encyclopaedic Dictionary of Pali Literature. ed. Vol.2. (New Delhi: Global Vision Publishing House, 2003) 524.

AD. Five hundred monks gathered in the council and with their agreement, the Pali Tipiṭaka, which was propagated by oral tradition was transformed into systematic writings in books.[154] It is evident how the Sri Lankan monks were responsible for protecting the orthodoxy of the Tipiṭaka for centuries after the event.

> 'Those texts were considered orthodox by both on the continent and in Ceylon as is evidenced by the Buddhaghosa and Fa Hsian; and in view of the great care with which the orthodox monks attempted to preserve the purity of the Word there is not much probability that the canon underwent any material changes in the interval.' [155]

Buddhaghosa was compelled to exhibit proofs of his knowledge to the authoritative monks in Mahāvihāra to access the Pali Tipiṭaka. He started his work after the submission of his treatise on Buddhism, the *Vissuddhhimagga*, which is accepted and appreciated as a unique piece of literature not only in Sri Lanka but also in the world.

Buddhaghosa's work was that of an editor-translator, but later he was regarded as the author of Pali 'Commentaries.'[156] His works were indebted to the method of *Netti*.[157] Those features have been either included in the original Sinhalese translations or added by Buddhaghosa himself, referring to the method. However, *Pali Aṭṭhakathā* was the foundation to form another important branch in translated literature called commentaries.

---

[154] Mallasekere, Pāli Literature, 44; Mhv.cp. xxxiii, , vv.100-101; Dpv, Cp.xx, 20-21.
[155] Mallasekere, Pāli Literature, 44.
[156] Rahula, xxiv.
[157] Ñāṇamoli, liii-liv.

Buddhaghosa could establish the orthodox Buddhist teachings in India after this event. *Pali Aṭṭhakathā* can be recognised as the earliest available records – in a complete form - in the Buddhist translation history in India as well as in Sri Lanka. Siam and Burma at this point must be acknowledged as the countries, which contributed for preserving the Tipiṭaka texts. As recorded in *Jinkālamāli* (1430 AD), 'the Sīhalasāsana was brought to Siam and in 1475-77 AD, a council was held in Siam at which the three Piṭakas were 'cleansed of scribes' by great elders appointed for the task, who were well versed in the Tipiṭaka.'[158]

The fifth council convened during the period of 1868-71 AD under the presidensy of Burmese king Min-don-min and eminent monks and teachers read and recited the sacred texts to restore the best readings. 'The complete text of the Tipiṭaka was engraved on 729 stone slabs in Mandalay. '[159]

The sixth council was held in Rangoon in 1954-56.

> '…. a draft edition of the *Tipiṭaka,* commentaries and sub commentaries based on the first council edition, which had been revised after comparision with texts from other countries was prepared by a body of scholars. After cheking and re-editing by a board of Burmese, Sinhalese and Thai monks, the final version, recited and formally confirmed during the two years of the council, was printed and published.'[160]

Those texts, which were printed and published are now known as Tipiṭaka.

---

[158] K.R. Norman, 'The Pāli Language and Scriptures,' Collected Papers, Vol. 4. Oxford: PTS. 1993. 113

[159] Norman. 'The Pāli Language and Scriptures,113.

[160] Norman. 'The Pāli Language and Scriptures,113.

# 1.5. Problems of Translating Buddhist Texts in Pali into English

Translating Buddhist texts in Pali into English language started in Sri Lanka soon after the advent of colonization. Ancient literary traditions in Sri Lanka - in India too - underwent considerable changes under colonization that started in the 15th century AD. Learning native languages and translating religious texts became the principal agenda and the immediate need of the colonial missionaries, due to the need to familiarize themselves with the cultural and religious consciousness of the native communities.

Documents were compiled on Buddhism and Buddhist culture, and studies of Pāli literature were started. At the initial stage, the documents made - especially those on the canon - were characterised by confusions and errors. There was no systematic analysis of the texts at that time. It was believed that Sinhalese literary works were devoid of historical value and that their religious literature contained nothing but romance and myths.

Since the19th century the growth of surveying canonical and non-canonical texts, Chronicles, Grammar and Philology became more rapid. About 1826, the idea developed that Ceylon was in possession of continuous written chronicles, which were not only rich in authentic facts about the history of the island, but also in invaluable materials for unravelling the meshes of Indian chronology.[161] The event produced opportunities for scholars like E. Muller, Monior Williams, T.W.

[161] Malalasekera, Pāli Literature, 5.

and C.A.F. Rhys Davids, E.J. Hardy, and H. Oldenburg to translate Buddhist texts into English in both the countries, Ceylon and India. [162]

Anthologies, Dictionaries, Catalogues of Manuscripts and literary works produced by Western scholars were being popularized among the readers in Europe and the other Western countries.[163] Unlike the early years, scholars cooperated with the system of Sinhala Buddhist institutions and launched surveys on ancient museums, which belonged to the Buddhist temples. Temples in Ceylon have been playing a major role as educational centres for both monks and laymen ever since the introduction of Buddhism to the country. Buddhist monks were the pioneers in teaching, compiling as well as preserving a huge number of manuscripts of classical literary works in Sinhala, Pali and Sanskrit.

Missionaries during the colonial administration did some positive contributions of preserving, producing and publishing catalogues of historical collections. Buddhist scriptures, which were introduced to European countries, provided opportunities for researchers on a large scale. The native scholars also gained support from the government to edit and publish ancient literary works.

However, in some aspects, the missionary movement was a complete failure. On the one hand, the mission of the colonial rulers of 'discovering the heritage of the island' through Sinhala literature remained unfulfilled because they failed to recognize the umbilical relationship between Buddhism and the native literature. Surveys in the field remained mere surface level investigations and were limited to gathering information for writing reports.

---

[162] Audrius Beinorius, 'Buddhism in the Early European Imagination: A Historical Perspective. ISSN1648-2662.ACTAORIENTALIAVILNENCIA,6.2((2005).7-22. http://www.jstor.org.about/terms.

[163] Malalasekera, Pāli Literature, 6-10.

Similarly, many foreign scholars who were engaged in studying Pali texts were unable to grasp the essence of Buddhist teachings. They translated Buddhist canonical texts into English, learning Pali language through native scholars. Nevertheless, mere language proficiency was not enough to dive into the deep meanings of the Buddhist teachings and the immediate result of it was erroneous clarifications and misinterpretations. The trend of wrong interpretations of Pali Buddhist texts continues to the present day with serious ramifications.

Misinterpretations occurred in many facets. One disastrous movement was formulating hypothetical theories, which resulted in defective conclusions on Buddhist canons in Western terminology. Western philosophers as well as professional scholars, mostly of an earlier generation, disparaged Eastern philosophical texts including Buddhist texts as non-useful materials.

> 'They included those who regarded the very term 'Indian philosophy' as 'contradictio in adjeto' and its teachings as vaguely indefinite displays of dreamy thoughts, lacking in clear-cut concepts and proper definitions.[164]

Christian missionaries miserably failed to appreciate the philosophical value of the primary sources like Tipiṭaka, including other Sinhala and Sanskrit literary works and this situation created various problems. They could not trace historical concepts, purposes and the authenticity of the sources. The Buddhist textual tradition was not at all understood as the main progressive force of the collective consciousness in the island. The result was not only the negligence of the spiritual heritage of the island but also transmission of misconstrued notions to the West. For instance, vague and unsupported arguments came up such as 'some

[164] D. Friedman, Preface, EBT by Jayatilleke, 5.

passages of (Buddhist) canonical literature were written at Cambridge University in 1920's.'[165] Some scholars went to the extent of suggesting that certain elements of the early discourses attributed to the Buddha are to be left out as they contained 'a lot of monkish jargons.'[166] There was a tendency of portraying 'Buddha as an Indian version of Martin Luther and Buddhism as a form of Hindu Protestantism.'[167]

> "In the early years of the colonial period on the Indian subcontinent (including Ceylon) the translations of Buddhist texts into English from Sanskrit and Tibetan were often done by scholars who were deeply committed to and /or directed by Christianity. These translations and interpretations, therefore have a very high degree of Christian coloring.[168]

Biblical concepts and terminology like 'view of an unchangeable,' 'eternal soul apart from the body' became the criterion for interpreting Buddhist teachings. In her works, C.A.F. Rhys Davids, a former president of the Pali Text Society, concluded that the Buddha accepted the 'soul/self or spirit' within.[169] It is contrary to one of the three characteristics of Marks[170] (*tilakkhaṇa*) in Buddhism, namely Soullessness (anattatā). In some instances, she could not recognize the purpose of stylistic and metrical repetitions as well as variables in the Threads (sutta) as the

---

[165] Jayatilleke, EBT, 10.
[166] D.J. Kalupahana, Preface, Buddhist Philosophy: A Historical Analysis, (1933, Hawaii: The University Press of Hawaii, 1976) xi.
[167] Audrius Beinoius, 'Buddhism in the Early European Imagination,' 2005. p.16
[168] Tulku, 2.
[169] C.A.F. Rhys Davids, Outlines of Buddhism. (London: Methuen & co. Ltd, 1938) 20.; Tulku, 3.
[170] Varma, 160.

techniques in oral traditions, but disparaged them as 'over-lapping or partially coinciding notions'.[171]

Many scholars did not understand the Buddhist theory of the Law of Dependent Origination. It is unique to the Buddhist teachings, which expound causal relations of misery and happiness.[172] Oldenberg hesitates to accept the reality of constituents such as decay and death, sorrow, lamentation, ill, grief, and despair, thus concluding Buddhism as Pessimism.[173] B. Keith defines the theory of Dependent Origination as 'an explanation of misery' but finally concludes that 'it tells nothing regarding physical causes.'[174] V. Poussin and B. Keith who were considered to have acquired mastery in Buddhism had worked on texts for decades. They declared Buddhism to be a rationalistic doctrine at first, because the Buddha did not accept dogmatic truth as he based his views on reasoning. Later, following the ideas of Kern, they too were inclined to show the Buddhist system to be a superhuman law founded upon the decrees of an omniscient and infallible master.'[175]

Some scholars were led to a diametrically opposite interpretation on Buddhist concepts inspired by 'free thinking' based on the rationalistic approaches. For instance, Kern's early translations were considered as the best examples of the worst in such occasions. He translated the concept of 'Nibbāna' as 'death'.[176]

---

[171] 'Bi-verbal definitions in Pāli stanzas are mere substitutions but play an important role in oral traditions in helping to memorize.' Jayatilleke, EBT, 299.
[172] Varma, 111-112.
[173] H.Oldenberg, Buddha: his life, his doctrine, his order, (1882, London: Calcutta, 1927) 212.
[174] Jayatilleke, EBT, 376.
[175] Jayatilleke, EBT, 377.
[176] Tulku, 2.

The influence of Christianity started fading away with the development of advanced sciences in the West. Buddhist concepts were subjected to assessment by other ideologies. For a considerable period, Buddhist translations were examined in the light of Marxism, Metaphysics etc. Following Marxism, some argued that Buddhism was more religious than merely philosophical. The necessity of including devotional practices was emphasized, when Buddhism was applied to the common life. [177] Metaphysics, which originated and developed out of mythological views also influenced the reading and interpretation of Buddhist texts. Beckh and Stcherbatsky, who extensively worked on Buddhist materials, were deeply influenced by Kantian Metaphysics.[178] Stcherbatsky's adaptation of 'the thing in itself' for the word 'tathatā' is a direct influence of Kant.[179]

Edward Conze, a famous scholar, who has introduced a great deal of useful and rare materials of Buddhist literature to the world, provides an example of the lack of understanding of the basic concepts, in the last two decades of the 20th century. His work, *A Short History of Buddhism* (1980), is an attempt to 'counteract the three evils of violence, self and death.' The introduction of 'death' itself proves how much the author is confused in understanding Buddhist concepts:

> '..As there is something here, which we do not quite understand. The Buddha obviously shared the conviction that essentially we are immortal and so can conquer death and win eternal life by religious means.[180]

---

[177] Trevor Ling. Buddha, Marx and God, (New York: Macmillan Publishers, 1966) 151-172.
[178] Jayatilleke, EBT, 474.
[179] Tulku, Introduction, 3.
[180] Edward Conze, The concept of Buddhist Nirvāna (Delhi: Bharatiya Vidya Prakashan,1975) 1.

Conze's translation of the Nibbāna as a 'Buddhist conception of the absolute' is a direct imposition of Kantian terms.[181] Apart from such philosophical approaches, western psychology as primarily taught by Freud and Jung influenced the teachings much.[182]

There has also been a trend of theorizing Buddhism by various tools like linguistic relativism, sexuality and gender in the light of modernity. For those scholars, Buddhism must be subjected to theorizing in such ways in order to prove its very applicability to the contemporary world. The introduction to *Buddhism, Sexuality and Gender* (1992) clearly says:

> i) "Except for very cursory studies that include Buddhism as one among other world religious traditions there is a tremendous dearth of scholarship relating to Buddhism and sexuality in general and to homosexuality in particular. Only recently, however has the Western scholarly community come to realize that much of the methodology of gender studies is as relevant to the Asian religious traditions as to the West, that the Asian traditions contain a great wealth of material deserving of analysis, and that this material is not only interesting in its own right but also a comparative springboard for more general and theoretical discussions."[183]
>
> ii) 'The realization that gender is a cultural construct of course is a unique insight of modernity, as is the explicit use of gender as an analytic variable….Engaging in this form of analysis with the end of deepening insight into Buddhism is the purpose of this.[184]

---

[181] Tulku, Introduction, 3-4.
[182] Tulku, Introduction, 3.
[183] Jose Ignacio Cabezon, Introduction, Buddhism Sexuality and Gender, (1992, New York: State University; Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications, 1992) vii-viii.
[184] Cabezon, Introduction, xvii.

However, those ideologies have not been helpful in revealing the real purpose of a Buddhist text. The attempts of evaluating the doctrine in the light of 'modern' theories while totally ignoring its fundamental purpose are fruitless. Applying secular tools to analyze the doctrine is tangential and the result would be only promoting vague arguments. There were similar attempts during the Buddha's time and the Buddha categorized those questions into 'ten in-determinates'[185] (*dasa abyākata vattūni*). They were kept unanswered because of their speculative nature and extremity.[186]

[185](Ñāṇananda, Concept and Reality,17); undeclared: (Ñāṇamoli, 291), (PED,18).
[186] Ñāṇamoli, 248.

**Chapter-Two**

# The Buddhist Interpretation Method

## 2.1. Introduction of the Methodology of Nettippakaraṇa

The Pali term '*netti*' denotes 'a guide,' 'conductor,' or 'a support'[187] while '*pakaraṇa*' stands for 'exposition,' 'literary work,' 'composition,' or a 'book.'[188] The title *Nettippakaraṇa* therefore stands for a compilation of Guidelines to illuminate the doctrine taught by the Buddha.

The authorship of *Netti* has been attributed to *Arahant* Mahākaccāyana by the tradition. Many scholars, including the English translator of *Netti*, Bhikkhu Ñāṇmoli have refuted the idea not providing valid reason in support of their contention.[189] For instance, Geiger says that:

> "This is however not certainly true. The author was probably Kaccāyana by name and was hence identified with the renowned disciple of Buddha.'[190]

The last verse of the *Netti* states that the Buddha accepted the text presented by Mahākaccāyana and then it was first chanted and approved by the first council.[191] It is logically tenable to consider him the author, as he was the monk

---

[187] (PED, 377)
[188] (PED, 379).
[189] Ñāṇmoli, x-xi.
[190] Geiger, 26.
[191] *Nettiyā āyasmantā Mahākaccāyanena bhāsitā bhāgavatā anumoditā mūlasaṅgīṭiyṃ saṅgīṭāti*, (Netti, 288). For some scholars, the Netti was written in a later period: Geiger, 26;

who displayed the utmost skill in interpreting the cryptic and difficult teachings of the Buddha. If not the author, he might have compiled the method. However, according to the Mandalay manuscript of Burma, its every section throws a flood of light on the authorship of Mahākacchāyana. 'The *therā*, was living in an area called Jambuvana or the rose apple grove, when he was composing the text.'[192]

The main purpose of the text is viewed differently in contemporary works in Pali literature. In its Roman script edition, Hardy identifies the text as 'a commentary on the whole teachings of the Buddha.'[193] Geiger, following the ideas of Hardy recognizes the text as an introduction to Buddhist teachings.[194] The English translator introduces it 'not as a commentary but a guide for commentators.'[195] It has also been widely admired as a 'treatise on Theravāda Logic.'[196] G. Bond, who has engaged in researches on *Netti* since 1979, characterises the work as 'a Theravāda Method of Interpretation.'[197] For him, the text guides not only professional commentators but also anyone who needs to interpret the teachings.

The purpose of the text has been discussed in the first section of the first chapter in *Netti* under three headings (*Netti*, 2; Ñāṇamoli, 3-4).

i) To know the dispensation of the Glorious one or the Buddha by the wise (*paṇḍitā*)

---

George D. Bond, 'Nettippakarana: A summary' Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies Vol. 7 (Delhi: MB) 403.

[192] Hazra, 463.

[193] Hardy, p.xx.

[194] Geiger, 26.

[195] Ñāṇamoli, vii.

[196] Bond, 'Theravāda Method,'16.

[197] Bond, 'Theravāda Method,'16.

ii) To know phrasing or the phrasing[198] (*byañjana*) structures and meaning or meaning[199](*attha*) structures properly, which represents the Buddha's words in the *sutta*

iii) To know clearly(*pariyeṭṭhi*)[200] the Teacher and the Taught but strictly in accordance with testing the Nine-fold Divisions of the *sutta's*[201]

The term *Pariyeṭṭhi* describes a method that advocates a 'systematic search' and a 'careful investigation'[202] on the subject matter of 'Dispensation' (*sāsana*). Herein, an attentive search is needed to understand the teachings of the Buddha as it consists of the two characteristics of (Ñāṇamoli, 18):

i) Immeasurable[203] (*aparimāṇa*) in the structures of 'Meaning' and

ii) Immeasurable in the structures of 'Phrasing'

Hence, the *Netti* designs a method to preserve the 'Dispensation' for the target group, irrespective of the differences of time or space. If so, the method cannot be limited only to the act of interpretation as the teachings were keenly subjected to translating as well. *Netti* confirms the fact that the text is 'meant to be translated into all regional languages.'[204] Besides, no single reference of a separate method on translation is found in Tipiṭaka since the *Netti* envelops the

---

[198] *byañjana* : phrase, features (Ñāṇamoli, 300).
[199] *Attha*: Meaning (Ñāṇamoli, 288).
[200] (Netti, 2); search (Ñāṇamoli,3).
[201] *Navavidhasuttanta*: nine-fold Threads of Arguments (Ñāṇamoli, 4); the nine categories of the teachings according to the form or the style of a text (PED, 348, 718).
[202] *Pariyeṭṭhi*: [pari +eṭṭhi of esati] search for (PED, 434); *pariyesati*: to investigate (PED, 434).
[203] Immeasurable (Bond, Netti Summary, 403); Un-gauged measure: (Ñāṇamoli, 290).
[204] The discussion in the Mode of *Catubyuha hāra*, the Four-fold Arrangements: (Ñāṇamoli, 55) ;

potentialities of conveying the meaning to the standards of intra-language as well the inter-languages.

## 2.2. Method of Nettippakaraṇa

*Netti* has four chapters. The first is divided into two main divisions: 'Comprehensive Section; (*saṅgahavāra*) and the 'Analytical Section' (*vibhāgavāra*). The first section is a summary of the major points of the whole text, which are meant to be elaborated in the succeeding chapters. The Analytical section has three subsections: 'Indication' (*uddesa*); 'Descriptive Expositions' (*niddesa*);[205] and 'Re-descriptive Expositions' (*paṭiniddesa*)[206] which describes the methods included in the Comprehensive Section in ascending order. The indicative subsection duly discusses the whole methodology of the text in three categories.

i) *Soḷasa Hāra* or Sixteen Modes of Conveying Meaning
ii) *Pañca Naya* or Five Guidelines
iii) *Aṭṭhārasa Mūla Pada* or Eighteen Root-terms [207]

'Descriptive Expositions' defines and describes those classifications along with their subordinate formulas and functions, demonstrating them to a certain extent. 'Re-descriptive Expositions' provides definitions, possibilities and limitations of each category and the subsections, elaborating them as individual pieces.

---

[205] (PED, 358); demonstration (Ñāṇamoli, 4)
[206] (PED, 395); Counter-Demonstration: (Ñāṇamoli, 4)
[207] *Mūla*: Root-term (Ñāṇamoli, 301), (DOA.p.114); origin, source, base (PED, 539). *pada*: characteristics (PED, 408).

The second chapter of the *Netti*, the Combined Treatment (*hāra sampāta*), is a demonstration of the Sixteen Modes.

The third chapter, Moulding of Guidelines (*nayasamuṭṭhāna*), describes the five Guidelines and their functions and the characteristics of the listener or the reader. The fourth chapter, the 'Patterns of Dispensation' (*sāsanapaṭṭhāna*), is a detailed discussion on justification of the 'Eighteen Root- Terms. The *Netti* provides a clear map that charts out an outline of the interpretation or of a translation.

Buddhist teachings have been divided into nine major categories called the Nine-fold Divisions of Dispensations: Threads (*sutta*), Prose-expositions[208] (*geiya*), Grammar (*veiyākaraṇa*), Verses (*gāthā*), Exclamation[209] (*udāna*), Sayings (*itivuttaka*), Birth stories (*jātaka*), Wonderful and Marvellous ideas[210] (*acchariya abbhūtadhamma*), and Answers to questions (*vedalla*) (Ñāṇamoli, 4). The division is based on 'their form or style of the language'[211] but not the theme. The methodology of *Netti* is intended to analyze all the parts of the above mentioned. (*Netti*:2; Ñāṇamoli, 2).

For *Netti*, those Nine-fold Divisions of Dispensation are constructed upon two basic structures: Meaning and Phrasing each having six components. Correlation of these twelve methods forms the base of each Mode of conveying meaning (Ñāṇamoli, 11). Mastering both the structures is necessary to express the Intended meaning of a text (*adippāya*). Thus, the entire methodology in *Netti* incorporates those two main divisions as is stated below:

---

[208] Pieces composed in both prose and verse (Geiger, 13)
[209] Solemn sayings (Geiger, 19)
[210] Supernatural conditions powers (Geiger, 19)
[211] (PED, 348).

(A) Meaning Techniques

i) Six meaning components

ii) Three meaning-related Guidelines

*Nandiyāvatta,* (1) the Conversion of Relishing

*Tipukkhala,* (2) the Trefoil

*Sīhavikkhīḷita,* (3) the Lion's Play

(B) Phrasing Techniques

i) Six phrasing components

ii) The sixteen Modes of conveying

iii) Two phrasing Guidelines

*Disā1ocana,* (4) the 'Plotting of Directions'

*Aṅkusa,* (5) the Hook

The sixteen Modes are the possibilities or the models for transmitting the meaning of a text. The two Guidelines, 'Plotting of Direction's and the 'Hook' are phrasing approaches while the other three deal with possible meaning applications. Whatever be the technique employed for explanation, it involves the combination of six meaning and six phrasing components. The meaning of an interpretation and/or translation finally must be related to one or more Root-terms, as they are the proximate causes or fundamental conditions. The techniques of interpretation in *Netti* are ultimately aimed at explicating the Four Noble Truths. Thus the method foregrounds the idea that the 'meaning of the doctrine is one, though the ways of construing are different' (Ñāṇamoli, 17).

## 2.3 Sixteen Modes of Conveying Meaning

There are sixteen Modes of conveying meaning, which can be identified as sixteen different phrasing structures:

i) *Desanā hāra*: the Mode of conveying a Teaching
ii) *Vicaya hāra*: the Mode of an Investigation
iii) *Yutti hāra*: the Mode of Construing
iv) *Padaṭṭhāna hāra*: the Mode of Footings
v) *Lakkhaṇa hāra*: the Mode of Characteristics
vi) *Catubhuha hāra*: the Mode of Four fold Arrangements
vii) *Āvaṭṭa hāra*: the Mode of a Conversion
viii) *Vibhatti hāra*: the Mode of an Analysis
ix) *Parivattana hara*: the Mode of a Reversal
x) *Vevcana hāra*: the Mode of Synonyms
xi) *Paññatti hāra*: the Mode of Concepts
xii) *Otaraṇa hāra*: the Mode of Ways of entry of the Truth
xiii) *Sodhana hāra*: the Mode of a Clearing up
xiv) *Adhiṭṭhāna hāra*: the Mode of Terms of Expression
xv) *Parikkhāra hāra*: the Mode of Requisites
xvi) *Samāropaṇa hāra*: the Mode of Co-ordination

The first three Modes share the implications of the other Modes and so can be applied along with any other Mode. The rest are alternatively applicable. The content of these Modes can be classified into three sections for the convenience of

summarizing and for further explanations: descriptions, types of the target group, techniques.

The descriptive passages in the Modes include definitions, characteristics, concepts, formulas etc. Types of the target groups are listeners or readers who have benefited from the doctrine. They are divided into two groups initially (Ñāṇamoli, 15) and each is elaborated up to several sub- categories at the end of the text (Ñāṇamoli, 245-247). They suffer in misery by negligence of the four Noble-Truths based on the two main proximate causes (Ñāṇamoli, 15;148).

i) Defilement by the false views due to Ignorance
ii) Defilement by Craving due to Craving

Techniques of investigating, analyzing, entering, differentiating, applying and teaching have been designed for the benefit of those who are polluted by such causes and to make them realise the accurate meaning of the four Noble Truths.

### 2.3.1 *Desanā hāra* or the Mode of Teaching

The perspectives of *Desanā hāra* are incorporated with all the other Modes. The Mode scrutinizes the best possible ways of interpretation of the doctrine by the structures of meaning and phrasing. Teachings radiate illumination when a realized one teaches the doctrine and the listener develops Faith (Ñāṇamoli, 16). The True doctrine denotes here the Four Noble Truths, the core principle of the Buddhist doctrine (Ñāṇamoli,17). Therefore, the process of interpretation and/or translation must be fairly incorporated with the meaning of the Four Noble Truths.

The translator and/or interpreter are advised to adopt the approaches below, in order to produce a successful output.

i) What is to be taught

ii) How is the meaning to be constructed

iii) How are the teachings variously presented and how are they arranged in phases

iv) For whom is the teaching intended

v) The successive ways of attaining Nibbāna

The first section deals with what is to be included in a Buddhist text. Structures of the Nine-Fold Threads of the Teachings can be viewed differently. Herein, the doctrine is divided into six sections, each concerned with 'a way of teaching.' They are Gratification (*assāda*), Disappointment (*ādīnava*), Escape (*nissaraṇa*), Fruit (*phala*), Means (*upāya*) and Injunction (*āṇatti*). They can be identified with the Four Truths (Ñāṇamoli, 17-19).

The second question is how the meaning of the doctrine is to be constructed. There are six ways of explaining meaning and six ways of phrasing.

| Phrasing Terms | Meaning Terms |
|---|---|
| Letters (*akkhara*) | Explaining (*saṅkāsana*) |
| Terms (*pada*) | Displaying (*pakāsana*) |
| Phrase (*byañjana*) | Divulging (*vivaraṇa*) |
| Demonstrations[212] (*ākāra*) | Analysis (*vibhajana*) |
| Grammatical Expositions (*nirutti*)[213] | Exhibition (*uttānikamma*) |
| Definitions (*niddesa*)[214] | Concepts (*paññatti*) |

[212] Ākāra: moods (Ñāṇamoli,270)

[213] Nirutti: language (Ñāṇamoli,297); grammatical analysis, etymological interpretations (PED,370).

Thus, the teaching must be correlated to both the structures and the meaning and should,

i) Explain by letters

ii) Display by terms

iii) Divulge by phrases

iv) Analyze by Demonstrations

v) Exhibit by Grammatical Expositions

vi) Conceptualise by Definitions

The formula shows the possible ways of expressing meaning in the system of Buddhism and those are the fundamentals of the methodology in *Netti*.

The third approach presents three stylistic variations of teaching. They are, the teaching, which is Condensed, which is Expanded and which is Detailed. The translator is shown how to connect or combine the three aspects - style, phrasing and meaning - to construct the meaning in a proper way. There are three phases in a discourse called the beginning, the middle and the end. These three phases are allied to the three styles of teachings. The translator must know how to combine them because they are the characteristics of 'a properly-preached doctrine' (Ñāṇamoli,19-20).

i) The doctrine is condensed in the beginning

ii) The doctrine is expanded in the middle

iii) The doctrine is detailed in the end

---

[214] Niddesa: description, descriptive explanation, ; linguistics (Ñāṇamoli, 297).

The fourth approach is concerned with the identification of for the persons for whom the doctrine is intended. They are the devotees who may be categorised as listeners or readers (Ñāṇamoli, 20). They are located between the two extremes namely the View temperaments and the Craving temperaments. There are those who are corrupted by Craving (*taṇhā carita*) and those who are corrupted by their views or dogmas [215] (*diṭṭhi carita*) that are multiplied by 'dull' and 'sluggish' variations (Ñāṇamoli,15-16).

| **The Character** | **Basic Nature** | **Way of Progressing** | **Acquaintanceship** |
|---|---|---|---|
| Craving | Dull | Hard way | Sluggish |
| Craving | Intelligent | Hard way | Swift |
| View | Dull | Pleasant way | Sluggish |
| View | Intelligent | Pleasant way | Swift |

Those above categories of individuals are again sub- categorised into three in a descended order as below:

i) Those who realize the doctrine in the beginning, when it is Condensed (*ugghaṭitaññu )*

[215] False view or View (Varma, 65)

ii) Those who realize the doctrine in the middle, when it is Expanded (*vipañcitaññu*)

iii) Those who realize the doctrine in the end when it is Detailed (*ñeiya*)

Listeners/readers are different by virtue of their differing comprehending skills. The reasons for the differences in skill as well as those in acquiring Faith (saddhā) in the doctrine are given in a formula (Ñāṇamoli,16).

i) The one who realizes the doctrine, which is condensed, understands it by 'what is heard' (*sutamaya paññā*)

'What is heard' is embodies the qualities of inquiry (vimaṃsā), determination (ussāhana) assessment (tulanā), and scrutiny (upaparikkhā).

ii) The one who realizes the doctrine which is expanded, understands it by the Cognition of what has been heard (*mutamaya paññā*)

iii) The one who realizes the doctrine, which is detailed, understands it by the Mental Culturing[216] (*bhāvanāmaya paññā*)

The knowledge, gained through Mental Culture or *bhavanā*, is associated with attentiveness as well as the two kinds of realisations mentioned above (Ñāṇamoli, 16).

According to the fifth approach of the Mode, there are two ways of progressing towards Nibbāna. The dogmatic or the View- temperament attains Nibbāna by means of progress related to the profitable Root-term Quiet, while the

[216] *Bhāvanā:* Mental Culture (Varma, 35); keeping in being (Ñāṇamoli, 301); Mental Culture, producing, application (PED, 503); producing; increasing, developing, being devoted to, realizing, attaining; earnest consideration, meditation (CSCD).

other attains the same through Insight (Ñāṇamoli, 16). The Mode is incorporated with the 'Meaning Guidelines', 'the Conversion of Relishing' (*Nandiyāvatta*) and the 'Lion's Play' (*Sīhavikkhīḷita*).

### 2.3.2 *Vicaya hāra*, the Mode of an Investigation

*Vicaya hāra* (2) expounds what is to be examined in a Buddhist text in terms of 'grammatical aspects'. Four aspects are put forth with different parameters (Ñāṇamoli, 21). The intention of the Mode is to introduce the doctrinal interpretations at elemental levels. Thus, different structures, which are included in the source text, must be examined with the assistance of the categories given below.

i) Term, a question, an answer and consecutive sequences

ii) Six ways of teachings

iii) Paraphrasing verse/s

iv) All the factors in the 'Nine-fold questions of Investigation'[217]

The translator can identify the writing pattern of the source text with the help of these categories. For instance, the statement in the source text may be a single word or an explanation of a single word. Sometimes, the text is to be examined whether it is in the form of a question and/or an answer. However, the particular structure of the text must be clearly understood. There might be alternatives also. For instance, 'either one word or sometimes four phrases' would

[217] The same rendering, 'the nine-fold Thread of Argument,' by Ñāṇamoli (p.35) for *navavidha suttanta* cannot be used in this context because this set of nine questions is different from the former, and are the questions put to investigate the meaning of a passage further; nine-fold sutras: (Bond, Netti summary,407).

focus on 'one question which contains a single idea.' If so, the four different phrases must be answered by using four terms- the first by the first, the second by the second etc-. On such occasions, all the ideas must be finally linked up 'with the core meaning of the text' (Ñāṇamoli, 21-35).

Modes of teachings are the same six categories, enunciated in the first Mode and a formula of identifying them is in the counter demonstrative sub-section (Ñāṇamoli, 13-18).

The third section seeks to find out whether there is a teaching in the text in the form of verses. If so, those verses have to be properly paraphrased (*anugīti*)[218] and furnished with meaning as well as phrasing. No verses must be skipped without interpreting (Ñāṇamoli, 35).

The last category is broader than the other three as it demands an overall look at the text. The interpreter can identify all the ideas in the text putting them under the Nine-fold Questions of Investigation as stated below.

i) Does the text contain an original statement/ a statement of the Buddha
ii) Does the text contain a statement of an *Arahanta*
iii) Does the text stand elucidated already by itself
iv) Is the text yet to be made more explicit
v) Does the text deal with corruption (*saṅkilesa bhāgiya*)
vi) Does the text deal with morality *(vāsanābhāgiya*)
vii) Does the text deal with penetration *(nibbedhabhāgīya*)
viii) Does the text deal with Adept (*asekabhāgiya*)

[218] Summary or recapitulation: (DOP, 109).

ix) Where does the text meet the Four Noble Truths: in the beginning, the middle or at the end

Except the analysis, descriptions of concepts like the world, knowledge and skills are included.

### 2.3.3 *Yutti hāra*, the Mode of a Construing

*Yutti hāra* (3) assists in identifying the right and the wrong ways of construing a doctrine based on 'authority' (*mahāpadesa*). In other words, the interpretation must be compared with and approved by the authoritative formulas given by the Mode.

By tradition, the doctrine is interpreted as the word of the Buddha. Following a systematic and appropriate way, *Netti* defines the 'true' doctrine in terms of principle authorities or the four-fold enunciations: of the Buddha (*buddhāpadesa*); of the whole community of *Arahat* monks and nuns (*saṅghāpadesa*); of some of the *Arahat* monks and nuns (*sambahulāpadesa*); of a single *Arahat* monk or a nun (*ekattherāpadesa*) (Ñāṇamoli, 36). The doctrine intended for them is determined by the three basic criteria of *Sutta, Vinaya* and the *Dhammatā.* The *Sutta* denotes the Four Noble Truths while *Vinaya* means eradicating[219] lust, hatred and delusion. Dhammatā is the law of Dependent Origination (*Netti*:38). An acceptable interpretation or a translation must conform to these three criteria (Ñāṇamoli, 37).

[219] Out guiding, discipline (Ñāṇamoli, 303)

Therefore, the translator must recognize,

i) Where the ideas in the text are different in meaning and different in phrasing

ii) Whether the ideas have a single meaning though they are different in phrasing

The Mode finds appropriate ways of construing a canonical text, avoiding inapplicable interpretations (Ñāṇamoli, 38). The teachings must be conveyed recognising the degree of skilfulness of the target listener or reader (Ñāṇamoli, 41).

### 2.3.4 *Padaṭṭhāna hāra*, the Mode of Proximate Causes

*Padaṭṭāna hāra* (4) provides the proximate cause as a footing to explain the meaning of a text. The analysis is one of the fundamentals of interpretation theory in Buddhism. Proximate causes must be selected from the collection of eighteen Root-terms (*aṭṭhārasa mūlapadāni*). Those Root-terms have been divided into two groups, Profitable and Unprofitable.

| **Unprofitable Root-terms** | **Profitable Root- terms** |
|---|---|
| Craving<br>(*taṇhā*) | Quiet<br>(*samatha*) |
| Ignorance<br>(*avijjā*) | Insight<br>(*vipassanā*) |

| | |
|---|---|
| Greed<br>(*lobha*) | Non-Greed<br>(*alobha*) |
| Hate<br>(*dosa*) | Non-Hate<br>(*adosa*) |
| Delusion<br>(*moha*) | Non-Delusion (*amoha*) |
| Perception of Beauty<br>(*subha saññā*) | Perception of Ugliness<br>(*asubha saññā*) |
| Perception of Pleasure<br>(*sukha saññā*) | Perception of Pain (*dukkha saññā*) |
| Perception of Permanence<br>(*nicca saññā*) | Perception of Impermanence (*annicca saññā)* |
| Perception of Self<br>(*atta saññā*) | Perception of Selflessness (*anatta saññā*) |

Each Root-term is illustrated with its specific characteristics and the proximate cause. For example, Greed has a characteristic of aspiring while its proximate cause becomes the taking of what is not given (Ñāṇamoli, 45).

Correlating each idea to its proximate cause is a pattern of reasoning out, which makes the meaning clear. The interpreter must have a thorough knowledge of the features and functions of each Root-term to establish the necessary connection between the texts and the teachings.

## 2.3.5 *Lakkhaṇa hāra*, the Mode of Characteristics

*Lakkhaṇa hāra* (5) discusses the common characteristics, which can be related to a single idea. There may be occasions when a single idea is stated in a text, not displaying the characteristics of other ideas, which display characteristics similar to those of the former. On such occasions, explaining one idea is equivalent to explaining all of them (Ñāṇamoli, 51). For instance, when the eye is explained as impermanent, the other four sense-bases in the group - ear, tongue, nose, body, - also are to be understood as impermanent. The condition of the Mode is that it can be applied when a statement shares common characteristics.

## 2.3.6 *Catubyuha hāra*, the Mode of Four-fold Arrangement

*Catubyuha hāra,* (6), is an arrangement of four components with conjunctions for analyzing the meaning. It has four sub sections:

i) Grammatical Expositions (*nirutti*)
   (Nouns,[220] verbs, prepositions etc.)

ii) Intention- (*adhippāya*)

iii) Reason or the Source-(*nidhāna*)

iv) Consecutive-Sequences (*pubbāpara sandhi*)
   (Meaning, phrasing, teaching, demonstration)

The first section indicates the requirement of the knowledge of the language structure/s, to construe a meaningful interpretation or a translation. For instance, the translator must realize the meaning of a concept in both ways:

[220] The term, 'name' in translation is not tallied with the definition in Netti. Herein, it stresses how to construe the meaning by understanding the grammatical patterns of the language/s(Ñāṇamoli, 55).

grammatically and contextually. Then only can it be said that he is skilled in creating sentences and construing meanings (Ñāṇamoli, 55). Thus, the interpreter and the translator is expected to be skilled in using tenses, gender, and number. All regional languages too must be treated in this way (Ñāṇamoli, 55). The Mode especially is concerned with the process of translation to analyze 'regional languages' or other dialects (*janapada nirutti*).

The second component, the Intention, reveals the purpose of the utterance of a statement in a text. It may be seen in relation to the source of the text too. The third, the Source, means why a particular teaching is taught in that context. It reasons out by providing background knowledge to understand the meaning of the particular text.

The fourth, 'consecutive sequences,' shows the four ways of connection that the text has: with 'meaning,' with 'phrasing, with 'teaching' and with 'demonstration' in order to make the meaning clearer. The term 'meaning' denotes the 'six meaning terms' of explaining, displaying, divulging, analyzing, exhibiting, and describing. The phrasing category is the letter, term, phrasing, linguistic inflexion, demonstration and the mood. The Teaching sequence is related to the factors in the first Mode, as gratification, disappointment etc. (Netti:63).

The Demonstration sequence displays two types of teachings: that which lead to profitable directions (*kusala pakkha*); and that which teaches the unprofitable side (*akusala pakkha*). The interpreter/translator must learn the correct way of identifying and applying the teachings under a certain category.

## 2.3.7 *Āvatta hāra*, the Mode of Conversion

*Āvatta hāra* (7) provides an explanation of a word or a concept that is opposite to the one in the text. It reveals those aspects, which are not exemplified in the text. For instance, when a clarification is set forth on the profitable outcome of Concentration (samādhi), it is preferable that the unprofitable results of lack of concentration also are discussed. The opposite term in this context demands the meaning of its proximate causes. But all these should ultimately be incorporated with the main single idea, the four Noble Truths (Ñāṇamoli, 64-73).

## 2.3. 8. *Vibhatti hāra*, the Mode of Analysis

*Vibhatti hāra* (8) shows how to identify the intended meaning of a text by analysing the teachings under different structures and themes (*Netti*:8) based mainly on the target reader with his or her distinctive characteristics; the shared and none-shared ideas, and their footings.

The Threads have been divided into two groups, according to the characteristics of the listener/reader. They are the Threads, which are

i) Beneficial in leading a happy mundane life
ii) Applicable for conquering the conditional world

For example, the Threads, dealing with Morality (*vāsanābhāgiya sutta*) explain how an ordinary mortal who leads a happy mundane life can collect merits. The Threads that deal with Penetration or of conquering (nibbhedhabhāgiya sutta) discuss the principles of Higher Virtue (*adhisīla*). This second category is very

useful for the person who aims at renunciation from the mundane life in order to understand the paths to Extinction, the Nibbāna. (Ñāṇamoli, 74). According to the aspiration of the character, the Mode provides a formula of the ideas, that 'can be shared in common,' and those that 'cannot be shared in common' (Ñāṇamoli, 75-76). Thus, the translator must know how to differentiate teachings of the text to meet the needs of these two categories.

The Mode is ancillary to *Vichaya hāra* (2) and the *Yutti hāra* (3), therefore the analysis must follow the instructions given by them. The intended meaning, the six ways of teaching must be demonstrated following the Mode (2) and the meaning must be compared with and approved by one of the criteria prescribed by Mode (3) *Sutta, Vinaya* and *Dhammatā* (Mode 3).

### 2.3.9 *Parivattana hāra,* the Mode of Reversal

*Parivattana hāra* (9) assists in interpreting concepts in a way, which is opposite to the concepts in the text. Unlike *Āvatta hāra*, the condition is that the clarification or the explanation must be within the notion of the four 'Perversions' (*vipallāsa*). Ideas are divided into two groups: positive and negative. The former represents the profitable side and the latter the non-profitable. Four contrary aspects in the world - opposite to the definition of the Buddhist doctrine - have arisen from the dual assumptions. For example, the one who has reached the state of Non-returnee views *saṅkhāra* or the volitional-activities as impermanent while the ordinary mortals are immersed in the opposite, the idea of existence. Therefore, the four perversions of seeing: beauty in ugliness; pleasure in pain; permanenence in impermanence; self in selflessness are constructed by the false

view. To establish the right view, the Mode unfolds the opposite (Ñāṇamoli, 77-79).

### 2.3.10 *Vevacana hāra*, the Mode of Synonyms

*Vevacana hāra* (10) explains how to arrange synonyms in the process of interpretation or translation. The function of the Mode is limited to a single idea put forth by means of many synonyms (Ñāṇamoli, 79). A Glossary of synonyms with their contextual meanings has been provided in the text. The Mode makes the reader learn the doctrine with the assistance of various synonyms. Secondly, it facilitates the interpreter to make clear complex and collective concepts like the 'Buddha,' '*saṅkhāra*,' and 'Nibbāna' with their contextual meanings (Ñāṇamoli, 79-84).

### 2.3.11 *Paññatti hāra,* the Mode of Concepts

*Paññatti hāra* (11) is defined in *Netti* as 'any teaching by explanatory talk about the four Noble Truths (Ñāṇamoli, 84). It is a type of designation in terms of 'Presentation' (Ñāṇamoli, 86). Here the presentation denotes 'guided or intended by the Buddha' (Ñāṇamoli, 86). The Mode explains the Four Noble Truths with the assistance of metaphorical terms, which express more than one idea at a time. It illustrates how many ideas can be applied to describe and explain a single word or a phrase in a text.

In a broad sense the whole teachings of the Buddha are preached on the Four Noble Truths. [221] Herein, '*paññatti*' are the direct descriptions of the Four Noble Truths. Examples of the passages on the Four Truths are illustrated in the *Netti* (Ñāṇamoli, 84-92).

## 2.3.12 *Otaraṇa hāra*, the Mode of 'Ways of Entry'

*Otaraṇa hāra* (12) explains how one can cross successfully the ocean of the cycle of births and rebirths. The relevant principles are to be discussed within the parameters of the Form element (*rūpa dhātu*) and the Formless element (*arūpa dhātu*). The Mode demonstrates how a single idea can be interpreted under five categories, each of which has a specific style or method of construing.

The translator can discuss one of the five factors: The law of Dependent Origination, Controlling Faculty named Wisdom (*paññindriya*),[222]Aggregates *(khanda),*[223] Elements (*dhātu*)[224] and Bases (*āyatana*). The ways of accessing are demonstrated in the *Netti* (Ñāṇamoli, 93-100).

---

[221] *yā pakatikatāya desanā ayam nikkhepa paññatti, kā cha pakatikathāya desanā: chattarō sacchāni* (Netti, 86).

[222] (Netti,96); (Varma,122).

[223]Khandha: aggregates (Varma, 94); categories (Ñāṇamoli, 294). Rūpa, vedanā, saññā, saṅkhāra, citta.(Materiality, Feeling, Perception, Volition or mental activities, Consciousness) (Varma, 94)

[224] Dhātu or Elements are eighteen in number. (Varma, 65)

## 2.3.13 *Sodhana hāra*, the Mode of Clearing

*Sodhana hāra* (13) interprets the subject matter of a text especially when the text is in the Mode of a question, seeking an answer. Wherever the instigation (*ārambha*) of a passage or a text is cleared up[225] the main question is answered in this way. As well, wherever the instigation is not cleared up by the text itself, the question must be considered as 'yet to be answered' (Ñāṇamoli, 103).

The purpose of the Mode is to distinguish the initiative idea of a discourse from the ideas, which are verbally asked (Ñāṇamoli, l). Answering thus, does not mean to address a mere question in a text, but to recognise profoundly the initiation of it (Ñāṇamoli,100-103).

## 2.3.14 *Adhiṭṭhāna hāra*, the Mode of Terms of Expressions

*Adhiṭṭhāna hāra* (14) deals with the requirement of alternative terms for expressing meaning with the assistance of the concepts of the Unity (*ekatthatā*) and Diversity (*vemattatā*). Ideas must be treated as they appear in the text as in unity or in diversity (Ñāṇamoli, 103). In other words, an idea, which is explained by a general word must not be interpreted and /or translated by specific terms. A single idea can be represented by several meanings (metaphoric). However, the intended meaning or the core idea of a text must remain unaffected by the interpretation (Ñāṇamoli, li). Definitions are given as examples for the Four Noble Truths. This Mode is opposite to Mode (11).

[225] Instigation (Ñāṇamoli,103)

## 2.3.15 *Parikkhāra hāra*, the Mode of Requisites

*Parikkhāra hāra* (15) examines the 'generative' features (*janaka lakkhano*) of a concept as its effect. According to the Mode, 'any idea that generates another idea is a requisite of the previous idea' (Ñāṇamoli, 109). The characteristic of the requisite is generative. Two kinds of phenomenon are generated namely a Cause (*hetu*) and Condition[226] (*pacchaya*). The Cause has the characteristics of 'not being shared in common' while the Effect has the nature of 'being shared in common.' The Cause and Effect do not exist simultaneously but are consecutive. Definitions and descriptions are provided on the various concepts regarding the relation (Ñāṇamoli, 109-114).

## 2.3.16 *Samāropaṇa hāra,* the Mode of a Co-ordination

*Samāropaṇa hāra* (16), organizes different entries or ideas with many reasons or footings. As the *Āvatta hāra* (7) deals with one idea providing one reason, this Mode also deals with many ideas furnishing several reasons. The coordination is of four types,

i) The Proximate cause
ii) Synonymy
iii) Techniques of Mental Culture
iv) Abandoning

[226] Condition (Ñāṇamoli, 298); relation (Varma, 110).

These four factors have a hierarchical order in illustrating and clarifying the Buddha's teachings. The co-ordination of Footing (*padaṭṭhana*) is to provide the proximate cause for each main idea of the text. The second section coordinates the process by applying synonyms. The third one teaches the method of the Mental Culture, which leads towards the four foundations of Mindfulness (*catu satipaṭṭāna*). The fourth stage instructs the way of abandoning the bondages of the four Perversions with the help of the four foundations of Mindfulness. This is the path to realisation of the true doctrine (Ñāṇamoli, 117).

All the sixteen Modes of conveying meaning have two functions: individual and mutual (Ñāṇamoli, xlvii). Modes have an individual function of designing the text differently towards the purpose or the goal of attaining Nibbāna. Subsequently, the twelve meaning and phrasing terms of Mode (1) and the three criteria of *sutta, vinaya, dhammatā* in Mode (3) are reciprocal to all the Modes. The Mode of Proximate cause (*padaṭṭāna*) and the aspect called Connectivity (*pubāparasandhi*) are integrated with Modes (4) and (13) respectively. They too are involved in all the other Modes both directly and indirectly since no concept of Buddhism would be meaningful without a proximate cause and its connectivity.

Ideas included in Modes (1), (2) and (3) are applicable to any type of textual interpretation and translation.

## 2.4 Five Guidelines

Five Guidelines are combined with the sixteen Modes (Ñāṇamoli,:119-147) so as to convey the meaning of a text. Two phrasing Guidelines design the structure of an interpretation while the three meaning Guidelines decide the content. Meaning Guidelines illustrate possible paradigms, where the meaning of the doctrine can be dealt with. They act as different as well as alternative Models of explications. Phrasing Guidelines help the translator to select the subject matter from meaning Guidelines.

The interpreter/translator is advised to have a thorough knowledge of doctrinal concepts since ambiguity may cause mis-interpretations. Therefore, conceptual requirements are duly clarified by the Guidelines in *Netti* with definitions, descriptions and examples. Those descriptions and formulas can be selected according to the need of the target reader. The five Guidelines are stated below, following the same order of *Netti*.

### 2.4.1. *Nandiyāvatta Naya* or the Conversion of Relishing

The Pali term '*nandi*' stands for the 'sensual pleasure' [227] and the meaning of the metaphor, *Nandiyāvatta*, stands for the circle, which is created by the sensual pleasure. The term '*vattati*' means 'turning.' The noun, '*vatta*' means a turning whorl[228] or a vortex. It has several meanings depending on the context in which it is used, and the shape it assumes. It is fearful in nature and one can hardly come out of it, once one is drawn into it. Similarly, sensual pleasures are fearful and not easy to give up.

---

[227] *Nandi*:'desire for sensual pleasure' (PED, 306).
[228] (PED, 598).

The Guideline *Nandiyāvatta* describes how 'Ignorance as hindrance' and 'Craving as the fetter' shapes two types of temperaments or the characters called the View-temperament and Craving-temperament. The discussion has two aspects: Corruptible and [229] (*saṅkilesa*) and Cleansings (*vodana*). Under the head of Corruption, the Guideline dwells on four factors.

i) How those two characters seek happiness outside the path of Buddhism
ii) Reasons for such behaviour
iii) The characteristics of Corruption and Cleansing as the remedy
iv) Their ways of progress on the Buddhist path

The negative behaviour, common to the humankind are totally based on the attribute of Corruption. Those who are corrupted by View, pursue self-torment while the ones corrupted by Craving search sensual pleasure.

The basic reason for their misbehaviour is their lack of ignorance of definitions and explanations relating to the Four Noble Truths as also of the skills in acquiring Quiet and Insight, besides the Buddhist teachings (Ñāṇamoli, 148).

However, such characters can be cleansed by the Buddhist way of progressing (Ñāṇamoli, 149-151). The following chart out will make the arrangement cleare.

[229] (Varma, 65); Corruption (Ñāṇamoli,304).

| **Corrupting Side** | | |
|---|---|---|
| | **Character I** | **Character II** |
| **Root-cause** | Ignorance | Craving |
| **Obstructed by:** | Hindrance (*nīvaraṇa*) | Fetters (*saṃyojana*) |
| **Nature of the Character** | View- temperament (*diṭṭhi carita*) | Craving-temperament (*taṇhā charita*) |
| **Preferable Path** | Self-torment (*atthakilamatānuyoga*) | Sensual pleasure (*kāmasukhallikānuyoga*) |
| **Perception** | Materiality as the Self (*rūpa saññā*) | Mentality as the Self (*ātma saññā*) |
| **Characteristics of View** | Embodiment Views (*sakkāya diṭṭhi*) | |
| **Manifestation of Viewer** | Annihilationist (*uccedavādi*) | Eternalist (*sassatavādi*) |
| Total of the 'wrong views' (*miccā diṭṭhi)*: Sixty-two | | |

There are different treatments for these two types of characters once they choose the Buddhist path towards happiness (Ñāṇamoli, 150-152).

| **Cleansing Side** | | |
|---|---|---|
| | **Character I** | **Character II** |
| **Nature of the Character** | View-temperament | Craving- temperament |
| **Appropriate Training** | Effacement (*salḷekha*) | Training by Four Virtues (*catu pārisuddha sīla*) |
| **Reason for Selecting This particular training** | Follower by wisdom (*paññādhika*) | Follower by Faith (*saddhādhika*) |
| **Cleansing Respective Root by:** | Quietness (*samatha*) | Insight (*vipasssanā*) |
| Cleansing 'Embodiment View' (*miccādiṭṭhi*) by 'Right View' (*sammā diṭṭhi*) | | |
| Cleansing the two extreme views by the Middle path (*majjimā paṭipadā*) | | |
| **Way of Progressing** | Pleasant way | Hard way |
| Cleansing the 62 'wrong-views' by teaching 43 'right views' | | |

The interpreter / translator thus know in advance, how to posit teachings according to the characters. Further, *Netti* discusses all the factors in terms of Four Noble Truths (Ñāṇamoli, 149).

| Cause | Truths | Effect |
|---|---|---|
| Defilements | The First Truth | Sufferings |
| Craving | The Second Truth | The Origin/Root-cause |
| Cessation of Craving | The Third Truth | Cessation of Origin |
| Quiet and Insight | The Fourth Truth | Path for Cessation of Origin |

Finally, the progress of those personalities along the Buddhist path is described. The two, the View-temperament and Craving-temperament have been multiplied according to the keenness of their intellect. The progress on the way to Nibbana becomes slow and sluggish (*dandhābhiññā*) for the people, who have blunt faculties (*mudindriya*). The progress is quick for the people who have keen faculties (*tikkhindriya*). Therefore, those who are superior due to their views, their desires and the high levels of their intelligence are freed from the vortex of sensual pleasure through four ways:

i) The pleasant way with a sluggish acquaintanceship (*sukha paṭipadā dandhābhiññā*)

ii) The pleasant way with a swift acquaintanceship (*sukha paṭipadā khippābiññā*)

iii) The 'hard or difficult way with a sluggish acquaintanceship (*dukkhā paṭipadā dandhābhiññā*)

iv) The hard or difficult way with a swift acquaintanceship (*dukkhā paṭipadā khippābiññā*)

This analysis of the 'whirlpool of sensual pleasure' is called the Conversion of relishing or the *Nandiāvatta naya*.

## 2.4.2. *Disālocana Naya* or the 'Plotting of Directions'

The first phrasing Guideline, *Disālocana*, The 'Plotting of Directions' puts forth appropriate ideas in terms of the profitable Root-terms (*kusala mūla*) and the unprofitable Root-terms (*akusala mūla*) (Ñāṇamoli, 159). Seeking the proper direction itself is called 'Plotting of Directions (*Netti*:10; Ñāṇamoli, 11).

The Guideline demonstrates how to plot out the fundamental ideas incorporated in the three meaning Guidelines. For this, instructions are provided as under:

i) How to organise the ideas in the first Guideline by using different clarifications

ii) How to broaden those ideas, linking them up with certain concepts

Two approaches, the unprofitable side of the Root terms and the cleansing side of them are described with appropriate examples. First, the unprofitable side is clarified in terms of the four Perversions. They are made of six kinds of components:

i) The ten grounds of immorality

ii) Their ways of progressing

iii) Identification of unprofitable Root-terms in personalities

iv) The ways of their progressing through Root-terms

v) Four unprofitable directions

vi) Their ways of progressing through different pathways

As the first step, the ten grounds of Immoralities (*dasavatthuka kilesa puñja*) are described according to the four perversions of 'seeing:'

i) Seeing Ugliness as beauty (*asubhe subha saññā*)

ii) Seeing Pain as pleasure (*dukkhe sukha saññā*)

iii) Seeing Impermanence as permanence (*anicce nicca saññā*)

iv) Seeing Non-self as Self (*anatte nicca saññā*)

Each ground has four parts and they represent each pervasion respectively. The total number of factors is forty (Ñāṇamoli, 153).

The second step is the depiction of the ten unprofitable Root-terms of four perversions in two types of personalities. The two personalities are those with the craving-temperaments and those with the lust-temperaments. The first two parts of each immoral ground are the characteristics of the 'craving temperaments'. For example, they have the characteristics of 'physical,' and 'contact' from the first ground and 'beauty' and 'pleasure' from the second ground and so on. The last two parts of the four like 'choice' and 'consciousness' from the first ground and 'permanence' and the 'self' from the second ground etc. are the characteristics of the 'view-temperament.'

The third step is the introduction of these basic characteristics, which are derived from the four perversions' (Ñāṇamoli, 157).

The fourth step is the definition of four directions. Directions are based on a classification of four Perversions, which are introduced by the third step. An analysis is given below as a combination of the third and the fourth steps in order to clarify the idea.

i) The first direction,

All the first parts of the ten immoral grounds, derived from the first perversion,

(Viewing Ugliness as Beauty),

ii) The second direction

All the second parts of the ten immoral grounds, derived from the second perversion,

(Viewing Pain as Pleasure),

iii) The third direction,

All the third parts of the ten immoral grounds, derived from the third perversions

(Viewing Impermanence as Permanence)

iv) The fourth direction,

All fourth parts of the ten immoral grounds, derived from the fourth perversion,

(Viewing Selflessness as Self)

Each direction deals with each of the ten Threads, which are similar in meaning though different in phrasing.

The fifth step is the analysis of the four types of personalities in terms of the four directions of the unprofitable side. The four directions are considered 'Imperfections' (*upakkilesa*) for four types of persons. For instance, the first, the second, the third and the fourth directions are imperfections to the people of 'lust-temperament', 'hate-temperament; 'dull-view temperament' and the 'intelligent-view-temperament' respectively (Ñāṇamoli, 159 ).

The sixth step identifies the appropriate ways of renunciation for the four personalities who are corrupted by the ten immoral grounds. After embracing the Buddhist teachings, they would renounce the conditional world through three types of gateways. These gateways are considered medicines or remedy for those who have been subjected to the ten immoral grounds.

i) The channel[230] of 'Disposition-less' (*appaṇihita vimokkha mukha*)
(The hard or difficult way with a sluggish acquaintanceship &
the hard or difficult way with a swift acquaintanceship)
(For the characters who have been corrupted by the first and the second parts of the ten immoral grounds)

ii) The channel of 'Void' (*suññata vimokkha mukha*)
(The pleasant way with a sluggish acquaintanceship)
(For the characters who have been corrupted by the third parts of the ten immoral grounds)

iii) The channel of 'Sign-lessness' (*animitta vimokkha mukha*)
(The pleasant way with a swift acquaintanceship)
(For the characters who have been corrupted by the fourth parts of the ten Immoral grounds)

This is the way for purifying human behaviour, which has been shaped by the unprofitable side by following the perverted views of worldly life (*sansāra vaṭṭa*) (Ñāṇamoli, 154-160).

[230] (Varma, 160); gate way (Ñāṇamoli, 303)

The analysis of the 'profitable side' too follows the same pattern, as followed for the unprofitable side. These are the paths to 'renunciation from the world' (*vivaṭṭa*) (Ñāṇamoli, 160):

i) Ten grounds of morality,
ii) Their ways of Progressing,
iii) Application of profitable Root-terms for different personalities,
iv) The ways of their Progressing,
v) Four profitable directions,
vi) Three channels for the characters

In the profitable side, the ten 'moral grounds' are described in terms of four successful 'ways' (paṭipadā) (Ñāṇamoli,160 ). Each moral ground consists of four parts representing 'successful ways' and their total number is forty (Ñāṇamoli, 161).

The first step is analyzing the ten moral grounds within the framework of the four successful ways. Examples are given below in order to clarify the ways and their presentations.

| **Ten Moral Grounds** | **Successful Ways** 1 2 3 4 | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Four Ways** | First way | Second way | Third way | Fourth way |
| **Four Foundations of Mindfulness** | Physical states | Feeling | Consciousness | Dhamma |

| **Four Plains (*jhāna*)** | First | Second | Third | Fourth |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Four Dwellings (*vihāra*)** | Heavenly (*deva*) | Divine (*brahma*) | Noble (*ariya*) | Imperturbable (*āneñja*) |

The second step is the clarification of the correlating parts of the ten moral grounds with each other on their way to progress. The first way corresponds to the first mindfulness, the second way to the second mindfulness, the third way to the third mindfulness and so on. The pattern can be illustrated through numbering.

| The ten moral grounds | Ways of progressing |
|---|---|
| 1 | 1 2 3 4 |
| 2 | 1 2 3 4 |
| 3 | 1 2 3 4 |
| 4 | 1 2 3 4 |

The first part of the first ground corresponds to the first part of the second ground. Similarly the first part of the second ground corresponds to the first part of the third ground and so on. Other parts too follow the same pattern.

The third step is the introduction of these basic characteristics which are derived from the four successful ways (Ñāṇamoli, 162).

The fourth step is the definition of the four profitable directions. Directions are based on a classification of the four ways which are introduced by the third step. Thus, they can be analyzed as a combination of the third and the fourth steps in order to clarify the idea.

i) The first direction

All the first parts of the ten moral grounds, derived from the first successful way

ii) The second direction

All the second parts of the ten moral grounds, derived from the second successful way

iii) The third direction

All the third parts of the ten moral grounds, derived from the third successful way

iv) The fourth direction

All the fourth parts of the ten moral grounds, derived as a result of the fourth successful way

The fifth step is connecting these four directions to the four personalities who practise the ten moralities. Each of these four profitable directions functions to 'perfect personalities' of lust-temperament, hating- temperament, dull view-temperament and intelligent view-temperament respectively (Ñāṇamoli, 164-165). Once they start practising these techniques, they would gradually give up the worldly life and attain Nibbāna through the three channels:

i) The channel of 'Disposition-less'

(Persons who have been cleansed by practising the first and the second parts of the ten moral grounds)

ii) The channel of 'Sign-less'

(Persons who have been cleansed by following the third parts of the ten moral grounds)

iii) The channel of 'Void'

(People who have been cleansed by following the fourth parts of the ten moral grounds)

This is the way to analyze the profitable behaviours, which have been cleansed by practising the four successful ways. It decides how to direct and convey the ideas of the three meaning Guidelines recommended in conjunction with the second phrasing Guideline, the Hook.

### 2.4.3 *Sīhavikkhīḷita Naya* or the Guideline of Lion's Play

The Pali term, *sīha* refers to 'a lion' and *vikkhiḷita* stands for the 'play.' Lions according to the *Netti* are the Buddha, the Hermit Enlightened one (*Paccheka Buddha*) and the *Arahant*as who have overcome lust, hate and delusion (Ñāṇamoli, 166).

The Guideline describes how such persons deal with two kinds of phenomenon,

i) The cleansing side and its four faculties (*indriyabhūmi*)

ii) The unprofitable side and its four perversions (*vipallāsa*)

'Play' in this context denotes their behaviour. They display the cleansing side, which exhibit the power of Faith, Energy, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom. The cleansing side is depicted by the formulae of four progressive ways. The opposite is the unprofitable side, which the ordinary human beings entertain. The

unprofitable side is therefore, depicted by the formulae of four Nutrients. [231] (Ñāṇamoli, 166 ).

| **Cleansing Side** | **Unprofitable Side** |
|---|---|
| Four Foundations of Mindfulness | Four Perversions |
| Four 'Meditations' (*jñana*) | Four 'Assumptions' (*upādāna*) |
| Four 'Dwellings' (*vihāra*) | Four 'Bonds' (*yoga*) |
| Four 'Right Endeavours' (*sammappadhāna*) | Four Ties (*ganṭha*) |
| Four 'Wonderful Marvellous Ideas' (*accariya abbhūta dhamma*) | Four Cankers[232] 'Taints' (*āsava*) |
| Four 'Expressions' (*adhiṭṭānāni*) | Four 'Floods' (*ogha*) |
| Four Ways of 'Meditation' or 'Culture' (*samādhi bhāvanā*) | Four Barbs (*saḷḷa*) |
| Four Ways of Consciousness (*viññānatthiti*) | Four Ideas Dealing with Pleasure (*catu sukhabhāgiya dhamma*) |
| Four 'Measure-less States' (*catu appamāṇa dhamma*) | Four Paths to the 'Bad Way' (*catu agatigamana*) |

[231] Nutriments, (Ñāṇamoli, 166 ), The translation of the Guide of 'there are four nutriments : their opposite are the four ways' does not provide a clear meaning.
[232] *Āsava*: cankers (Varma, 33); taint (Ñāṇamoli, 292).

The 'Plotting of Directions directs the translator to select the appropriate description according to the formulae. That way those two Guidelines are employed together to clarify the meaning.

### 2.4.4 *Tipukkhala Naya* or the Trefoil

*Tipukkhala*, the Trefoil, the third meaning Guideline describes the doctrine by connecting with the second phrasing Guideline *Aṅkusa*, the Hook (Ñāṇamoli, 171-172). The Guideline clarifies two main factors:

i) Root-terms

ii) Different personalities or characters

Root-terms are clarified, footing them on the Four Noble Truths. Their three phases are to be analyzed thus: Root-term 'as they are' (*bhūta*); the reality of Root-terms (*tathathā*); Root-terms as 'neither real nor un- real' (*avitathatā*)[233] (Ñāṇamoli, 10). Root-terms can be connected with the ideas in a text in two ways: the unprofitable Root-terms to unprofitable ideas; the profitable Root-terms to cleansing ideas.

The corruption and the cleansing sides of the four characters, which are already classified in the Guideline and the 'Plotting of Directions' are illustrated herein too. They are reduced first to three personalities and then to two. Thus, there are three steps in the process.

As the first step, the four types of persons, who renounce the world by the four progressing ways, are reduced into three according to their ways of progressing towards the path to Nibbāna.

---

[233] *avitathatā*: not unreal (Ñāṇamoli,10)

i) *Ugghaṭitaññu*

By the pleasant way with a swift acquaintanceship

ii) *Vipañcitaññu*

By the difficult way with a swift acquaintanceship

& by the pleasant way with a sluggish acquaintanceship

iii) Ñeiya

By the difficult way with a sluggish acquaintanceship

The appropriate methods of teaching the three types of personalities have been set forth in *Netti* as listed below.

| **Relative Factors** | **First Person** | **Second Person** | **Third Person** |
|---|---|---|---|
| Main Theme of the 'Disclosure' | Quiet | Quiet and Insight | Insight |
| Type of the Inherent Faculty | Blunt | Blunt and Keen | Keen |
| Style of the Discourse | Brief | Brief and Detailed | Detailed |
| Mode of Teaching | Escape | Escape and Disappointment | Gratification Disappointment Escape |
| Type of Training | Higher Cognition | Higher Cognition and Higher Virtue | Higher Virtue |

Their corrupting and the cleansing sides are illustrated by twelve tetrads.

Finally, these three types of persons are reduced into two groups of 'view-temperaments' and 'lust- temperaments' as mentioned in the Mode one. Each character is corrupted by twelve ways. They are described as defilements by fifteen dyads. Eighteen methods are prescribed for each character to clean the Corruptions (Ñāṇamoli, 169-70).

The classification guides the interpreter / translator to understand and select the appropriate methods and not to mix up the characteristics while putting forth the description and choosing the Mode of teaching.

### 2.4.5 *Aṅkusa Naya* or the Hook

The Hook guides in producing and classifying ideas as profitable and unprofitable, after deciding the proper position of an idea with the help of 'Plotting of Directions' (Ñāṇamoli, 11). It is described along with the Trefoil but has no separate explanation. The function of the Guideline is said to be a hook in three ways (Ñāṇamoli, xliii):

i) It is combined with the three meaning Guidelines
ii) It collectively guides the ideas and plots them
iii) It guides and organizes together on the two sides of profitable and unprofitable

However, the Guideline acts parallel with the 'Plotting of Directions' as well as consecutively. All the Guidelines finally are combined with the aim of preserving the Buddhist doctrine by clarifying, directing and demarcating.

## 2.5. Description of the Root-terms or Reasons

*Netti* sets forth the eighteen Root-terms, their characteristics and the function in its last chapter, the 'Patterns of Dispensation' (*naya samuhṭṭhāna*).[234] It consists of three divisions as stated below.

i) Classification of Threads
ii) Classification of the eighteen Root-terms
iii) The discussion

In the first division, the Threads, which belong to the 'Nine-fold Divisions of Dispensation,' have been classified into two main categories. The first category consists of the first sixteen groups of Threads, according to their main idea or the Instigation (Ñāṇamoli, 173-174). They have two different functions: one as individual and the other as a combination.

(A) 1 Threads[235] dealing with Corruption[236] (*saṅkilesabhāgiya sutta*)
(B) 2 Threads dealing with Morality[237] (*vāsanābhāgiya sutta*)
(C) 3 Threads dealing with Penetration (*nibbhedabhāgiya sutta*),
(D) 4 Threads dealing with Adept (*asekhabhāgiya sutta*)
(AB) 5 Threads dealing with Corruption and Morality
(*saṅkilesabhāgiya sutta* and *vāsanābhāgiya sutta*)),

[234] Setting out of Dispensation (Bond. Netti Summary, 413)
[235] Passages ((Bond, Netti Summary, 414).
[236] Defilement (Bond, Netti Summary, 414).
[237] Living in *saṃsāra* (Bond, Netti Summary, 414).

(AC) 6 Threads dealing with corruption and penetration
(*saṅkilesabhāgiya sutta* and *nibbhedabhāgiya* sutta),

(AD) 7 Threads dealing with corruption and Adept
(*saṅkilesabhāgiya sutta* and *asekhabhāgiya* sutta)

(ACD)8 Threads dealing with corruption, penetration and Adept
(*saṅkilesabhāgiya*, *nibbhedabhāgiya* and *asekhabhāgiya* sutta),

(ABC) 9 Threads dealing with corruption, morality and penetration
(*saṅkilesabhāgiya*, *vāsanābhāgiya* and *asekhabhāgiya* sutta)

(BC) 10 Threads dealing with morality and penetration
(*vāsanābhāgiya sutta* and *nibbhedabhāgiya sutta*)

(A1) 11 Threads dealing with Corruption by Craving[238]
(*taṇhā saṅkilesabhāgiya sutta* )

(A2) 12 Threads dealing with Corruption by View
(*diṭṭhi saṅkilesabhāgiya sutta* sutta)

(A3) 13 Threads dealing with corruption by wrong conduct[239]
( *duccarita saṅkilesabhāgiya sutta* )

(B-D1)14 Thread dealing with cleansing from craving
(*taṇhā vodānabhāgiya sutta*)

(B-D2)15 Thread dealing with cleansing from view
(*diṭṭhi vodānabhāgiya sutta*)

The 1st, 11th, 12th and 13th types deal with the unprofitable Root-terms, while the 2nd, 3rd, 4th, 14th, 15th and 16th display the profitable Root-terms. The 5th, 6th, 7th, 8th, 9th and 10th types have a combination of both. Illustrative quotations

[238] Desire (Bond, Netti Summary, 414).
[239] Misconduct (Ñāṇamoli, 296).

from the Tipiṭaka have been provided for each type of Thread (Ñāṇamoli, 73-213).

The second category classifies the main themes of Threads, uniting them with the Root-terms. It has ten different categories. Nine of them are triads. Each type displays two extreme ideas and the third part of it is a combination of both ideas. For instance, the first category includes three aspects: Threads belonging to the worldly aspects; Threads disjoined from the worldly aspects; Threads belonging to the worldly as well as those disjoined from worldly aspects. The tenth category has only one section, which is dedicated to the Threads of admiring the greatness of enlightened ones (Ñāṇamoli, 213-244).

The discussion clarifies two main ideas regarding the whole method in *Netti.*

i) Correlating the entire Threads in the Tipiṭaka under the head of Root-terms

ii) Instructing the employment of Threads on a vast group

Threads included in the two groups discussed above are united herein due to similarities as well as the contraries. Example for similarities:

| **Second Category** | **First Category** |
|---|---|
| Threads belonging to the subject of the material world (1-A) | Threads dealing with Corruption (A-1) |
| | Threads dealing with Morality (A-2) |

| | |
|---|---|
| Threads dissociated from the material world (1-B) | Threads dealing with Penetration (C-3) |
| | Threads dealing with Adept (D-4) |

Threads counteract with each other in two ways: within the same group; in between the two groups. Those two groups of Threads have three functions: individual, combined and alternative. Individual function is the direct relationship between Threads and the Root-terms. Combined function is the mutual relationship between the two groups of the Threads. The application is alternative as the options are more. That way all the Threads of Tipiṭaka have been categorized, placing them on one or more footings of Root-terms. Further, it displays how to analyse each passage of a canonical work with the assistance of Root-terms.

Possible options of such combinations facilitate the interpreter to select various suitable passages as examples. At the end of the text, three types of Threads are selected for the demonstration, applying them on thirty-six types of persons. (Ñāṇamoli, 244-245).

## 2.6 Summary of the Text

The methodology of *Netti* encourages the translator and interpreter to produce different types of explanations but within the prescribed structure. The intention of limitations is to prevent the interpreter or the translator from overinterpreting as well as misinterpreting.

The content of the text can be summarized in terms of three components, which assists the interpreter and the translator.

i) Phrasing category
ii) Meaning category
iii) Readership category

Phrasing category includes the sixteen Modes, the two Guidelines of the 'Plotting of Directions' and the 'Hook' and the six phrasing terms that construct the outline of the production. The well-placed structure of phrasing has been included in the text to avoid ill-placed formations.

Meaning category develops the content of a translation with the assistance of six ways of expressing meaning, three meaning Guidelines, definitions on Root-term terms and types of the threads. All subject matters and verifications along with their quotations come under this category. The translator must stick to the clarifications and is not permitted to interpret a text excluding them.

Readership category assists the interpreter and /or translator to identify the characteristics of different types of personalities, their views and ways of instruction or teachings, functions of the unprofitable Root-terms, cleansing grounds and their ways of progressing towards Nibbāna.

Different types of definitions and categories in the text on the same theme may mislead the interpreter/translator to leave them as irrelevant repetitions. *Netti* reasons out the various ways of descriptions based on unity and diversity. Thus, 'their meaning is one but only the phrasing is different' (*Netti*:176; Ñāṇamoli, 164). Therein, the *Netti* demonstrates how the message of the Buddha can be transmitted in various aspects within the system that the Master accepted.

The method can be applied on any individual passage of a text or to any full canonical text in Tipiṭaka. *Netti* consists of Interpretation and Translation consecutively, or simultaneously.

In our understanding, the *Netti* intend to provide Guidelines for interpreting and translating Buddhist texts. In a way, the methods illustrated in *Netti* provide certain freedom of interpretation for both the translator and interpreter. However, there are limits of interpretation too set by *Netti*, so that the interpreter would not go beyond and violate the original.

**Chapter Three**

# Nibbāna as the Final Goal of Women in Therigāthā

## 3.1 Introduction

*Therigāthā* (*Thig*) is the earliest known anthology of women's literature in India certainly, but possibly anywhere in the world.[240] It belongs to the *Khuddaka Nikāya*, the last, out of the five *Nikāyas* of the *Sutta Pitaka*. The discourses included in the *Sutta Pitaka* are considered to be the original sayings of the Buddha and hence the most authentic sources of the *dhamma*.[241] *Khuddaka* means 'smaller' with reference to the other *Nikāyas* or sections and includes the sayings of the Buddha which were not included in the first four *Nikāyas*.[242] It is a collection of sixteen texts[243] which contain the most important works of Buddhist poetry. *Thig* is the ninth of them.

*Thig* contains 522 verses which are attributed to the Buddhist *arahat* nuns, who were contemporaneous with the Buddha.[244] A brief survey of the factors leading to the establishment of the *bhikkhuni sāsana* or the Buddhist nunnery would be helpful in understanding who the Buddhist nuns were.

Women's participation in religious activities does not figure prominently in Indian history, due to the biased attitudes of the majority or the prejudices of the male-oriented society or perhaps due to both.

---

[240] Susie Tharu, 65.
[241] (PED, 279).
[242] (PED, 521).
[243] *Khuddakhapāṭa, Dhammapada, Udāna, Itiuttaka, Sutta Nipāta, Vimānavattu, Petavattu, Theragāthā, Therigāthā, Jātaka, Mahāniddesa, Cullaniddesa, Patisambhidāmagga, Apadāna, Buddhavaṃsa and Chariyā-pitaka.*
[244] (PED, 527).

Hinduism was the dominant religion in India during the advent of Buddhism in the sixth century BC. According to Hindu theology, the first creation is Manu, the primordial man. All creations after him, both women and non-human creatures were considered as secondary. The belief that 'a son only could perform the final rites of one's ancestors' was a major factor that marginalized women.[245] The *Atharvan Veda* prescribes special mantras to be chanted and rites to be performed for obtaining a male child. A medicinal powder strewn into the nostrils of a pregnant woman was said to make the embryo grow into a male child.[246] These are all clear examples of the societal bias in favour of the male progeny. This gender discrimination seems to have had a major impact on the mental make-up of both men and women. According to the *Manusmriti*, women could hardly be independent at any time of their lives.[247]

As the member of a family, she enjoyed no rights or privileges, and seldom was she a part of the religious groupings either. She could not be an active participant in any religious performances. Abject obedience to the husband was touted to earn her an exalted status in heaven. They were not allowed to study the Vedas and chant the mantras.[248] The galore of prohibitive prescriptions naturally led to sufferings and frustrations, as seen in their self expressions in the *Thig*.

Jainism, the doctrine propagated by Mahāveera who lived years before the Buddha, acknowledged women's right to freedom, both mental and physical. *Ahimsā,* or non-violence was the core principle of Jainism. Out of the two sects of Jainism, the Digambarā sect admitted the potential of women to attain Moksha,

---

[245] Radhaksishnan, chapter 5, 'The Laws of Manu.'189.
[246] H. Oldenberg, The Religion of The Veda, (Delhi: MB, 1916) 24.
[247] 'By a girl, by a young woman, or even by an aged woman, nothing must be done independently even in her own house. Her father protects her in childhood, her husband in her youth and her sons protect her in old age; a woman is never fit for independence.' Radhakrishnan, 189.
[248] Radhakrishnan, 189.

the liberation.[249] Nevertheless, the rule of accepting nature as it is - especially adherence to nakedness - prevented women from being nuns of Jainism. There are evidences about women who practised self-torment under the instructions of famous teachers like Nighaṇṭhanāthaputta.[250]

Buddhism, thus, became the pioneer in the establishment of well-formed monastic institutions for the ascetic women in India. Mahāpajapatī Gotamī has been recognized as the first woman who started the mission. In *Chullavagga*, it is said that the Buddha rejected her request first, but later 'the request for being a nun' was granted with conditions.[251] These conditions enjoined on the nuns not to break or stand against the rules and the values of society. From the viewpoint of Feminism, the conditions were antagonistic to women.[252] However, the Buddha declared that women who have left their household life and entered into the life of homelessness are capable of attaining the states of 'stream-entry', 'once-returnee' 'non-returnee' and *Aarahat* irrespective of the gender.[253]

The establishment of the order of Buddhist nuns opened the door for women who were seeking the path of spirituality, the path of *dhamma*. The new institution started growing rapidly. It was open to the lay-women who were considered as the

---

[249] No particular English word fit to the Hindu concept: (PED, 541).

[250] Thig, the collection of verses attributed to Bhaddā Kuṇḍalakesi (5-9).

[251] Eight conditions: 1.) A nun, even though she has been ordained for a hundred years, must be respectful to a monk, 2). Nuns must not spend the rainy season in an area where monks do not reside, 3). Every fortnight, nuns must make two requests to the community of monks, 4). Nuns must make a triple invitation to both communities at the end of the rainy season, 5). A nun who has committed a serious fault must undergo a period of mānatta , 6). The higher ordination should be requested only after a training of two years, 7). A nun should not abuse a monk, 8). Nuns do not have the right to teach monks, but it is the duty of monks to teach them (Vin, 2, 256; AN, 4, 272-277), Translation quoted: Mohan Wijayaratna, 'Buddhist Nuns,'(Colombo: Wisdom Publications, 2001)17-18.

[252] Uma Chakravarti, Problem Stratification of Pāli Texts, (New Delhi: Oxford University Press,1987) 11.

[253] Vin, 2, 254 -255.

lowest step in the social ladder to the queen, the highest. In the new ascetic order, they enjoyed the equality and the happiness that are attendant on freedom.

A large section of Buddhist canonical literature is dedicated to discussions on renunciate women. The *Bhikkhuni Saṃyutta*, a part of *Saṃyutta Nikāya*, is a collection of verses attributed to ten particular nuns. Apadāna consists of biographies of forty nuns. The *Thig* is the most momentous work among them which provides a clear picture of the struggle of women who aimed to attain the state of Nibbāna.

## 3.2 Authorship and the Structure of the Text

Sixty-eight names from among the leading nuns are mentioned along with their verses in the *Thig*. Another 532 nuns who articulated their experiences remain anonymous (*aññatarā theri*).[254] Scholarly debates are still going on regarding the verses and the identities of their authorships.[255] However, the matter is not considered here in detail because many of the nuns are *Arahantas* or else are not ordinary mortals. Thus, the validity of their message has the same weight though the ways of expression differ. Sometime the details are needed as when the characters are to be adjudged against occasions and compared with contemporaries. In the methodology of the *Nettippakaraṇa*, the validity is measured by comparing the text with *Sutta, Vinaya* and the *Dhammatā* and not by any other information (*Netti*:18). Thus, the matter of names which has been

---

[254] 1(1-1), 1 (5-1), 30 (5-11= 30), 500 (6-1) = 532.

[255] The number of the nuns is differently stated in those texts. Thig; H. Oldenberg and R. Pichel. (1883, London:PTS,1966) x-xi.;Thig; (Sinhala tr.) N.A. Jayawickrama, M.D. Gunasena Pub. Colombo, 1958, pp.xix- xxiii; K.Blackstone, Women in the Footsteps of the Buddha (1998, New Delhi: MB, 2000), 113-117.

discussed by the scholars does not influence the processes of translation or the interpretation in the *Thig* or any other Buddhist canonical texts.

The structure of the 522 lyrics included in the *Thig* can be discussed in two variations:

i) Single verses

ii) Collections of verses

The verses in the *Thig* belongs to the division of *gāthā*, according to the Buddhist analysis of the Nine- Fold- Divisions of Teachings (Ñāṇamoli, 4). Gāthā is a 'form which has a particular meter mainly designed for the convenience of memorizing especially in its oral tradition.'[256] Each verse thus has four lines composed in a particular meter, designed for the convenience of memorizing as the texts were preserved so by oral traditions.

There are sixteen chapters called *Nipāta* in the text. The chapters have been organized and named according to a hierarchical order of the number of verses recited by each nun. The name of each chapter is indicative of the number of verses included. According to the *Thig*, only one verse recited by a nun is included in chapter 1, a collection of two verses in chapter 2, three in chapter 3, and so on. This pattern continues up to chapter 9. There is no chapter called 10, which has a collection of ten verses. The next five chapters are organized in a hierarchical order, not following the pattern of the earlier ones. For instance, chapter 16 has a collection of sixteen verses, chapter 20 has a collection of twenty verses, and chapter 30 has a collection of thirty and chapter 40 has a collection of forty verses. The last chapter named *Mahā Nipātha*, contains 74 verses.

[256] K.R.Norman, The Elders Verse I Thergāthā, trans. (London: PTS, 1969) xxxii. (TT-II)

The number of nuns or the collections of verses included in chapters are varied. In the chapter 1, there is a collection of eighteen verses which are attributed to eighteen nuns. Likewise, chapter 2 is dedicated to ten nuns and chapter 3 to eight nuns. Chapter 4 has only one nun, chapter 5 has twelve nuns, chapter 6 has eight nuns and chapter 7 has three nuns. Chapter 8, 9, 10, 11 and 12 have one nun each. Chapter 13 has five nuns. Chapters 14, 15, and the last chapter 16 also have only one nun each. In general, there are seventy three collections of verses in the text.

## 3.3 Purpose of the Text

The purpose of the *Thig* has been widely reviewed by scholars. C.A.F. Rhys Davids in her (TT-I), recognized the text as an expression of a higher state of the mind, considering the fact that it is a part of the Buddhist canonical texts. Her purpose in analyzing the *Thig* was to find the motives behind the choice of homelessness by the nuns. This aspect is historical than spiritual.

> 'More interesting to the social historian than the peace they hymned is the account of the various motives that drove women, when Buddhism has arisen, from the world to embrace the *anagāriya* or homeless life. These motives are as diverse as those revealed in the records of Christian monasticism.' [257]

Many of the later scholars too used the text in order to collect historical information regarding various fields like social formation, cultural aspects and the life styles of women in India.

[257] (TT-I), xxiv.

> 'The songs provide us with rare glimpses into the personal lives of the wide range of women who joined the ascetic communities. Among them were poor peasants, small artisans, wealthy wives and daughters of businessmen, noblewomen, and courtesans. Many poems describe what we would today think of as oppressions of class and gender.'[258]

In contemporary studies, *Thig* is a valuable source material in the field of gender studies. *Women in the Footsteps of the Buddha*, is designed to stress the gender differences and their various aspects as revealed in the *Thig* and the *Theragāthā* as also in the verses recited by *arahat* monks. For the author,

> 'The patriarchal context makes the *Thig* claim to female authorship all the more remarkable. Buddhist texts also maintain a consistently patriarchal and andocentric attitude towards women. Throughout my study, I discuss specific aspects of Buddhist Patriarchy as they are relevant.[259]

The writer examines the influence of gender on Buddhist religious texts, institutions, attitudes and practices in the historical context referred to in the *Thig*.

Many scholars focus their attention on the stylistic features and linguistic components of the *Thig*, but not on its content. For some of them 'the rhetoric continuously urges to go beyond the fact or the statement to its significance'.[260] The second English translator, K.R. Norman, later developed the idea about the meter of the verses of the *Thig*, presented first by Davids. Half of the introduction

---

[258] Susie Tharu, 66; Blackstone 1-2.
[259] Blackstone, 10.
[260] Susie Tharu, 67.

of his translation is devoted to find a relationship between the text and the Āryā meter of poems.[261]

Most of the scholars subscribe to the view that 'the most important thing that strikes us in *Thig* is the idea Nibbāna as held by the *Theries*.' The commentator's note included in Davids's TT-I deeply influenced later scholars in identifying the core message of the text.

> 'Now the Order of *Bhikkhunīs* being thus well established,' hearing of the great enlightenment of the Buddha, of the very truth of the Norm, of the excellence practices of the order, were mightily pleased with the system, and dealing with the round of rebirth,' and taking the system to their bosom, renounced the world.. . and the psalms which they uttered from time to time, in bursts of enthusiasm and otherwise, were afterwards by the Recensionists included in the Rehearsal, and arranged together in cantos.'[262]

While viewing the text by gender perspectives, K. Blackstone has this to say about the message of the text:

> 'It (*Thig*) stands as a unique testimony to the experiences and aspirations of the community of women renunciants, the bhikkhuni-sangha. As such, it is important both for scholars interested in the history and doctrine of Indian Buddhism and to contemporary women seeking liberative models from the past.'[263]

---

[261] (TT-I), xxxix-lxxiv.
[262] (TT-I)7-8.
[263] Blackstone, 1-2.

The Buddhist point of view stresses that the major concern of the Buddha's teaching is to make men and women aware of the path to Nibbana. (Ñāṇamoli, 37) This criterion is based upon the entire canonical texts or the Tipiṭaka. The content of every canonical text reflects the Sutta or 'Four Noble Truths,' Vinaya or 'the uprooting of lust, hatred and delusion' and the *Dhamma*tā or the 'law of dependent origination' (*Netti*:38).

Hence, the *Thig* can be viewed as a testimony of women, who were determined to help themselves by realizing their own courage and wisdom in order to attain the goal of Nibbana. They first struggled for a long period seeking happiness from the external world, like ordinary women. Then they steered themselves on to the inward path following the Buddha's teachings. It is clearly depicted how women were constantly engaged in a struggle for rooting out all evil tendencies in order to attain such a goal.

The purpose of the *Thig* is not only to provide examples as to how women succeeded in realizing the Nibbana but also 'to direct other women to the goal.' Moreover, the significance of the text is the 'availability and the adaptability of various paths' towards Nibbana. These methods were open to truth seekers of all time.

*Thig* like all other canonical texts in the Pāli Tipiṭaka, can be interpreted in terms of 'the teachings of the Buddha,' as these collections of verses are well-connected with the exposition of the six-fold 'aspects of teachings' formulated by the Buddha (*Netti*:13; Ñāṇamoli, 21). They are 'Disappointment', 'Gratification', 'Fruit,' 'Escape', 'Means' and 'Injunction.' These six aspects are depicted in the 'Four Noble Truths' (Ñāṇamoli,17).

| The Four Truths | Nature of the Truth | |
|---|---|---|
| Suffering | Results of Craving | Disappointment and Fruit |
| The Origin of Suffering | Craving | Gratification (sensual pleasure) |
| Cessation of Suffering | Cessation of Craving | Escape |
| The Path of Cessation of Suffering | Achieving Nibbāna | Means & Injunctions |

The above classification suggests that unhappiness can be recognized in terms of disappointments (*ādinava*) and results (*phala*). 'Disappointment is born out of desire. When fulfillment of desire eludes a person s/he becomes as deformed as if s/he is pierced by a barb' (Ñāṇamoli, 13). The immediate reason for the disappointment is involvement in gratification. (*assāda*) (Ñāṇamoli, 13). 'Craving' motivates gratification. Escape (*nissaraṇa*) is the process by which one comes out of the circle of disappointment and gratification. That denotes the cessation of craving. The purpose of the path is to show the means (*upāya*) and injunctions (*āṇatti*) in order to cease the craving. The 'means' helps to start the process of cleansing ones behaviour at the initial stage. Injunction is the prolonged practice that should lead one to attain the result. The ideas relating to women in *Thig* can be discussed under three main heads:

i) Why women had chosen homelessness?
   Reasons and fruits – Gratifications vs. Disappointments

ii) How they escaped from sufferings?
   Escape'- The cessation of the unhappiness while following the 'Path' ('Means' and 'Injunctions')

iii) How they achieved the goal?

Nibbāna - Achieving the goal or eternal happiness

Thus, the 'Four Noble Truths'; suffering, craving, the path and the result, have been cited as answers to these questions.

## 3. 4 Reasons for Embracing Homelessness

### 3.4.1 Craving

The first question, how women did leave their homes to wander and accept homelessness, has a bearing on some behavioural tendencies of the human being. First, desire for enjoying sensual pleasures is at the root of craving. Gratification has its sources in the six senses of eye, ear, tongue, nose and body, and the mind (Ñāṇamoli, 46). Thus, every being in the seen and the unseen universe is engaged in satisfying these six senses from birth to death. Various desires, which arise one after the other, are to be satisfied by them. For that, they use many ways and means throughout their lives.

The desire for having two types of births is described in the text: one 'divine,' and the other 'human' (*dibbaye ca manussā ca*) (3-3).[264] Many who believe in the concept of rebirth perform good deeds in order to get a 'better' life in the next birth. Some of them endeavour to become deities (*devakāyābhinandini*) (2-7) in heavens like Tāvatiṃsa, Yāma, Tusita, Nimmānarati or Vasavatti ( 8-1).

Body is the centre and mind is the creator of the desire for pleasure. The beauty of this body is dependent on certain attitudes and conditions perceived by

[264] The first number refers to the chapter and the second to the particular collection of the verses.

the mind. "Perception of beauty has the characteristics of apprehending colour, shape and features." (Ñāṇamoli, 45)

Notions of physical beauty and the beauty of young men and women are portrayed in many verses. Men have invited even nuns to accept their gifts of 'beautiful garments', 'finest and excellent cloths', 'gold', 'pearls' and 'valuable perfumes' (14-1). A young nun was admiringly described as 'a doll made of gold and as incomparable.' 'Her eyes with long eye-lashes inflamed the sensual desire of the youth who spoke to her.' (14-1) Ordinary men with sensual desires tempted women with words like 'you are young and beautiful; I am also young and in my prime, let us delight ourselves' (6-3). Women were provoked by some to 'enjoy the delights of the senses, not to repent afterwards' (7-3). Men urged women 'not to waste their youth by refusing to be untouched by a man' (14-1). The verses of Ambapāli, express the ultimate level of body beauty, from head to toe.

> '…the black hair with curly ends decorated with flowers and valuable ornaments, blue, long, brilliant eyes like jewels, crescent like eyebrows as if well painted by artists, delicate nose, well-fashioned ears, pure white buds like teeth, musical voice, well polished conch-shell like neck, round and smooth arms, round, attractive breast closed together loftily, beautiful *Thigh*s, calves with delicate anklets, feet as soft as cotton wool please every one.' (13-1)

The above description is in keeping with the view of ordinary mortals who appreciate beauty as a positive phenomenon. However, the viewpoint of an Arahat nun is entirely different in such contexts: hence, the nun compares this body decayed in the old age to a dilapidated house (13-1).

Wealth, status, and life-styles are other desirables in worldly life apart from appreciation of beauty. Material possessions and fame were highly valued by the queens, courtesans and princesses who approached the Buddha for guidance in the renunciation of the world. They were people who enjoyed privileges, luxury and high status in their lives. one woman is described as living 'adorned in all her valuable ornaments, well-dressed, wearing a garland, smeared with sandalwood paste, attended by female slaves, playing and enjoying and having food and drink in lovely gardens' (6-4).

Some women were extremely rich. The daily earnings of Aḍḍhakāsi, a beautiful prostitute was almost as much as the taxes collected in her state, Kāsi, (2-4). Anopamā, 'born into an exalted family, had a good complexion and a beautiful figure and much wealth and property. She was a King's daughter and sought after by princes. The princes were ready to gift jewels and gold eight times her weight to get her in marriage' (6-5).

### 3.4.2 Consequences of Craving

Worldly beings are trapped by sensual pleasures, which are intangible and unappeasable. Sensual craving is recurrent and the pleasures are transient. Thus, disappointment is the unavoidable result caused by the impermanence of the sensual pleasure.

When desire is not fulfilled to one's satisfaction, one suffers. As desire is a recurring phenomenon, suffering becomes an inevitable human experience. Gratification and the consequential unhappiness are the very reasons for the prolonged sufferings of all women who share their life experiences in the *Thig.*

These are the very factors that made them choose renunciation among the Buddhist teachings.

The reasons rendered by them for their choice of homelessness are important as they exemplify how these two roots - gratification and suffering- emerge in their various facets at the individual and social levels. These reasons can be classified as,

i) Social problems
ii) Problems caused by nature
iii) Understanding the nature of craving by themselves

Social problems are common to each community but their impact may vary due to the attitudes and the levels of mental development of any particular society. Problems caused by nature are the same as the ones included in the law of dependent origination. The understanding referred to the third group is significant, because it does motivate and encourage everyone to view the world with the assistance of certain ideas put forth by the nuns.

### 3.4.2.1 Social Problems

Women who lived during the time of the Buddha were the meek victims of the rigorous customs and attitudes of the male dominant patriarchal Hindu society. The environment was hardly supportive of women. [265] Most of the women suffered from problems arising from their marital status. An unmarried girl growing old at home was a burden to her family at that time and so she was

[265] Oliver Abenayake. 'Reappraisal of the Position of Women in Buddhism,' Journal of Buddhist Studies, Vol.1 (Sri Lanka: Centre for Buddhist Studies, 2003) 8.

married off when she was very young. Otherwise, she was subjected to the 'reproaches of the society' (16-1). Once they got married, other problems came up: 'inability to bear a son' (14-4) or 'sharing her husband with co-wives' {(11-1), (16-1)}. Many young women had to deal with this dilemma and one 'preferable alternative for them to escape from both was to become a nun' (6-5).

The unbearable weight of household work, and satisfying the desires of the husband while engaged in earning for the family made most women tired both mentally and physically (1-11). The mother of monk Sumangalā had left her husband because 'his behaviour was shameless and disgusting' (*ahiriko*) (2-3). Isidāsi faced the opposite of the same problem: she was rejected and driven out of her husband's home though 'she wanted to live with him treating him lovingly, being obedient to him more than slave-women.' She got married three times but the experiences remained the same. She wanted to find not the apparent reason - why husbands feel disgusted with her- but the 'definite' reason. She transformed herself into a nun and later realized how her 'karmic forces from the past births were activated in this birth for putting her into grievances' (15-1).

Social factors like 'poverty,' 'being with co-wives,' 'widowhood' and inability to fulfill even the basic needs of food, clothing and shelter' forced some women to reach nunneries {(5-12), (11-1)}. Relatives as well as neighbors leaving them in helpless situations harassed them.

Another reason for becoming nuns was loneliness and the helplessness of the wives, sisters or the daughters of people who had embraced the Buddhist order. Bhaddākāpilāni, the one time wife of *Arahat* Kassapa the great, enthusiastically entered the nunnery after he had left home to become a monk. Some women suffered badly due to their negligence by others and fear about their future (13-3). Chāpā was unable to stop her husband from becoming a monk even

after pleading with him persistently. She threatened desperately, that she would 'knock down their son to the ground on the spot or to beat the child with a stick or hurt him with a knife.' He refused to return and finally, she too became a nun (13-2). Sundari decided to leave her home due to the desolation she suffered, after her parents and their servants had embraced the order (13-4).

Rupanandā did not become a nun out of devotion to Buddha's teachings but to be with her close relatives. Her mother Mahāprajapati Gotami, brothers-the Buddha and the monk Nanda - and other Shākyan women who were her relatives had left home to enter the order and she yearned for their companionship. Initially, she simply wanted to be with them but later she attained Arahantaship (5-4).

In this context, one can see that Uppalavannā's life experience is startling. Without her knowledge- in the later period of her life-, she and her daughter became co-wives to her own son by her first marriage (12-1). The shocking discovery helped her to understand the impure and evil side of sensual pleasure. The sense of guilt, shock and the disgust led her to seek that happiness which is not dependent on the senses at all.

### 3.4.2.2 Problems Created by the Body

Natural changes are common to all beings and these changes have been described in the law of dependent origination. Starting from the birth it continues as 'decay', 'death', 'sorrow', 'lamentation', 'pain', 'grief', 'despair', 'unpleasantness,' 'loss' and so on. These components of suffering are connected with both the mind and the body. Moreover, many of these changes as well as their impact on the body can be seen with the naked eye. Ignorance is at the root

of the human inability to view the reality of nature. This causes mental anguish and disappointment.

When birth itself becomes a misery for human beings *Thig* discusses how childbirth gives unbearable physical pain to the mother. It describes how girls get married and become mothers in a young age following their social customs. 'Some of them even cut their throat and some very young mothers take poison just to avoid the unbearable labor pain' (11-1).

Women confronted with natural changes like diseases (*viādhi*), ageing (*jarā*) and death (*maraṇa*) try to find solutions for them. 'Weakness of the body (*dubbalā*) due to the 'ageing' (*vuḍḍike*) compelled Sumanā and Mettikā to leave their homes to seek assistance from elderly nuns (1.17). Mettikā was too old even to walk (2.6). A poor, helpless woman, Sonā became weak after bearing ten sons and was named as '*bahuputtikā*,' a sarcastic name given by the society for having too many children. She later approached an elderly nun for help to alleviate her sorrows (5-8). Chintā was restless and disappointed, weakened by diseases (*gilānā bāḷha dubbalā*) and finally happily accepted homelessness (2-5).

Though every one knows that death is inevitable, it is the most unacknowledged and unwholesome phenomenon in every one's life. The death of Ubbarī's only daughter (3-5), and Kisāgotamī's only son (11-1) made them depressed and mentally deranged and finally prompted them to become nuns. The grief caused by the dead sons made Vāseṭṭhi mad, and she wandered naked with disheveled hair for three years, dwelling on rubbish heaps and in cemeteries. Finally she ended up as a nun to cease all her sorrow by becoming an *Arahant*. {(6-2), (20-4)}.

The character of Patāchārā is the most significant example of extreme unhappiness caused by death, not only in the *Thig* but also in the entire Buddhist

literature. Her character symbolizes all women who struggle piteously against the sorrow of loss. Each event dragged her into tragic situations. As the daughter in a rich family, first she loses her parents, then her servants, and all the material comforts of the world. All this was because of her elopement with a servant boy in her mansion, and later bearing him a son. The day she decides to come to see her parents, her husband dies accidentally. The same night she delivers her second son. The next day she loses her sons due to natural disasters. Once she returns home bearing intolerable grief it is only to see the last rites being performed for her brother and parents. Then, Patāchārā loses her self-control and becomes mad. But she regains her senses in the presence of the Buddha. Having experienced a life of intense suffering, she finds solace in the nunnery (6-1). She attains Arahantship by mastering the Buddha's teachings which transform her into the greatest among the nuns for her knowledge of the Vinaya.

### 3. 4. 2. 3 Understanding the Truth

Perception of reality is recognized as a higher attribute than ordinary cleverness. Realization of truth is that Craving is the cause of human unhappiness and so its avoidance is the way for peace and bliss. Two types of self-realizations are illustrated in the text. One is motivated by hearing the *dhamma* from the Buddha, from an Arahat nun or from an Arahat monk. The second category of understanding is through self- examination or introspection. Either way, women realized truth or the reality which enabled them to leave their worldly attitudes to sensual pleasure and material wealth. They realize that they could not feel or see so-called pleasure positively so far. Anopamā became a non-returnee (6-5) and some other women understood the *dhamma* by listening to sermons preached by

the Buddha {(2-2), (5-9), (7-2), (7-3), (8-1), (13-5)}. Abhayā realized the real nature of the body by listening to the dhamma preached by her own son who was an Arahat monk (2-8), as well as by some others of the same order {(5-7), (6-4)}.

The dhamma preached by Arahat nuns like Patāchārā and Jinadattā encouraged laywomen to enter into the order more than any other reason. Five hundred and thirty nuns who do not mention their names {(5-11), (6-1)} claim that, their entering into the order and realization of the teachings was because of listening to the sermons of Patāchārā. Following Patāchārā's guidance, they changed their life styles and started contemplating on the inevitable, but natural changes of the body {(6-8), (7-1)}.

There are examples of many wise women who were mature enough to see the natural decay of their beauty and the body by themselves (*yatābūtam ayam kāyo disvā*). This awakened them to insights that made them concentrate upon the natural law of changing things {(2-1), (2-6), (3-7), (5-3), (5-4), (9-1), (20-1), (41-1)}. The realization that 'we suffered a lot and yet the ways of sufferings are to be many more' (*bahūni dukkha dhammehi*) perfected their understanding {(2-9), (2-10), (3-1)}. They could see nature for what it is and were able to control the mind. For instance, after seeing a tamed elephant a nun understood how to tame her mind too (3-4).

Some were motivated to live a holy life by their inner faith inculcated by the dhamma (*saddhāya pabbajitvā*) {(1-8), (1-9), (5-6)}. Deep understanding was not limited to seeing the pain in the conditional world but was expanded to analyze the entire concept of suffering or misery. From the perspective of the Arahat nuns, 'creatures deceived in mind delight in Māra's realm'. That is the reason why we have to 'run through numerous rebirths out of ignorance' (6-7). A

woman who lost seven children and was degraded by the society as a 'sons-eater,' realized- later through great wisdom-, 'how she, her husband and their relatives had eaten hundreds of thousands of sons in their past births' {(6-2), (13-4)}. 'People who do not know this reality' were called as 'mere fools' (6-3).

The karmic forces, as explained by a nun, reveal how ignorance stands in one's way to tempt human beings on bad deeds. In her previous birth, she was a man, intoxicated by pride and youth and in his wealth, and had seduced another's wife. Because of it, she was burnt in the hell for thousands of births. Then she 'was born as a female monkey, then a she-goat and then a cow.' Every birth brought its own suffering: 'the cow was tail-less with worm-eaten skins, was castrated and was partially or totally blind. In human births, s/he became a slave in the street, as neither a woman nor a man. In this birth, she was sent out of home as a useless wife (15-1).

Making ordinary mortals convinced in the reality or the Truth is discussed as a major problem in *Thig*. Sumedhā struggled a lot to convince her parents about the danger, sorrow and the impermanence of this conditional life and her desire for getting rid of it. They did not pay to her reasonings. To gain their consent she threatened to fast until her death (16-3).

Women have dedicated their lives to the *dhamma* and the path of happiness or the Nibbāna, renouncing all their bondages of worldly lives including 'sons and husbands', 'elephants, cows and horses', 'jewels and delightful domestic wealth' and 'fame and comforts' {(1-11), (1-18), (6-7), (13-3)}.

However, controlling and directing the mind towards the goal is not an easy task for every one. Some nuns could not obtain peace of mind even for a moment in twenty-five years, after their nunhood (3-10). One left the hermitage four or five times for not having mental stability and then approached again an Arahat nun for

further guidance (3-2). A nun wanted to hang herself thinking that dying would be better than living a base life without realizing the *dhamma* (5-4). In certain cases, women regarded 'relatives or whoever tempt them on sensual pleasure' as their 'true enemies' (13-4).

## 3.5 Escape from Suffering, the Path of Wisdom

Apart from dwelling on the sorrowful side of life, *Thig* discusses 'why the nunhood or monkhood appeals to some one'. For them the members of the order are ascetics, therefore they are,

> '..dutiful, not lazy, doers of the best of actions. They are noble, possessed of mindfulness, purified inside and out, so the thoughts, words and deeds are pure. They are not conceited, and strive for the end of suffering.'
>
> 'Their outer behaviour is pleasant, when they leave any village they do not look back at anything. They do not amass property or desire valuable things and live by means of whatever comes their way' (13-2).

The one who is attracted by the happiness which a nun or a monk experiences, must follow a systematic way in order to achieve the same. Modes of purifying life vary, due to many reasons. The nature of karmic tendencies, views, and behaviours decide one's capacity to understand the dhamma.

Therefore, different paths to the Nibbāna can be identified in the text. The verses emphasize the necessity for following the Buddha's teachings for the purpose {(1-13), (6-3)}. One of the basic pieces of advice and instruction is, 'not to surrender to the influence of the mind' {(6-7), (9-1)} but 'must attain mastery

over the mind' (11-2). But how does one become a master of the mind? Mastery over the mind is attained through cessation/ discarding or uprooting of ignorance, desire and hate' {(1-18) , (1-3)}.

The satisfaction of 'eagerness and determination with the mind is essential before embarking on the path of practice' (1-12). Practising the dhamma is said to be like swimming against the current. The determination must be firm and steady enough not to slacken midstream. The initial courage (*padhan viriya*) is 'much more needed to achieve the goal' {(1-7), (7-1)}. 'Seeing the monks who have already started the journey' –or completed it- is one of the 'best motivation factors in this regard' (6-6).

The mind, the words and the body have to be restrained. It can be done 'by seeing the peril in the body' (1-17). Childhood, youth, middle age and old age are the stages of gradual changes, which can be seen through the eye. 'Contemplating on diseases, impurity and the rotten nature of the body too' is helpful to examine the immediate changes (5-3). A good example is included in the verses of Ambapāli, in order to contemplate on the unavoidable changes brought about by decay and ageing over a body.

> '….The hair smells like the hair of a wet-rabbit, and the head becomes bald, the eyelids droop down with wrinkles, the ears fail to hear well, the teeth turn yellow and broken, the voice falters now and then, the neck bends down, the arms are like pieces of dried wood, the breast hangs like water-less serves, the *Thigh*s look like stalks of bamboo, the calves are like sticks, and the whole body looks like a dilapidated house with its plaster peeling off.' (13-1)

It is a demonstration of the three natural laws of impermanency (*aniccatā*), suffering (*dukkha*) and non-self (*anattatā*) which are common not only to the body but also to each and every atom in the universe {(5-10),(6-1)}.

For the one, who has attained the dhamma, 'birth itself is a cause of suffering.' They know the truth that 'even the heavens are not free from the pangs of birth and death' (8-1). 'Suffering is seen among Devās and men, in the womb of animals, and in the body of Asura, among Petās and in hells' (16-1). Many of the nuns have explained in detail the unprofitable side of sensual pleasures {(13-4), (14-1), (16-1)}.

> 'Sensual pleasures are like a frightful attack, head of a serpent, like the enemies and killers. They bind us with ropes, lead us to endless perils, and inflict on us much pain. They are like poison, give little enjoyment, cause conflicts and dry up happiness.' 'Greed for sensual pleasure is an obstacle full of fear, full of annoyance, full of thorns.' (13-4).

Cessation of Intoxicants (*āsava*) is one way of desisting sensual pleasure (9-1). Persistent contemplation on the characteristics of ugliness (asubha) and contemplation on impermanence pave a clear path to understanding. 'The body remains a collection of corpses, occupying the cemetery. These strings (nerves) and sticks (bones) having been removed, are thrown away, scattered, broken into pieces. The body does not exist without this phenomenon of changing and on what would one fix the mind? (14-1).The concept of impermanence can be explored further to see the peril enveloping the whole world (4-1) and for 'understanding the five senses perfectly, as they really are' (6-2).

'To desist from committing evil deeds' is one way to control the mind, speech and the body. 'Evil qualities like desire, pride, ignorance and conceit' contribute to the defilement of human nature (6-7). These qualities are recognized as continuations from past births. 'They must not be welcomed and entertained in public or in private.' (12-1) 'Endless slaughter, bonds, calamity, loss, grief and lamentation are the results' one has to face when entertaining these qualities (13-4). 'Prolonged practice along would help to eliminate such qualities' (1-6). 'Suppressing and avoiding them also help to cut Fetters, the ten types of defilements' (dasa saṃyojana) (6-7). The process can be strengthened 'by taking refuge in the triple gems of the Buddha, the Dhamma and the Saṅgha' (16-1). It works as an oath because one feels like protecting it honestly as much as possible. This is one way to attain happiness.

Being mindful of the nature of the senses and particular sense bases or the primaries is an advanced method of realizing the truth - 'eye and the form,' 'ear and the sound' etc.-. It leads to the stage of 'seeing the impermanence of all volitional activities' (*saṅkhāra*) (5-7). Those who are attentive to Elements (*dhātu manasikāra*) 'realize the five sense- bases or primaries as the source of suffering' {(3-2) (5-1)}. Attentiveness on Elements is a part of realizing the chain of misery, the law of dependent origination. That way 'the nature of the arising and cessation of the five elements can be understood'. {(2-2), (5-6)} 'One who develops insight through seeing elements, will be able to attain the state of emptiness or the 'Sign-less-ness' (*animitta*) (3-3). 'Such people do not suffer a rebirth again.' (1-14)

Realizing the 'elements and the faculties', the 'five powers', the 'seven constituents of enlightenment' and the 'eight fold ways' are illustrated as the paths to Nibbāna (6-8). Hence, 'the people who do not understand the Four Noble

Truths are fools.' 'They are unwise, senseless and hindered by the uprising of pain.' (16-1)

Another method of stilling the mind is stated as 'not to miss the opportune moment.' 'Let not the moment pass away' because then 'one has to grieve' (1-5). It is the technique of being aware of the nature of impermanency of the whole world. Practising the four techniques of Mindfulness is the foundation to make one constantly aware of body, feeling, consciousness and cognizable objects.

## 3.6 Description of the Goal, the Nibbāna

The most significant feature of the sayings of the nuns is the emphasis they place on the Buddhist concept of Nibbāṇa as a state, attainable in this very lifetime but not after death. It is the permanent happiness experienced by the nuns, because of following the Buddha's teachings {(7-1), (7-3)}. Later scholars have analyzed approximately fifteen different sayings on Nibbāna in the *Thig*.[266] However, all these descriptions reflect various characteristics or facets of the same mental state of an *Arahant*. Moreover, these descriptions as stated below, can be recognized as authoritative definitions on Nibbāna as they belong to the same group of the three Lions according to the Guideline of 'Lions Play' in the *Netti*.

Nibbāna is the 'final state of utmost peace in the mind that one can ever experience because of the elimination of the ten fetters' (1-18). A nun who attains Nibbāna expresses that s/he is 'well-relaxed or released and it is an indestructible joy' (*aho sukhanti sukhato kdayāmi*). {(2-3), (6-8)} There are many reasons for

---

[266]Blackstone, 128-132. (However, the terms given by the author do not tally with the number of the verses)

this happiness, which is perceived as deep calmness. It is destruction as well as the winning over of all sorrowful events' (*parimuttā sabba dukkhehi*) and unprofitable acts which are related to the Māra and his followers or the evil (*jetvā māraṃ savāhiniṃ*) (1-7).

Nibbāna is supreme happiness because it is the end of the journey of saṃsāra with its births and deaths (1-11). It ensures that one is released from having any more birth after the death (*natthidāni punabbhavo*). {(1-14), (3-3) ,( 5-8)}

Nibbāna is happiness because it is a state of independence from lust. Desire is the root of lust and one has to desist from 'entertaining the senses, by delighting in them.' {(1-1), (1-5), (1-8), (1-10)}. Once the desire ceases, no need arises to satisfy the five senses {(2-9), (2-10), (3-1), (6-5)}. Then, only happiness remains (2-3). Thus, Nibbāṇa is the state of utmost coolness and total situation because of the rooting out of 'lust', 'hate' and 'ignorance.' {(1-1), (1-15), (1-16), (1-18), (3-5), (4-1), (5-2), (5-7), (6-1)}

Nibbāna is the ultimate happiness because it is a mental state, which 'free from all *yoga* or the four bonds' which are difficult to get rid of (*yogakkhemaṃ anuttaraṃ*). One has to be free from the desires to have sensual pleasure (*kāma*), having births (*bhava*), bearing views (*diṭṭhi*) and ignorance (*avijjā*). {(1-2), (1-4), (1-6), (1-8), (5-5) (9-1)} 'The state of being free from intoxicants' is another term used for the Nibbāṇa which means the cessation of the four factors mentioned above.[267] {(5-2), (4-1)} Giving up all 'prescindings of the mind'[268] (*avitakka*) brings about calmness too (5-2).

---

[267] Ñāṇamoli, 117

[268] (Varma, 171-172).

Nibbāna is happiness because it releases one from all the tangles (*gaṇṭha*) of the world. The tangles are explained as the components of the law of dependent origination. {(5-9), (30-1)}

Nibbāna is happiness because it is a 'conquest of the flood of a swollen stream.' Desires are described as a fearful stream, which is hard to conquer.[269] {(1-7), (1-10)} Thus, the mind which does not get entangled in sensual desires can even swim against the current.' (1-12).

Nibbāna is happiness because it bestows on us the triple knowledge of the 'higher virtue', the 'higher consciousness' and the 'higher wisdom' (*adhisīla, adhicitta, adhipaññā*). One obtains these three components by disciplining thoughts, words and deeds (*sabbattha saṃvaro*). {(5-1), (5-11), (5-12), (7-1), (16-1), (20-2), (40-1)}

Nibbāna is happiness because the nuns and the monks who reached that stage have had 'a complete knowledge or wisdom or a full realization of reality' (2-5). In other words, they have torn away the darkness of 'ignorance' (*tamokkhandṃ padāḷayāti*). {(1-3), (2-5), (3-2), (3-7), (3-8), (5-11), (6-8), (7-2), (7-3), (8-1), (12-1)} They are the ones who have fulfilled or completed their duties attendant on a human birth (*katakicca*). Thus, they have the right of accepting food- or anything - which has been offered by others with due respect.{ (5-9), (5-11)}

According to these averments of the nuns in the *Thig*, all worldly acts whether by humans, or gods or some other beings can be seen in three aspects; '*assāda*' or the Gratification, '*ādinava*' or the Dissatisfaction/unhappiness and '*nissaraṇa*,' the Escape from the above two phenomena. Permanent happiness has

[269] Ñāṇamoli,157.

to be understood in terms of 'freedom or giving up all sensual desires.' For that, one has to realize and follow the teachings of the Buddha as the nuns did.

This discussion may be wound up by presenting two different views voiced by two women. 'To be a female' is recognized as 'painful and troublesome' is the general point of view (*dukkho itthibhāvo*) (11-1). After becoming an Arahat, answering to a question raised by the Māra, a nun replies,

> "What can femaleness (itthibhāvaṃ) do to us, when the mind is well-tamed and when perfect knowledge has been obtained, having Insight into the doctrine?" (3-8)

This is one of the most important messages to contemporary women to understand the difference between the worldly aspects and the reality highlighted by the Buddhist point of view. Such understanding indeed motivates women to start their journey of finding permanent happiness in this very life itself.

**Chapter Four**

# 4. Discussion on the English Translations of Therigāthā

Translation is an interaction between two texts. It communicates ideas from one text to another in abidance with a certain set of rules. Similarities as well as differences occur fundamentally during the process of interaction between two texts: the source text (ST) and target text (TT). Similarities and differences are determined by factors such as the translator's pre-suppositions, beliefs, interests, knowledge of the subject, and pattern of thinking. These assumptions influence in organising the content of translation, its form as well as the procedures of translating. Equivalences, additions, reductions, substitutions and permutations appear in the TT as the consequence of this process.

Translations of *Thig* into the English language commenced with the introduction of oriental studies in India and Sri Lanka, during the period of British colonization. The first Roman script edition of *Thig,* prepared by R. Pischel, was published in 1889 by the PTS, London. The translated version was introduced to the West about two thousand years after the appearance of the original text. The translator of TT-I, C.A.F. Rhys Davids, was a Pali scholar and the author of many Buddhist texts at that time. The same publishers released three reprinted versions of the translation in 1932, 1948 and 1964. K.R. Norman, prepared TT-II is a linguist and a Pali scholar. The text was published in 1971 under the scheme of 'PTS Translation Series' in London.

## 4.1 Arrangements of the Translated Texts

Procedures of designing a text itself depict certain modes of transmitting the meaning of a ST, especially in the following contexts:

i) When the TT was written decades back and the translator is not accessible
ii) When the discussion about translation procedure is less in details
iii) In spite of (i) and (ii), as the evidences on the aspects and procedures are duly visible and accessible within the text

Hence, the style, sentence patterns and textual organisation are the manifestations of textual conventionality. The patterns of organising the content of TT are determined by the individual decisions of the translator and/or the norms, which are contemporarily powerful. All the adjustments finally focus on the single aim of communicating an understandable message to the reader.

### 4.1.1. The Psalms of Sisters

TT-1 was published hundred years ago from the date (1909), and its reprinted versions have not revised the content, except omitting illustrations included in the first print. The content of TT-1 has been constructed following the order of:

i) Introduction
ii) Extract of the preface of *Paramatthadīpanī*, the Pali commentary

iii) Translation of verses

iv) Illustrations

v) Appendix, Notes and Index

Each section mentioned above is intended for facilitating the reader to grasp the meaning of the ST. The 'Introduction' is constituted of three main parts: Canonical tradition of the Psalms and their historical significance; Psalms as an Expression of the Religious Mind; Methods Employed in Translation and the Meter. The significant feature of the Introduction is the quotation taken from the introductory note of Paramatthadīpani, the commentary on *Thig*, composed by Dhammapāla in the sixth century AD.

TT-1 has sixteen chapters or 'cantos' as its major part, which follows the same pattern of the Roman script edition of the ST. Stories, other descriptions on the particular collection of verses and footnotes are additionally included by the translator. Footnotes are comprised of suggestions, clarifications, further explanations and quotations from parallel Pali canonical texts.

Eight photographs are included in the TT as 'illustrations.' All of them stand for a particular incident or a place mentioned in certain verses of the ST.

The 'Appendix' includes eleven collections of translated verses, which were attributed to the eleven nuns in *Thig*. Ten collections of their verses are from the Bhikkhuni Saṃyutta and the remaining is from the Yakkha Saṃyutta of Saṃyutta Nikāya. Remarks on the Roman-script edition[270] come under the heading of 'Notes' while some selected Pāli terms and their English translations are included in the 'Index.'

[270] (TT-1) 192.

## 4.1.2. The Elders Verses II

The translator has organized the (TT-2) in three main parts:

i) Introduction

ii) Translation of the main text

iii) Notes and Indexes

The translator follows the same way of arranging the points and chapters, which he applied in his TT-II. 'Introduction' of the TT has ten sub sections. They are brief and provide details on the sub titles of: authors of the *Thig*, the arrangement of the verses; the compilation of *Thig*; the date; the commentary; the text of *Thig*; the translation; the metres; metrical license, orthography and phonology and constituents. Attention of the translator seems to have been focused on the last three subsections and they are relatively discussed in details, compared to the other sections. For instance, all the variations of the syllable and phonemic structures of the text are included in tables, which occupy a major part of the Introduction.

The translation part of the verses follows the same order of the content of the ST. Unlike Davids' text, footnotes or any kind of extra explanations are not attached to the main text. Endnotes are provided for further clarifications. The 'Notes' given for each verse of the text are rich in details. The notes are concerned with the alternative readings suggested by the translator for the ST, possible grammatical and phrasing variations of each four lines of the verse, and similar or related quotations from other Buddhist canonical works with an evaluation of the previous English translation of Davids.

The 'Index' is constituted of five parts: Parallel passages in Sanskrit, Prākrit and non-canonical Pāli; names in the ST, words discussed or quoted in the

notes; grammatical terms used in the commentary; grammatical points discussed in the commentary; and the list of some alternative readings for the verses in the ST.

### 4.1.3 Effect of the Organising Factors on Translations

The ways of organising a text play a considerable role in facilitating the progress of the reader, especially one who is not familiar with the Buddhist teaching. The religious and historical approach adopted by Davids in her introduction is more appropriate for 'the ordinary reader' while the more scholarly would be attracted by the linguistic analysis provided by Norman. For instance, Davids provides information on the historical, social and cultural factors in India during the time of the Buddha, motives that impelled nuns to embrace homelessness, the metre and its impact on the text, etc. in detail. Such information helps the reader in imagining the background of the text and its original authors. On the other hand, the tables and lists of metrical and orthographical variants in TT-2 do not assist the reader in grasping the deep meaning of the ST but represent only academic findings.

The preface to the *Pramathadīpani*, the commentary of *Thig* included in TT-1, provides historical information regarding the topics of 'origin of the Buddhist order of nuns,' 'the teachings of the Buddha,' and 'the mental status of nuns.' As stated by Davids, she owes much to the commentary because 'it was considerably helpful not only to the text editor but also to the translator.'[271] The commentary was the main authentic source for Davids, which helped clear 'many ambiguous terms, which were determined by the preferences of the commentator,

[271] (TT-I), xvi.

as representing the most ancient orthodox tradition.'[272] All the stories in TT-1, which were extracted from the commentary, have been illustrated as introductory notes for each collection of verses. They play the role of narratives prefaces. Please write the name of the person here reviews K.E. Neuman's German translation of *Therigāthā*,[273] as 'a task [done] with difficulty but with thorough scepticism' and 'somewhat free' due to the lack of reference to 'any aid or any commentary.'[274] It emphasises that her work is not to be considered as a free translation. Unlike Davids, Norman ranks the commentary among one of the other important materials, and refers it primarily to clarify grammatical terms in TT-2.

'Illustrations' in TT-1 have a great impact on conveying the meaning of the ST, thus minimizing the use of cultural devises. Five of the photographs are from archaeological sites such as Old Rājagaha, New Rājagaha, Gijjakūta or 'Vulture's peak.' Other three are the scenic pictures of 'threshing rice in Kashmir', 'forest glade in North India' and portraits such as that of King Bimbisāra. For instance, the picture, 'Threshing Rice in Kashmir' shows how a girl uses a mortar to separate rice from grain. It helps the reader who has neither seen nor heard about the mortar in gaining a better and clearer understanding of the Pāli word '*musala*' (1-6) and the heavy work that those Indian women had to do. Such illustrations are, however, omitted from the reprinted versions.

The 'Appendix' to TT-1 provides extra information on eleven Buddhist nuns who contributed to the ideas in *Thig*. It plays the role of enabling the reader to gain better access to more details on the subject through parallel readings.

---

[272] (TT-I), xvii.

[273] K.E. Neuman, trans. Therigāthā, Berlin .1899.

[274] (TT-I) xv.

'Notes' and 'Indices' seem to carry only secondary value because the information in them is extraneous to the main text. Davids prefers the system of footnotes while Norman includes all the clarifications in endnotes. Davids' explanations are more reader-friendly because they are easily accessible and are given in the same page of the main text, unlike the other. However, Norman has paid much attention and importance to the 'Notes' in TT-2, which account for around one hundred and twenty seven pages while the whole text or the translation of verses takes only fifty one pages. The descriptions given by Norman are highly academic and are useful to only those readers who have attained to a certain level of education and are conversant with scholarly practices.

## 4.2 Style of the Translated Texts

Style is identified here 'as a way in which the language is used'[275] and in the sense of the application of various units such as paragraphs, verses and quotations, which determine the shape of the translated text. Style is considered an 'effective tool for conveying the meaning of the ST' because it is an outcome of a 'conscious decision.'[276]

Style determines the type of a text. The utility of stylistic variations depend upon different types of literature including prose, poetry and drama among others.[277] TT-1 is a mixture of both the literary styles of prose and poetry.

---

[275] Joseph Marco, 'Translating Style, and Styles of Translating,' The Journal of Language and Literature, (UK: Sage Publications, 2004) 73-90.
[276] Robert de Beaugrande, Factors in a Theory of Poetic Translation, (Netherlands: van Gorcum, 1978) 92.
[277] Jiri Livi, TSR, 158.

TT-1 implies four different styles in constructing each individual collection of verses. The styles are stated below according to the descending order of their usage in the TT.

i) A description and a translation of verse/s, (eg: 1-12, 16-1)

ii) A description, a translation of verse/s, a description and a translation of verses (eg: 3-6, 3-7, 9-1)

iii) A description, a translation of verse/s and a description (eg: 1-3, 1-13, 20-1)

iv) A translation of verse/s and a description (eg: 1-1, 1-2)

Style (i) one is regularly used while the style (iv) is seen in very few collections of verses.

All descriptions of TT-1 are in the form of prose excluding the particular verse. The one, which precedes each translation, is always a piece of story or a description followed by a prose narrative style (*ākhyāna*). It is either a complete translation of the particular story or a summary of a lengthy story of the Pali commentary. The story plays a major role among other descriptions. The story and/or the description are connected with the text in the form of a question raised by the translator herself. For instance, the previous birth story of a nun is narrated following a question with 'how was she reborn' (1-1).

However, prose descriptions are occasionally illustrated in between the translation of two verses. Mostly they include the translator's opinions regarding the context of the particular verse. They can be identified as cohesive links for maintaining the connectivity of verses as well as for clarifying events or situations,

providing extra information.[278] Generally, these pieces are placed in the middle and/or the end of the main TT. The result of adding stories and explanations swell the text with extra information but does not help in capturing the purpose or intention of the ST, which aimed at conveying the message of Nibbāna.

The poetic style used in the translations of TT-I is apt for the English reader, applying equivalences to facilitate his/ her reading. For instance,

'*Puṇṇe pūrassu dhammehi – cando paṇṇarasoriva*
*Paripuṇṇāya paññāya - tamokkhandaṃ padāḷayāti.*' (1- 3,/3)

'Fill up, Puṇṇā, the orb of holy life,
E'en as on fifteenth day the full-orb'd moon.
Fill full the perfect knowledge of the Path,
And scatter all the gloom of ignorance.' (1-3/TT-I)

The sense of poetic style of the ST is maintained in TT-1, according to the translator, as 'an attempt at conveying something of the 'poetic' and 'religious feeling' of the metrical original.'[279]

On the other hand, TT-2 is completely deviant from the style of the verses of the original, as it accepts the style of prose. Extra information does not appear in between the pieces of the translated texts and the translation does not express ideas poetically at all but simply convey the literal message of the ST. For instance, the same text of *Thig* appears in the TT-2 as:

---

[278] Jeremy Munday, Introducing Translation Studies, (Oxon: Routledge, 2001) 59.
[279] (TT-I), p xxxix

> 'Punnā, be filled with things sublime, as the moon on the 15th day (is full); with fulfilled wisdom tear asunder the mass of darkness (of ignorance).' (1-3/TT-2)

According to the translator, he prefers the prose style for two reasons. In his introduction to the Elders verses I, he points out that,

> 'Firstly, any verse translation into English is hardly likely to improve upon Mrs. Rhys Davids', except in the passages where she was relying upon an inferior text or mistranslated for some reason. Secondly, I felt that verse-form in English is properly the province of the poet, while those who composed the verses of Theragāthā were not (with a few exceptions) poets. They composed in verse simply because in ancient India that was the medium for epigrams, gnomic utterances, etc.'[280]

Even 'poetry' can be rendered into a 'prose' style in cases where literary styles are not feasible.[281] However, Norman understands the verse-form of *Thig* as one of the techniques for conveying texts in the Nine Fold Divisions of Buddhist teachings. He has not denied the metrical form and the poetical structure of the text, and has paid much attention to the subject in his introduction and notes. He does not bring those ideas when translating the text but brings them up for the discussion.

Norman deliberately avoids 'poetic and archaic English words'[282] in his TT-2 while Davids follows the same method to preserve the archaic value of the original. Unlike Davids, occasionally Norman was obliged to use words not in

---

[280] Elders Verses I., xxxii
[281] David Connolly, 'Poetry Translation,' RETS, 173.
[282] Norman, Elders Verses I, xxxii.

every-day usage.[283] Those minimal examples exhibit how translators work on Buddhist texts, applying their 'own' methods.

## 4.3 Procedures of Translating Source Texts

A common feature that could be identified in TT-1 and TT-2 is the following of individual methods for transmitting the ST meaning. At least two aspects determine the procedures applied by Davids. One is the 'religious feeling' and the other is 'poetic feeling.' The intention of familiarising the alien features of some Buddhist concepts to the English reader might have influenced Davids to translate the text faithfully. For instance, concepts such as 'the slightest moment' (*khaṇa*), and 'being in the moment of the present,' (*yonisomanasikāra*) for her are the 'most salient objects and lessons given from the East to the West.' [284] She admits that the views expressed by nuns are 'for the history of human ideas, the really precious truths, however legendary or lost the genuine sources may have become.'[285]

Being faithful to the original text is an ancient method of translating sacred texts in the West, following 'word-for-word' rendering.[286] Davids applies 'sense-for-sense' method, the other branch of faithfulness.[287] Thus, TT-1 prefers to be faithful to the conceptual meaning, rather than preserving literary terms like names of nuns, place names, and even similes and metaphors of the ST.

---

[283] TT-II, xxxii.

[284] 'a moment between two eternities,' (TT-I, xxxi),

[285] TT-I, xiii

[286] Munday, 24

[287] Douglas Robinson, 'Free Translation,' RETS, 88.

Norman follows almost a 'word-for-word' or 'literal' method to produce TT-2, considering two factors of 'the non-poetic background of compositors' and 'the general usage of verse-form in communication.'[288] Few more points are to be discussed in order to elucidate the differences and similarities between ST and TT-1 and TT-2 further. It is difficult to select single words from a text, because they are inseparable elements of phrases or sentences, which finally are related to the whole text. However, translations of general terms such as the names of places, persons and objects can be made clear at the word level.

Single ideas

| ST | TT-1 | TT-2 |
|---|---|---|
| *gāthā* | psalms | verses |
| *theri* | sister | elder/bhikkunī/theri |
| *muttā* | liberta | Muttā |
| *gijjhakūta* | Vulture's peak | *gijjakūta* |

Many English equivalences in TT-1, which figure in Christian literature are not sufficient to express the intended meaning of the ST. 'Psalm,' for example, is 'a song or a poem in praise of God which are contained in the Biblical book of Psalms.' It does not tally with the expressions of the states of the calm mind of nuns as well the content of the verses. Similarly, 'sister' is a subordinate term for 'a female member of a religious order,'[289] which does not convey the status of a Buddhist nun or a *bhikkhunī* who has reached the Arahantaship, completely freed

[288] Norman, Elders Verses I, xxxii.
[289] The Oxford Dictionary Thesaurus, 2007, 235.

from ten fetters thus, taints and ignorance.' Davids seeks guidance from the commentary to find suitable words occasionally.[290] Names of persons and places also are translated into English in TT-1, while TT-2 has left them un-translated.

Cohesive terms

| ST | TT-1 | TT-2 |
|---|---|---|
| *āsava* | deadly drugs | *āsava* |
| *dhamma* | norms | the things sublime |
| *paññā* | the perfect knowledge of the path | wisdom |
| *khemaṃ* | salvation | rest-from- Exertion |
| *nibbāna* | liberation | Nibbāṇa |

Terms, which convey unified meanings in TT-1, bear a more Christian influence than TT-2. The word 'liberation' literally means 'set free,' and is used in the context of interpreting theological concepts. This meaning is indeed different from the Buddhist concept of Nibbāna, the mental state, which is free from misery due to the destruction brought about by craving. TT-1 is an example of how the Biblical values governed Buddhist canonical texts mainly during the period of colonisation. Norman, therefore, left many technical terms un-translated, when it seemed to him that any English equivalent could only be misleading.[291]

Wordiness is the obvious factor in TT-1 at the phrase level, as an unavoidable factor of sense-to-sense translation.

[290] 'holy life' 'of the path' (1-3): (TT-I) 12.
[291] Norman, Elders Verses I, xxxii

Eg: 1. *vippamuttena cittena – aṇanā buñja piṇḍakanti* (ST,1-2/2)

'Wipe off the debts that hinder thee and so,
With heart at liberty break thou thy fast' (TT-1)
'With mind completely freed, without debt, enjoy your alms food'
(TT-2).

Eg: 2. *jātassa maraṇaṃ hoti* (ST, 7-3/)

To one that's born death comes soon or later. (TT-1)
For one who is born there is death. (TT-2)

Eg: 3. *sabbattha vihato nandi – tamokkhandaṃ padāḷayāti*
(ST,6-3/142)

Slain of the all sides the love of the world, the flesh and the devil,
Rent asunder the gloom of ignorance once that beset me,
(TT-1)
'Everywhere love of pleasure is defeated; the mass of darkness (of
Ignorance) is torn asunder' (TT-2).

Explanations within the translations of verses in TT-1 are minimal, excluding those long narrative passages and descriptions, discussed under the head of style. TT-2 does not include any piece of extra information in the main text.

Translating connotative expressions are more reader-friendly in TT-1 than TT-2. TT-1 applies equivalences while translating similes, or explains them in details.

Eg: 1. *mutte mucchasu yogehi – cando rāhuggahāriva* (ST,1-2/2)

Get free, Liberta, free e'en as the moon

From out the Dragon's jaws, (TT-1)

'Muttā, be freed from ties as the moon is freed from the grasp of Rāhu' (TT-2).

Eg: 2. *mā tam yogā upaccaguṃ* (ST,1-4/4)

See that the great conjuncture now at hand

Pass thee not by. (TT-1)

May the opportune occasions not pass you by. (TT-2)

However, none of the translations explains the meaning of the Pali term yoga in details to the reader. In example (1) *yoga* denotes the four 'knots' or 'bonds,' which tie the human in repeated rounds of rebirths. Knots are also regarded as the four types of desires, namely, for sensual passion, passion for living, false-views and ignorance.[292] In the second example, yoga means 'the auspicious moment of the present,' as one is endowed with the four types of wealth: a human birth, keen faculties, opportunity to be born during the Buddha's lifetime and being trustful in his teachings. [293] One must not lose this opportunity, which cannot be brought back.

[292] Varma, 173.
[293] Jayawickrama, 72.

The sense-to-sense translation followed by Davids requires more clarifications for the foreign reader as he is alien to the Buddhist teachings. She has tried to fulfil a difficult task, applying a reader-friendly procedure while 'being faithful' to the ST. Word-for-word method applied by Norman too is characterized by limitations of the structure in conveying the 'complete' and/or 'intended' message from the Buddhist texts. Equivalences at the word level or just above-word level are not sufficient in transmitting the message, especially when the meaning of a Buddhist text is condensed. As mentioned in *Netti*, even at the 'expanded' and 'detailed' levels of teachings also an interpretation is required. It fills the gap that exists between a non-Buddhist English reader and the teachings of Buddhism, which were mostly propounded at an age remote from the present times.

**Chapter Five**

# Application of Nettippakaraṇa, a Method

## 5.1 Demonstration - I :Applying Sixteen Modes on a Single Verse

Demonstration of the method will be followed by the section of Combined Treatment in *Netti.* Implementation of the method consists of two phases.

1) Adopting sixteen sets of Modes on a single passage
2) Suggesting Modes, apt for the full text

According to the first phase, *Netti* applies all the Modes individually on the verse selected from *Udāna.* Likewise, the randomly selected verse from the collections of verses, condensed in meaning belongs to the seventh chapter of *Thig.*

*satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ,*

(ST.7-2/182) [294]

---

[294] The first two digits of the first figure indicate the chapter and the number of the particular collection of verses as followed by the edition of Therigatha, (Ceylon: the Tripitaka Publication Press, 1970). The second digit indicates the number of the verse given in many other editions and translations of Thig in (TT-1), (TT-2) and CSCD.

The verse is a self-expression of a nun named Chālā. She recited the verse to Māra, an evil one, who approached to tempt her on sensual desires. There she exhibits her resistance on not being delighted in sensual pleasure since she attained a Peaceful and Blissful state being mindful. The process of eliminating Craving, the root cause of misery, is also a battle with Māra, who symbolises 'unguarded consciousness,' 'encumbered by wrong views,' and 'oppressed by lethargy and drowsiness' (Ñāṇamoli: 119).

The text must be paraphrased if it is in verse form as prescribed by the *Vicaya hāra* in *Netti*. Literal meaning of a verse is important because unlike prose, verses are characterised by a compact and connotative language with rhythmic variations. Concepts conveyed through verses may not follow the same grammatical structures as prose and hence a listener or a reader may not comprehend the meaning of a verse at once. The literal meaning is therefore necessary and will be illustrated at the beginning of each of the sixteen modes.

Instructions regarding the translating procedure are illustrated in each step to elucidate the method of applying. Instructions provided for the first three Modes (*desanā hāra, vichaya hāra and yutti hāra*) are accepted for all the sixteen Modes for two reasons.

i) Those three Modes can be used with any other Mode

ii) All the ideas in other Modes are included in those three Modes

The difference between the three and the rest is the way of phrasing, not the meaning. Once the translator becomes well acquainted with the method, he/she will be able to arrive at the final draft directly, skipping the steps in between. Constraints of applications will be summarised at the end of each Mode.

The second stage, suggesting the method on the full text, will be discussed in three divisions and the applicable Modes for *Thig* will be stated as optional categories.

### 5.1.1 *Desanā hāra*, the Mode of Conveying Teaching

The Mode of conveying teachings can generally apply on any piece of a text individually or ancillary with other Mode/s. The method sums up the doctrine under the heads 'for what purpose are the teachings preached' and 'how the teachings are taught. 'It facilitates the new reader to understand the meaning of a text, especially when it is pregnant with connotations (Ñāṇamoli, 119-121). The translating procedure is as stated below.

#### 5.1.1.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The first step is paraphrasing the verse and the second step is defining key words in the text. There are three main concepts in this particular verse: Acquiring Mindfulness (*satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvā*); developed Faculties (*bhāvitindriya*); the bliss, (achieved) by pacifying *saṅkhāra* (*saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*); achieved a peaceful state (*paṭivijjhi santaṃ padaṃ*). Order of the concepts in the verse is consecutive by its own. Understanding the function of systematic Mindfulness[295] (*sati*) is important at this point. Mindfulness is the main Requisite out of the thirty-

[295] *sati*: mindfulness (Ñāṇamoli, 305), (Varma, 152); mindfulness, alertness, conscience, intentness of mind, wakefulness of mind, lucidity of mind, self-possession (PED. 672); recollection; active state of mind, fixing the mind strongly upon any subject, attention, attentiveness, thought, reflection, consciousness (CSCD).

seven states of the state of Enlightenment (bodhipakkhīya dhamma) and it is positioned in four places.

i) As the main factor of the four foundations of Mindfulness

ii) Among the Five Controlling Faculties

iii) As the first factor among the seven Factors of Enlightenment

iv) As the seventh factor of the eight-fold Noble Path

In this context, it has two main functions.

i) As the initiative and the leading factor, which lined-up all the other factors towards the goal of Enlightenment

ii) Balancing and making straight the other Factors

Mindfulness functions as the leading factor in the first position to fulfil the four foundations. In its second position, it balances the two sets of Controlling Faculties[296] namely Faith[297] and Wisdom[298] as well as Vigour[299] and Meditation[300] being in the middle. In its third position, Mindfulness marshals and lines up the seven Factors of Enlightenment. Further, it straightens up their tendencies to lean towards restlessness and laziness.[301] Together with Mindfulness there is a single-pointedness characteristic of Meditation (*samādhi*). Therefore, in its fourth

---

[296] *Indriya*: controlling faculties (Varma, 41,76); faculty (Ñāṇamoli, 292); 'defines under moral aspects and explains in terms of'[their Mental Culture brings assurance of no rebirth] (PED.122); a power, faculty, function, organ; a moral quality; sense, perception, acquisition (CSCD).

[297] *Saddhā*: faith (Ñāṇamoli, 305); (Varma, 41,76), (PED. 675), (CSCD).

[298] *Paññā*: wisdom (Varma,p.121); understanding (Ñāṇamoli,.298); intelligence, reason, wisdom, insight, knowledge, recognition (PED.390); wisdom, intellect, reason (CSCD).

[299] *Viriya*: vigour (Varma, 41,76); energy (Ñāṇamoli, 303); vigour, energy, effort, exertion (PED.634); strength, vigour, energy, fortitude, effort, exertion; dignity, influence (CSCD).

[300] *Samādhi*: meditation (Varma, 41,76); concentration (Ñāṇamoli, 305), (PED. 685); agreement, peace, reconciliation; tranquility, self-concentration, calm (CSCD).

[301] 'The three factors, *Dhammavicaya, Viriya* and *Pīti* have a tendency to lean towards restlessness while the *Passaddi, Samādhi* and *Upekkhā* towards laziness.' Bhikkhu Ñāṇananda, Seeing Through: A Guide to Insight Meditation, (Nugegoda, Sri Lanka: Quality Printers, 1999) 5.

position, the right-Mindfulness (*sammā sati*) maintains the straightness of the mind with a single-pointed concentration and is associated with right Meditation (*sammā samādhi*). At this state, Mindfulness is in its climax and is established and unforgotten (Ñāṇamoli, 123).

Hence, Mindfulness in the first line of the verse stands for the first function, because Mindfulness must be established in the body by Mental Culture (Ñāṇamoli, 25) to proceed further towards the path of Nibbāna. The sati among the five Controlling faculties determines the second function as it balances both. The last line signifies a relation of cause and condition. Both Peace and Bliss, the manifestations of Nibbāṇa, share the act of stilling or pacifying *saṅkhāra* because the meditator can only achieve the former fulfilling the latter. Thus, 'Mindfulness,' 'Controlling Faculties,' 'pacifying *saṅkhāra*,' and 'Peaceful and Blissful state' will be discussed herein as key concepts.

The third step of the Mode is illustrating the characteristics of the concepts. This is the first of the four methods of defining a subject matter in Buddhist teachings. Characteristics of each technical term are provided in *Netti* and the translator retains the freedom to select suitable statement/s from the text.

The fourth step is explaining the meaning of the text further. Herein, the three methods other than characteristics are Function, Manifestation and the Proximate cause. They are preferred for a complete clarification of a doctrinal concept.

The fifth step is explaining ideas in the text in terms of the Four-Noble-Truths, one of the three main criteria of authority. According to the *Netti*, any concept of Buddhist teaching is definable in terms of *Sutta* or the Four Noble Truths and that concept is therefore authoritative. In this context, Mindfulness and its systematic developments form the path to cease *saṅkhāra,* which cause misery.

The result is acheveing Nibbāna, which is blissful and peaceful. All the concepts of Buddhist teachings are explained in terms of the four Noble Truths in *Netti.* In addition, the competent translator can explain the facts on his own but following the same structure.

As the final step, all the drafts will be combined at the end in order to reach the complete translation. Herein, ideas must be combined concept-ise to clarify the meaning. For instance, ideas on Mindfulness will be placed together as a single paragraph though they were separately demonstrated in the translating procedure. Page numbers included in the drafts for the purpose of assisting the translator, will be omitted in the final product of the translation.[302]

## 5.1.1.2 Translation procedure

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST,7-2/182)

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the verse**

Acquiring[303] mindfulness, the nun[304] with developed faculties achieved[305] the peaceful[306] and blissful state[307] by pacifying the *saṅkhāra.*[308]

---

[302] This instruction is common to all the sixteen Modes.
[303] *upaṭṭhapetvā*: summoning up (TT-2. 20); to provide, procure, get ready, put forth, (PED. 141);
[304] I (TT-2. 20).
[305] *paṭivijjhati*: pierced (TT-2, 20); to pierce through, to penetrate, to acquire, to master, to comprehend (PED, 399); to cleave, split; to penetrate, comprehend, acquire, master, learn (CSCD).
[306] *santaṃ padaṃ*: peace (TT-2, 20); *nibbāna* (PED. 408). *santa*: peaceful (Ñāṇamoli, 305); calmed, tranquil, peaceful, pure (PED. 675)

**Step 2: Defining Key Words in the Text:**

Mindfulness is the main Requisite out of thirty-seven subject matters that occur in the path to Nibbāna (Ñāṇamoli, 52) because the rest of the factors would develop only after acquiring it. Mindfulness consists of four Foundations. The first foundation is the constant awareness of Physical states.[309] The second is the constant awareness of Feeling.[310] The third is the constant awareness of Consciousness.[311] The fourth is the constant awareness of Cognizable objects[312] (Ñāṇamoli, 166). Being fully engaged in those four foundations is called Mental Culture[313] (*bhāvanā*), which leads to control of the senses of the body (Ñāṇamoli, 25). As it develops, the meditator will achieve either the knowledge of 'birth being exhausted'[314] or the knowledge of 'no more birth beyond' [315]( Ñāṇamoli, 27-28).

---

[307] *sukhaṃ*: happiness (TT-2. 20); nibbānic happiness (Varma, 157);

[308] *saṅkhāra+vūpasamaṃ* (*saṅkhārūpasamaṃ*); *saṅkhāra*: determination (Ñāṇamoli,304); 'preparation,' 'former impression,' 'disposition.' 'One of the most difficult terms in Buddhist metaphysics in which the blending of the subjective-objective view of the world and of happening' (PED. 664); '*kar*': 'to do': karma and/or the conditioned world (Varma, 149-50). *saṅkhāro*: constructing, preparing, perfecting, embellishing; aggregation; matter; *karma*; the skandhas (CSCD); *ūpasama*: calm, quiet, appeasement, allaying, assuagement, tranquilizing (PED.147); *vūpasama*, [vi+upa+sama]: allaying, relief, suppression, mastery, cessation, calmness (PED, 646); *saṅkhārūpasama*: constituent elements, (TT-1. 20); allayment of the constituents (PED. 665).

[309] *Kāyānupassanā*: contemplating on body as a body (Ñāṇamoli,166); constant awareness of the physical state (Varma, 40); understanding of the body is attained through introspection (PED, 207), intent contemplation referring to the body (PED, 672).

[310] *Vedanānupassanā*: contemplating on feeling as a feeling (Ñāṇamoli,166); constant awareness of feeling(Varma, 40); intent contemplation on sensation (PED.p.672).

[311] *Chittānupassanā*: contemplating on cognizance as the cognizance (Ñāṇamoli,166); constant awareness of consciousness (Varma, 40); intense contemplation on the mind (PED. 672).

[312] *Dhammānupassanā*: contemplating on idea as an idea (Ñāṇamoli,166); constant awareness of cognizable objects (Varma, 65); intent contemplation on phenomena (PED.672).

[313] *Bhāvanā*: Mental Culture (Varma, 35); keeping in being (Ñāṇamoli, 301); Mental Culture, producing, application (PED. 503); producing; increasing, developing, being devoted to, realizing, attaining; earnest consideration, meditation (CSCD)

[314] *Khaye ñānaṃ*: knowledge about exhaustion (Ñāṇamoli, 166); knowledge of the fact of decay (PED. 235).

Five Controlling Faculties are developed with the systematic progress of Mindfulness in the path. They are Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom (Ñāṇamoli, 30).

*Saṅkhāra* or volitional activities are arisen with Ignorance as condition (Ñāṇamoli, 97). They are the phenomenon of 'in-breath' and 'out-breath,' 'thinking and exploring,' 'perception and feeling,'[316] and 'memories and intentions' (Ñāṇamoli, .29).

Peaceful and blissful state is an achievement, which is sorrow-free, untainted, supreme, great and excellent (Ñāṇamoli, 82).[317]

**Step 3: Illustrating the Characteristics of the Concept/s**

Characteristic of Mindfulness is keeping the mind anchored in its concentrative object and it prevents the mind from floating away or wavering (Ñāṇamoli, 27-28).

Five Controlling faculties have a collective characteristic, that of co-existence with Consciousness (*chitta*).[318] They arise when Consciousness is arisen and cease when Consciousness is ceased (Ñāṇamoli, 30). Individually, Faith has the characteristic of confiding,[319] Vigour has instigating,[320] Mindfulness has non-

---

[315] *Anuppāde ñānaṃ*: knowledge about Non-arising (Ñāṇamoli, 289); knowledge of, about or concerning, consisting in or belonging to (PED. 288).

[316] Feeling and Perception are not counted in the group of fifty constituents of consciousness. (Varma, 150)

[317] The subject matter, 'Peaceful state' (*santaṃ padaṃ*) is shown as one of the synonyms for the term 'Nibbana,' thus any term out of the given list can be selected to explain the concept. See the list (Ñāṇamoli, 81-82).

[318] *Chitta*: consciousness (Varma,p.47); cognizance (Ñāṇamoli, 295); the heart, thought (PED.p.266); the heart; the mind; a thought, an idea; will, intention (CSCD).

[319] Confiding (Varma,p.151); trusting (Ñāṇamoli, 47).

drifting, Meditation has unification and Wisdom has understanding (Ñāṇamoli, 47).

*Saṅkhāra* have the characteristic of developing existence or forming[321] (Ñāṇamoli, 47-8 ).

Peace and bliss are united with the characteristic of 'Non-exemplifying'[322]( Ñāṇamoli, 82).

**Step 4: Explaining the Meaning Further**

The Function of Mindfulness is un-forgetfulness and its Proximate cause is firm perception of the body and the mind (Ñāṇamoli, 126). How does Mindfulness develop faculties? When the four Foundations of Mindfulness are established in Culture, the four Supreme Efforts[323] are emanated. When the four Supreme Efforts are anchored in the state of Culture, the four Psychic Powers[324] are emanated. When the four bases of Psychic Powers are rooted in Culture, the five Controlling Faculties are emanated. Herein the meditator balances Faith with Wisdom and Vigour with Meditation. The function of balancing is fulfilled by Mindfulness, indicated in the middle.

---

[320] Instigating (Ñāṇamoli, 47); strengthening and grasping or supporting (Varma,p.171).
[321] Forming (Varma, 150); developing renewal of existence (Ñāṇamoli, 47-48).
[322] The qualitative term *anidassana* does not tally with the meanings given in both texts 'unseen' [unseen, viz. nirvāna (CSCD)] and 'that makes know showing' (G.p.289). *Nidassana* stands for 'pointing at,' 'evidence,' 'example,' 'comparison,' 'apposition,' 'attribute,' characteristics (PED.p.358), pointing out, indicating, designation, illustration, sight, and view (CSCD). The prefix 'a' is a negative form (PED.p.1) and *anidassana* (a+nidassana) is opposed to *nidassana*.
[323] *Sammappadhāna*: Supreme efforts (Varma, 40); right endeavor (Ñāṇamoli, 298); right exertion (PED.695); right exertion, right effort (CSCD).
[324] *Iddhipāda*: psychic powers (PED,120), (Varma,p.40); supernormal bases of success (Ñāṇamoli,..292); constituent or basis of magic power (CSCD).

When the five Controlling Faculties are guided by Culture, the five Forces[325] are emanated. When the five Forces are controlled by Culture, the seven Factors of Enlightenment [326] are emanated. When the seven Factors of Enlightenment are anchored in Culture, the Noble eight-fold Path[327] is emanated. Therefore, all the states[328] that are tending towards Enlightenment are emanated through Mental Culture, because they have a single characteristic of Enhancing,[329] which is common to all states (Ñāṇamoli, 52).

The proximate cause of *Saṅkhāra* is Ignorance, which creates confusion (Ñāṇamoli, 47). Once the meditator acquires the eight-fold-path with the systematic development of the seven Factors of Enlightenment, he/she achieves right-view, right- determination, right-speech, right-action, right-livelihood, right effort, right-mindfulness and right-meditation. (Ñāṇamoli, 122) Mindfulness is well established and unforgotten[330] (*asammuṭṭha*) at this state, and it is called Insight (Ñāṇamoli, 123). The meditator would view *Saṅkhāra* as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less (Ñāṇamoli, 14) and realisation of the ephemeral nature of *Saṅkhāra* facilitates the attainment of Peace (Ñāṇamoli, 220). Peace and Bliss therefore are an achievement, which is sorrow-free, happy, great and excellent (Ñāṇamoli, 82).

---

[325] *Bala*: force (Varma,p.41); power (Ñāṇamoli, 300); strength, power, force (PED,.482); strength, power, force; an army, troops, forces; bulkiness (CSCD).

[326] *Bojjaṅga*: factors of enlightenment (Varma,p.41); factors or constituent of knowledge or wisdom (PED.490); requisites for attaining the supreme knowledge of a buddha (CSCD).

[327] *Ariya aṭṭaṅgika magga*: Noble eight-fold factors (Ñāṇamoli,.51); eight-fold path (Varma,p.41).

[328] Dhamma in this context refers to the 'state' (Varma, pp. 39-42); idea (Ñāṇamoli, 296).

[329] *Niyyāna*: giving outlet (Ñāṇamoli, 272); going out, departure, way out, release, deliverance (PED,p.369); setting out, departure, marching (CSCD).

[330] sammuṭṭha: confused, forgotten (PED, 696)

**Step 5: Explaining Ideas in the Text in Terms of the Four-Noble-Truths**

The whole idea is connected with the Four-Noble Truths. When Mindfulness is rooted in the state of Mental Culture as the proximate cause, the subject matters of Enlightenment are arisen (Ñāṇamoli, 52). This is the True path to attain Nibbāna. With the systematic development of the eight-fold Noble Path, the meditator finally would come to the stage of realising the *saṅkhāra* as suffering, and then views *saṅkhāra* as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less. This realisation is in accordance with understanding the Truth of misery and the Truth of ceasing misery. That way, the cause of misery is diagnosed and it also helps discover its remedy, which bestows Peace and Bliss, or the state of Nibbāna (Ñāṇamoli, 143).

## 5.1.1.3 Translation

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ,*
(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness, the nun with developed faculties achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

Mindfulness is the main Requisite out of thirty-seven subject matters that occur in the path to Nibbāna because the rest of the factors would develop only after acquiring it. Mindfulness is built upon its four Foundations. The first foundation is the constant awareness of Physical states. The second is the constant

awareness of Feeling. The third is the constant awareness of Consciousness. The fourth is the constant awareness of Cognizable objects. The state of absorption in those four foundations is called Mental Culture (*bhāvanā*), which leads to controlling the senses of the body. As Mindfulness is developed, the meditator will achieve either the knowledge of 'birth being exhausted' or the knowledge of 'no more birth beyond.'

The Characteristic of Mindfulness keeps the mind anchored in its concentrative object and prevents it from floating away or wavering. The Function of Mindfulness is un-forgetfulness and its proximate cause is firm perception of the body and the mind.

Five Controlling Faculties are developed with the systematic progress of Mindfulness in the path. When the four Foundations of Mindfulness are established in the state of Culture, the four Supreme Efforts are emanated. When the four Supreme Efforts are anchored in Culture, the four Psychic Powers are emanated. When the four bases of Psychic Powers are rooted in Culture, the five Controlling Faculties are emanated. They are namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom. They have a collective characteristic: that of co-existence with Consciousness (*chitta*). They arise when Consciousness is arisen and cease when Consciousness is ceased. Individually, Faith has the characteristic of confiding, Vigour has the characteristic of instigating, Mindfulness has the characteristic of non-drifting, Meditation has the characteristic of unification, and Wisdom has the characteristic of understanding. Herein the meditator balances Faith with Wisdom and Vigour with Meditation. The function of balancing is fulfilled by Mindfulness, which is in the middle.

When the five Controlling Faculties are anchored in Culture, the five Forces are emanated. When the five Forces are in the state of Culture, the seven Factors

of Enlightenment are emanated. When the seven Factors of Enlightenment are in the state of Culture, the Noble eight-fold Path is emanated. Therefore, all the states that are tending towards Enlightenment emanated through Mental Culture, because they have a single characteristic of Enhancing, which is common to all states.

*Saṅkhāra* or the volitional activities are include 'in-breath' and 'out-breath,' 'thinking and exploring,' 'perception and feeling,' and 'memories and intentions.' *Saṅkhāra* have the characteristic of developing existence or forming. The proximate cause of Saṅkhāra is Ignorance, which causes confusion. Once the meditator acquires the eight-fold-path with the systematic development of the seven Factors of Enlightenment, he/she achieves right-view, right-determination, right-speech, right-action, right-livelihood, right-effort, right-mindfulness and right-meditation. Mindfulness is well established and unforgotten (*asammuṭṭha*) at this state, and it is called Insight. The meditator would view *saṅkhāra* as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less and realisation of the ephemeral nature of *Saṅkhāra* leads to the attainment of Peace. Peace and Bliss therefore are an achievement, which is sorrow-free, happy, great and excellent.

The whole idea is connected with the Four-Noble Truths. When Mindfulness is in the state of Mental Culture as the proximate cause, the subject matters of Enlightenment are arisen. This is the True path to attain Nibbāna. With the systematic development of the eight-fold Noble Path, the meditator finally would come to the stage of realising the *saṅkhāra* as suffering, and then views *saṅkhāra* as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less. This realisation is in accordance with understanding the Truth of misery and the Truth of ceasing misery. That way, the cause of misery is diagnosed and it leads to discovering its remedy, which bestows the state of Peace and Bliss called Nibbāna.

### 5.1.1.4 Constraints of the Mode

Definitions, characteristics of key concepts and re-explanations of the Mode are the techniques, which facilitate the reader to grasp the meaning at various levels. The Mode can be used in the situations stated below.

i) For a reader who may fall in the third group, who would require more details,

The Mode explains the entire six Modes of teachings, thereby assisting the reader, who is hardly familiar with the doctrine with supplementary readings.

ii) Mainly for a text, which is condensed in meaning, as the Mode bears lengthy descriptions

The Translated text would be full in details, when this Mode is applied. However, a translator retains the freedom to select the method even for a lengthy text, if necessary.

iii) Connecting with any other Mode

The Mode envelops all the areas of Buddhist teachings, including the criteria of reader, their capability and applicable methods. Therefore, according to *Netti*, one of the first three Modes can be applied simultaneously with other Modes.

### 5.1.2 *Vicaya hāra*, the Mode of an Investigation

The Mode investigates the meaning of a text in four different ways of 'paraphrasing the text in the form of verses,'[331] 'term, question, answer, consecutivity' 'six Modes of teachings' and 'all that in nine- fold teachings' (Ñāṇamoli, 121-139).

#### 5.1.2.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The first step is paraphrasing the verse. The second step involves elucidating core ideas and explaining them consecutively. Elucidation in this context considers four factors: numerical figures of ideas; questions; answers; and the order or connectivity of the ideas. The translator is advised to select *only* key concepts among variously presented ideas as the Mode avoids over interpretations and repetitions. The text contains four core ideas: acquiring Mindfulness; developing Faculties; pacifying *saṅkhāra*; achieving a peaceful and a blissful state. The ideas of the verse itself are consecutive and a consecutive order is followed not to tamper with the ideas.

The third step is applying the six Modes of teachings on the text. Concepts of the verse will be explained through the categories of 'gratification,' 'disappointment,' 'escape,' 'fruit,' 'means,' and 'injunction.' The *Netti* has provided relevant definitions as well as detailed descriptions and the translator is advised to select relevant passages from them.

---

[331] The text as a verse can be paraphrased in the beginning, though it is illustrated as the third point (Ñāṇamoli, 21).

The fourth step is explaining the idea in the style of Nine-fold-Teachings. Passages or full text can be included in this formula. It demands answers for the nine questions: Whether i) the text is a statement of the Buddha; ii) or an *arahat* (monk or a nun); iii) the meaning of the text is already explicit by its own; iv) or the meaning is yet to be explicit; v) the text deals with corruption; vi) or with morality; vii) or with penetration; viii) or with Apt; ix) where does the text meet the Four noble truths: in the beginning, middle or at the end?

The translator can answer all the questions with a careful investigation of the given formulas in *Netti* (Ñāṇamoli, 35-6; 173-4).

## 5.1.2.2 Translation procedure

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ,*
(ST,7-2/182)

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the Verse**

Acquiring mindfulness, the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.

**Step 2: Clarifying Core Ideas of the Text Consecutively**

Mindfulness is the leading Requisite out of thirty-seven subject matters that occur in the path to Nibbāna (Ñāṇamoli, 52) because the rest of the factors would develop systematically only after achieving it. Mindfulness is constituted of four

Foundations, namely, the constant awareness of: Physical states, Feeling Consciousness, and Cognizable objects. Being absorbed in those four foundations is called Mental Culture, which controls the senses of the body (Ñāṇamoli, 25). As Mindfulness is developed, the meditator will achieve either the knowledge of 'birth as exhausted' or the knowledge of 'no more birth beyond' [332]( Ñāṇamoli, 27-28).

Five Controlling Faculties are developed with the systematic progress of Mindfulness in the path. When the four Foundations of Mindfulness are anchored in Culture, the four Supreme Efforts are emanated. When the four Supreme Efforts are established in Culture, the four Psychic Powers are emanated. When the four bases of Psychic Powers are rooted in Culture, the five Controlling Faculties are emanated. They are named Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom (Ñāṇamoli, 30).

When the five Controlling Faculties are established in the state of Culture, the five Forces are emanated. When the five Forces are anchored in Culture, the seven Factors of Enlightenment are emanated. When the seven Factors of Enlightenment are in the state of Culture, the Noble eight-fold Path is emanated. Therefore, all the states that are conducive to the attainment of Enlightenment are emanated through Mental Culture or *bhāvanā*.

*Saṅkhāra* are volitional activities that include 'in-breath' and 'out-breath,' 'thinking and exploring,' 'perception and feeling,' and 'memories and intentions' (Ñāṇamoli, 29). Once the meditator acquires the eight-fold-path with the systematic development of the seven Factors of Enlightenment, he/she achieves right-view, right- determination, right-speech, right-action, right-livelihood, right-effort, right-mindfulness and right-meditation (Ñāṇamoli, 122). With the well-

[332] *Anuppāde ñānaṃ*: knowledge about Non-arising (Ñāṇamoli, 289); knowledge of, about or concerning, consisting in or belonging to (PED. 288).

established and alert state of Mindfulness, called Insight (Ñāṇamoli, 123), the meditator would view *Saṅkhāra* as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less (Ñāṇamoli, 14). Realisation of the ephemeral nature of *Saṅkhāra* itself helps achieve the Peaceful and Blissful state, which is sorrow-free, happy, great and excellent (Ñāṇamoli, 82).

**Step 3: Applying the Six Modes of Teachings**

In their mundane life, humans are sure to be happy by gaining what they desire (Ñāṇamoli,13): such things as fields, gardens, money, men, women and family (Ñāṇamoli,14). (Gratification described) If his desires are not fulfilled due to the temporary nature of cognisable objects (Ñāṇamoli,13), pain invades him as water invades a broken boat (Ñāṇamoli,14). (Disappointment described). Once a human being is 'mindful' ever in ignoring sensual desires, he evades such attachments, which he/she made with the conditional world (Ñāṇamoli,14). (Escape described) When Mindfulness guards him, he will be protected by Faith, Energy, mindfulness, Meditation and wisdom, as a big umbrella does in rain (Ñāṇamoli,14). (Fruit described).

Then he/she will realise the characteristic of Saṅkhāra as forming[333] the conditioned world (Ñāṇamoli, 47-8), which is impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less (Ñāṇamoli, 14). ('Means' described). Subsequently, he/she looks upon the world as void and detached from him/her (Ñāṇamoli,15) ('Injunction' described) and realises the supreme wisdom, which brings peace and happiness, called Nibbāna.

[333] Forming (Varma, 150); developing renewal of existence (Ñāṇamoli, 47-48).

**Step 4: Explaining the Idea Applying the Nine-fold-Teachings of Investigating**

This particular verse is not a direct statement of the Buddha as an *Arahat* nun Chālā recited it. The meaning of the verse in brief is thus needed to explain further. Mindfulness herein is illustrated as the leading factor for achieving Peace and Bliss. It deals with moral aspects, which a wise person can bring into practice. The idea of the verse meets Four Noble Truths at the beginning because the verse expresses Mindfulness and appeasement of *saṅkhāra* as the techniques of Escape.

## 5.1.2.3 Translation

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ,*
(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness, the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

Mindfulness is the leading Requisite out of thirty-seven subject matters that occur in the path to Nibbāna because the rest of the factors would develop systematically only after achieving it. Mindfulness is constituted of the four Foundations of the constant awareness of: Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and the Cognizable objects. Occupying those four foundations is called Mental Culture, which controls the senses of the body. As the Mindfulness is developed,

the meditator will achieve either the knowledge of 'birth is exhausted' or the knowledge of 'no more birth beyond'.

Five Controlling Faculties are developed with the systematic progress of Mindfulness in the path. When the four Foundations of Mindfulness are Culture, the four Supreme Efforts are emanated. When the four Supreme Efforts are Culture, the four Psychic Powers are emanated. When the four bases of Psychic Powers are Culture, the five Controlling Faculties are emanated. They are namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom.

When the five Controlling Faculties are Culture, the five Forces are emanated. When the five Forces are Culture, the seven Factors of Enlightenment are emanated. When the seven Factors of Enlightenment are Culture, the Noble eight-fold Path is emanated. Therefore, all the states that are tended to Enlightenment emanated through Mental Culture or *bhāvana*.

*Saṅkhāra,* the volitional activities are arisen with Ignorance as condition that enveloped the phenomenon of 'in-breath' and 'out-breath,' 'thinking and exploring,' 'perception and feeling,' and memories and intentions.' Once the meditator acquires the eight-fold-path with the systematic development of the seven Factors of the Enlightenment, he/she achieves right-view, right-determination, right-speech, right-action, right-livelihood, right-effort, right-mindfulness and right-meditation. With well established and unforgotten state of Mindfulness called Insight, the meditator would view *Saṅkhāra* as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less. Realisation of the ephemeral nature of *Saṅkhāra* itself is achieving Peaceful and Blissful state, which is sorrow-free, happy, great and excellent.

In other words, in their mundane life, humans are sure to be happy by gaining what they desired the things like fields, gardens, money, men, women and

family. If his desires are not fulfilled due to the temporary nature of cognisable objects, the pain invades him as water invades a broken boat. Once a human is 'mindful' ever in ignoring sensual desires, evades such attachments, which he/she made with the conditional world. When the Mindfulness guards him, he will be protected by Faith, Energy, mindfulness, Meditation and wisdom as a big umbrella does in rain. Then he/she will realise the characteristic of *Saṅkhāra* as forming the conditioned world as well they are impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less. Subsequently, he/she looks upon the world as void and detached from him/her and realises the supreme wisdom, which brings peace and happiness called *Nibbāna.*

This particular verse is not a direct statement of the Buddha as an *Arahat* nun Chālā recited it. The meaning of the verse is in brief thus is needed to clarify further. Mindfulness herein is illustrated as the leading factor of achieving Peace and Bliss. It deals with moral aspects, which a wise person can bring into practice. The idea of the verse meets the Four Noble Truths at the beginning because the verse expresses Mindfulness and appeasement of *saṅkhāra* as the techniques of Escape.

### 5.1.2.4 Constraints of the Mode

All the restrictions that are applicable to the Mode 1 are applicable this Mode also. The Mode is informative and is suitable,

i) For a reader from the third group, who require more details,

It assists the reader who is hardly familiar with the doctrine and to grasp the meaning as it explains the entire six Modes of teachings.

ii) Mainly for a text, which is condensed in meaning since the Mode bears lengthy descriptions,

However, the translator reserves freedom to select the method even for a lengthy text, if necessary.

iii) Can apply with any other Mode,

It envelops all the areas of Buddhist teachings, including the criteria of reader, their capability and method. Therefore, according to *Netti*, one of the first three Modes can apply with other Modes as well.

### 5.1.3 *Yutti hāra*, the Mode of Construing

The Mode examines, 'whether the ideas are different in meaning or different in phrasing,' or 'whether they have a single meaning though the phrasing is different' (Ñāṇamoli,38). It discriminates the connotative and denotative or the 'literal' and 'intended' meanings of the text, concerning the type of person. Finally, interpretation must be evaluated by one or more criteria of *sutta, vinaya* or *dhammatā* (Ñāṇamoli,139-40).

#### 5.1.3.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The first step is paraphrasing the verse and the second step is clarifying ideas in terms of literal and intended. Herein, only the intended meaning of a text is considered but not the verbalised. The terms of 'acquied Mindfulness,' 'developed Faculties,' 'pacifyied *saṅkhāra*' are connotative expressions, while the terms 'a peaceful' and 'a blissful state' have symbolic meaning.

The third step is explaining concepts in terms of Four Noble Truths and the law of Dependent origination. Those two criterions verify the authority of a statement in Buddhism. (The instruction is for applying Four Truths are mentioned

in *Desanā hāra* in 5.1.1.1). Dependent origination is relevant as a core principle in interpreting because it explains the relation between the cause and its effect. According to the Buddhist teachings, any kind of phenomenon does not exists by its own but 'dependent' upon something else. For instance, the eye- consciousness (*cakkhu viññāna*) is a relation between the eye, the internal-base and its external object, that of the visuals.

'Dependent origination' is illustrated in two aspects: its function on the conditional world called 'arising aspect' (*samudaya*) and its disjoining function from the conditional world called 'cessation aspect' (*nirodha*) (Ñāṇamoli, 97). In this verse, the aspect of cessation is applicable since the nun pacified *saṅkhāra* by acquiring Mindfulness. *Netti* exhibits examples for applications on those two formulas. Translator is advised to quote the ideas directly from *Netti* or to create his/her own descriptions but following the same pattern.

## 5.1.3.2 Translation Procedure

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the verse**

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

**Step 2: Clarifying Ideas in Terms of Intended Meaning**

Mindfulness is the leading Requisite out of thirty-seven subject matters that occur in the path to Nibbana because the other factors are developed systematically only after achieving it. Mindfulness is constituted by the four Foundations of the constant awareness of: Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and the Cognizable objects. The state of being established in those four foundations is called Mental Culture, which controls the senses of the body. When Mindfulness develops the meditator achieves either the knowledge of 'birth as exhausted' or the knowledge of 'no more birth beyond' (Ñāṇamoli, 27-28).

Five Controlling Faculties are achieved by the systematic development in the path. When the four Foundations of Mindfulness are Culture, the four Supreme Efforts are emanated. When the four Supreme Efforts are Culture, the four Psychic Powers are emanated. When the four bases of Psychic Powers are Culture, the five Controlling Faculties are emanated. They are namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom (Ñāṇamoli, 30). The Faith must be balanced with Wisdom and, Vigour with Meditation. Mindfulness in the middle balances the two sets in this context. When the five Controlling Faculties are Culture, the five Forces are emanated. When the five Forces are Culture, the seven Factors of Enlightenment are emanated. When the seven Factors of Enlightenment are Culture, the Noble eight-fold Path is emanated. Therefore, all the states that are tended to Enlightenment emanated through Mental Culture or *bhāvanā*.

*Saṅkhāra*, the volitional activities are arisen with Ignorance as condition (Ñāṇamoli, 97) that included the phenomenon of 'in-breath' and 'out-breath,' 'thinking and exploring,' 'perception and feeling,' and 'memories and intentions' (Ñāṇamoli, 29). Once the meditator acquires the eight-fold-path with the

systematic development of the seven Factors of the Enlightenment, he/she is endowed with the right-view, right- determination, right-speech, right-action, right-livelihood, right-effort, right-mindfulness and right-meditation (Ñāṇamoli, 122). With well established state of Mindfulness called, Insight (Ñāṇamoli, 123) the meditator would view Saṅkhāra as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less (Ñāṇamoli, 14). Therefore, realisation of the ephemeral nature of *Saṅkhāra* itself is called achieving Peaceful and Blissful state, which is sorrow-free, happy, great and excellent (Ñāṇamoli, 82).

**Step 2: Explaining Concepts in terms of 'Four noble truths' and 'Dependent Origination'**

The whole idea is connected with the Four-Noble Truths. When Mindfulness is in Mental Culture as the proximate cause, subject matters of Enlightenment are arisen (Ñāṇamoli, 52). This is the True path to attain Nibbana. With the systematic development of the eight-fold Noble Path, the meditator finally would come to the stage of realising the *saṅkhāra*, as suffering and then views *saṅkhāra* as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less. This realisation is in accordance with understanding the Truth of misery and the Truth of ceasing misery. That way, the cause of misery is diagnosed and it causes for its remedy, which bestows Peace and Bliss called *Nibbāna* (Ñāṇamoli, 143).

The idea of the verse can be explain in terms of Dependent Origination because it explains the relation between the cause and its effect. Any kind of phenomenon in the conditional world does not exist by its own but is dependent. Hence, depending upon the development of Mindfulness there the five Controlling Faculties namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom (Ñāṇamoli,

52) are progressed. With the gradual developments of the five Controlling Faculties, the meditator attains the constituents of the eight-fold Noble Path. This is the state of achieving the highest training, highest Wisdom, (*adhi paññā*), Insight (Ñāṇamoli, 81).[334] With the arising of Wisdom, comes cessation of ignorance. From cessation of ignorance, comes cessation of *saṅkhāra*. From cessation of saṅkhāra comes, cessation of consciousness. From cessation of consciousness comes cessation of Mentality and Materiality (*nāma rūpa*). From cessation of Mentality and Materiality comes, cessation of the six senses. From cessation of the six senses comes, cessation of contact. From cessation of feeling comes, cessation of craving. From the cessation of craving comes, cessation of becoming. From cessation of becoming comes, cessation of birth. From cessation of birth comes, cessation of decay, death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief and illnesses. (Explained Dependent origination)

### 5.1.3.3 Translation

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

Mindfulness is the leading Requisite out of thirty-seven subject matters that occur in the path to Nibbāna because the other factors are developed

[334] A set of synonyms is provided to describe the state. (Ñāṇamoli, 81)

systematically only after achieving it. Mindfulness consists of four Foundations as the constant awareness of: Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and the Cognizable objects. The state of being established in those four foundations is called Mental Culture, which controls the senses of the body. When Mindfulness develops the meditator achieves either the knowledge of 'birth as exhausted' or the knowledge of 'no more birth beyond.'

Five Controlling Faculties are achieved by the systematic development in the path. When the four Foundations of Mindfulness are Culture, the four Supreme Efforts are emanated. When the four Supreme Efforts are Culture, the four Psychic Powers are emanated. When the four bases of Psychic Powers are Culture, the five Controlling Faculties are emanated. They are namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom. The Faith must be balanced with Wisdom and, Vigour with Meditation. Mindfulness in the middle balances the two sets in this context. When the five Controlling Faculties are Culture, the five Forces are emanated. When the five Forces are Culture, the seven Factors of Enlightenment are emanated. When the seven Factors of Enlightenment are Culture, the Noble eight-fold Path is emanated. Therefore, all the states that are tended to Enlightenment emanated through Mental Culture or *bhāvanā*.

*Saṅkhāra*, the volitional activities are arisen with Ignorance as condition that included the phenomenon of 'in-breath' and 'out-breath,' 'thinking and exploring,' 'perception and feeling,' and 'memories and intentions.' Once the meditator acquires the eight-fold-path with the systematic development of the seven Factors of the Enlightenment, he/she is endowed with the right-view, right-determination, right-speech, right-action, right-livelihood, right-effort, right-mindfulness and right-meditation. With well established state of Mindfulness called Insight, the meditator would view Saṅkhāra as impermanent, sorrowful and

soul-less. Therefore, realisation of the ephemeral nature of *saṅkhāra* itself is called achieving Peaceful and Blissful state, which is sorrow-free, happy, great and excellent.

The whole idea can be connected with the Four-Noble Truths. When Mindfulness is in Mental Culture as the proximate cause, subject matters of Enlightenment are arisen. This is the True path to attain Nibbāna. With the systematic development of the eight-fold Noble Path, the meditator finally would come to the stage of realising the *saṅkhāra*, as suffering and then views saṅkhāra as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less. This realisation is in accordance with understanding the Truth of misery and the Truth of ceasing misery. That way, the cause of misery is diagnosed and it causes for its remedy, which bestows Peace and Bliss called Nibbāna.

The idea of the verse can be explained in terms of Dependent Origination because the criterion elucidates the relation between the cause and its effect. Any kind of phenomenon in the conditional world does not exist by its own but is dependent. Hence, depending upon the development of Mindfulness there the five Controlling Faculties namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom are progressed. With the gradual developments of the five Controlling Faculties, the meditator attains the constituents of the eight-fold Noble Path. This is the state of achieving the highest training, highest Wisdom, Insight.

With the arising of Wisdom, comes cessation of ignorance. From cessation of ignorance, comes cessation of *saṅkhāra*. From cessation of saṅkhāra comes, cessation of consciousness. From cessation of consciousness comes cessation of Mentality and Materiality (*nāma rūpa*). From cessation of Mentality and Materiality comes, cessation of the six senses. From cessation of the six senses comes, cessation of contact. From cessation of feeling comes, cessation of craving. From the cessation of craving comes, cessation of becoming. From cessation of

becoming comes, cessation of birth. From cessation of birth comes, cessation of decay, death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief and illnesses.

### 5.1.3.4 Constraints of the Mode

The method illustrates facts based on authority. Limitations are almost similar to the Mode 1, as the first three Modes in *Netti* are interrelated in providing overall idea about the doctrine. The rest of the Modes are ancillary to these three Modes in contrast. The Mode is applicable,

i) For a reader from the third group, who require more details

The Mode explains the entire six Modes of teachings. It assists the reader who is hardly familiar with the doctrine to grasp the meaning.

ii) Mainly for a text, which is condensed in meaning, as the Mode bears lengthy descriptions

The translator has the freedom to select the method even for a lengthy text, if necessary.

iii) Can apply with any other Mode

It envelops all the areas of Buddhist teachings, including the criteria of reader, their capability, methods etc. Therefore, according to *Netti*, one of the first three Modes can be applied simultaneously.

## 5.1.4 *Padaṭṭhāna hāra*, the Mode of Proximate cause

The Mode is constructed by providing a 'proximate cause' (*padaṭṭhāna*), or a 'footing' for each idea in the text. Proximate cause is one of the four fundamental methods of defining meaning in the Buddhist system. That way, the scope of interpretation has been limited to a single principle in this Mode. The translator can set up an appropriate connection between any passages of the text, by recognising the relationship (Ñāṇamoli, 140).

### 5.1.4.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The first step is paraphrasing the verse and the second step is explaining key concepts by using Proximate Causes. Concepts are defined applying the criteria in *Netti.* In this verse, there are four main concepts to be related with their respective proximate causes: acquiring Mindfulness; developing Faculties; pacifying *saṅkhāra*; peaceful and a blissful state.

### 5.1.4.2 Translation Procedure

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the verse**

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

**Step 2: Explaining Key Concepts Applying Proximate Causes**

The proximate cause of Mindfulness is its four foundations, which are the constant awareness of Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and Cognizable objects. The process gradually develops five Controlling Faculties namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom. The proximate cause of Faith is the firm confidence. The proximate cause of Vigour is Right Endeavour. (Ñāṇamoli, 47).[335] The proximate cause of Meditation is knowledge[336] (ñāna). The proximate causes of Wisdom is non-perplexity as Four Truths. (Ñāṇamoli, 47)

The meditator acquires the highest and the established Wisdom, when he/she reaches up to the state of right Meditation (*sammā samādhi*), the last requite of the path of Enlightenment. Therefore, Wisdom is the proximate cause of pacifying *saṅkhāra,* which has the proximate cause that of Ignorance (Ñāṇamoli, 47). Therefore, Wisdom is the proximate cause of a Peaceful and a Blissful state.

## 5.1.4.3 Translation

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.

[335] Agitation or the basic condition of making energy (Varma, 171).
[336] Knowledge (Varma, 106); knowledge, intelligence, insight, conviction, recognition (PED, 287) meditation (Nanamoli, 47).

The proximate cause of Mindfulness is its four foundations, which are the constant awareness of Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and Cognizable objects. The process gradually develops five Controlling Faculties namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom. The proximate cause of Faith is the firm confidence. The proximate cause of Vigour is Right Endeavour. The proximate cause of Meditation is knowledge (*ñāna*). The proximate causes of Wisdom is non-perplexity as the Four Truths.

The meditator acquires the highest and the established Wisdom, when he/she reaches up to the state of right Meditation (*sammā samādhi*), the last requite of the path of Enlightenment. Therefore, Wisdom is the proximate cause of pacifying *saṅkhāra,* which has the proximate cause that of Ignorance. Therefore, Wisdom is the proximate cause of a Peaceful and a Blissful state.

### 5.1.4.4 Constraints of the Mode

Explanations are provided within the limits proximate causes. It can be dealt with Profitable or unprofitable aspects as the source text follow. The Mode is suitable,

i) Only for a reader, who belongs to the first group,

They realise the doctrine in brief, by listening/reading about the path, exclusive of gratification and suffering.

ii) Mainly for texts, which are condensed as well as expanded in meaning,

The Mode provides relatively brief explanations than the first three Modes.

### 5.1.5 *Lakkhaṇa hāra*, the Mode of Characteristics

The Mode 1, *Desanā hāra* explains characteristics of each concept of the text as a part of its interpretation and/or translation. This particular Mode explains the meaning of a text, providing common characteristics, which can be related to a single idea. When a single idea shares characteristics with a particular group of ideas, explanation must be on one of them. That way the rest is considered as already explained.( Ñāṇamoli,141).

#### 5.1.5.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The first step is paraphrasing the verse and the second step is illustrating shared characteristics of the main ideas of the text. Characteristics of concepts and their ways of connecting to the text are clearly described in *Netti* with examples (Ñāṇamoli, 45-50; 50-54; 141). There are four main concepts in the verse: acquired Mindfulness; developed Faculties; pacifying *saṅkhāra*; peaceful and a blissful state.

It is not necessary to explain the characteristics of each concept in this Mode, if they are belong to one group. For instance, the Five Controlling faculties have a shared characteristic of the co-existent with consciousness therefore illustrating one of them is sufficient.

## 5.1.5.2 Translation Procedure

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the verse**

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

**Step2: Illustrating Common Characteristics of Main Ideas**

The characteristic of Mindfulness is keeping the mind anchored in its concentrative object and it prevents from floating away or wavering (Ñāṇamoli, 27-28). With the gradual progress of Mindfulness, there develop the Five Controlling Faculties namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom. Faith has the characteristic of confidence. Those five have a collective characteristic that of the co-existence with Consciousness (*chitta*). They arise when Consciousness is arisen and cease when Consciousness is ceased (Ñāṇamoli, 30). *Saṅkhāra* or the volitional activities have the characteristic of developing existence or forming. (Ñāṇamoli, 47-8 ). Pacifying *Saṅkhāra* is viewing them as impermanent and soul-less. Its characteristics are considering the cognisable objects as not being determined by the conditional world as well the volitional activities as non-insistence (Ñāṇamoli, 46). Peace and bliss are united with the characteristic of 'Non- exemplifying.' (Ñāṇamoli, 82).

## 5.1.5.3 Translation

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ,*

(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

The characteristic of Mindfulness is keeping the mind anchored in its concentrative object and it prevents from floating away or wavering. With the gradual progress of Mindfulness, there develop the Five Controlling Faculties namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom. Faith has the characteristic of confidence. Those five have a collective characteristic that of the co-existence with Consciousness (*chitta*). They arise when Consciousness is arisen and cease when Consciousness is ceased. *Saṅkhāra* or the volitional activities have the characteristic of developing existence or forming. Pacifying *Saṅkhāra* is viewing them as impermanent and soul-less. Its characteristics are considering the cognisable objects as not being determined by the conditional world as well the volitional activities as non-insistence. Peace and bliss are united with the characteristic of 'Non- exemplifying.'

## 5.1.5.4 Constraints of the Mode

The Mode demands the highest level of understanding skills, since it illustrates only a part of the main idea. Therefore, it is suitable,

i) Only for the reader in the first group

It illustrates a part of a concept, but the rest is supposed to be understood by the reader himself. He must utilise the full capacity of knowledge and wisdom for the purpose.

ii) Mainly for a lengthy passage, but can apply for condensed and expanded too, considering the readership

## 5.1.6 *Catubyuha hāra,* the Mode of four- fold Arrangement

The Mode explains the meaning in accordance with four aspects in the teachings of the text: clarifying the grammatical structure of the statement; purpose or intention; the source of teachings; the consecutive sequences (Ñāṇamoli, 141-142).

### 5.1.6.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The first step is paraphrasing the verse and the second step is clarifying the grammatical structure of the text. The connection between the components such as nouns, verbs, prepositions must be clear especially of a text in the verse form. It becomes a major issue, when the text is either expanded or detailed. However, the grammatical components are clear in this verse as it is in the style of condensed.

The third step is highlighting the intention/purpose of the text. Intention must follow the same attitude in the text. For instance, the intention of the verse is to exhibit the idea of penetration (*nibbhedabhāgiya*), according to the classification of the division of 'the patterns of Dispensation' in *Netti* (Ñāṇamoli, 173-174). The interpretation also should convey the same. Translator is advised to follow the examples in *Netti* (Ñāṇamoli, 55-57) to follow the style.

The fourth step is pointing up the source of the text. The translator is instructed to deal with the other canonical text in the Tipiṭaka, if the relevant sources are not mentioned in the text itself.

The fifth step is explaining the consecutive sequences (*pubāpara sandhi*) in the text. In this context, it means the connectivity of all the ideas in the text. The ideas in the verse themselves are illustrated accordingly; therefore the meaning is not illustrated here to avoid repetition.

## 5.1.6.2 Translation Procedure

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the Verse**

'Acquiring mindfulness, the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

**Step 2: Clarifying the Grammatical Structure of the Text**

In this verse, '*Bhikkunī*' (the nun) is the subject and the verb is *paṭivijjhi* (achieved). Object is the cohesive term of '*padaṃ santaṃ saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*' (a blissful and a peaceful state by pacifying *saṅkhāra*). *Satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvā* (acquiring Mindfulness) is a subordinate clause and *upaṭṭhapetvā* (acquiring) is an auxiliary verb.

**Step 3: Illustrating Intention/Purpose of the Text.**

The intention of the verse is to emphasise that if a person seeks Peace and Bliss, for that she/he must start following the path from Mindfulness onwards. Then the meditator would pacify *saṅkhāra*, which is caused by Ignorance.

**Step 4: Illustrating the Source of the Text**

An *arahat* nun *Chālā*, with self-confident recited this verse to the *Māra*, the most evil one who approached to tempt her on sensual desires. [337]

## 5.1.6.3 Translation

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

In this verse, '*Bhikkunī*' (the nun) is the subject and the verb is *paṭivijjhi* (achieved). Object is the cohesive term of '*padaṃ santaṃ saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*' (a blissful and a peaceful state by pacifying *saṅkhāra*). *Satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvā* (acquiring Mindfulness) is a subordinate clause and *upaṭṭhapetvā* (acquiring) is an auxiliary verb.

[337] TT-1,.96.

The intention of the verse is to emphasise that if a person seeks Peace and Bliss, for that she/he must start following the path from Mindfulness onwards. Then the meditator would pacify *saṅkhāra*, which is caused by Ignorance.

An *arahat* nun *Chālā*, with self-confident recited this verse to the *Māra*, the most evil one who approached to tempt her on sensual desires.

### 5.1.6.4 Constraints of the Mode

Intention of the Mode is to clarify the meaning repeatedly, following four types of aspects. It employs repetition as a method of emphasising the same idea. Therefore, it is applicable,

i) Mainly for readers in the first groups, as they need a good amount of details to learn the doctrine
ii) For the reader in the first group as he is above the other groups in terms of the talents of comprehending
iii) For mainly a brief text, but can apply for a lengthy text also if the translator is interested

## 5.1.7 *Āvatta hāra*, the Mode of Conveying a Conversion

The Mode provides an explanation of a word or a concept, applying the 'proximate cause' and converting it into the opposite. For instance, when the text discusses about profitable aspects like 'Meditation,' the translator is preferred to discuss the cause for Meditation and the unprofitable results of 'lack of Meditation' as well.

### 5.1.7.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The first step is paraphrasing the verse and the second step is applying the Proximate Causes of the ideas in the text. Instructions are as mentioned in Mode 4, the *Padaṭṭhāna hāra*. There are four key terms in the verse: acquiring Mindfulness; developed Faculties; pacifying *saṅkhāra*; a peaceful and a blissful state.

The third step is illustrating opposite ideas of the proximate causes. *Netti* provides descriptions of concepts in both the approaches: profitable and unprofitable, therefore, it assists the translator to find the relevant explanation.

### 5.1.7.2 Translation Procedure

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the Verse**

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

**Step 2: Applying Proximate Causes on Ideas**

The proximate cause of Mindfulness is its four foundations, which are the constant awareness of Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and Cognizable objects. The process gradually develops five Controlling Faculties namely Faith,

Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom. The proximate cause of Faith is the firm confidence. The proximate cause of Vigour is Right Endeavour. (Ñāṇamoli, 47).[338] The proximate cause of Meditation is knowledge[339] (*ñāna*). The proximate causes of Wisdom is non-perplexity as Four Truths. (Ñāṇamoli, 47)

The meditator acquires the highest and the established Wisdom, when he/she reaches up to the state of right Meditation (*sammā samādhi*), the last requite of the path of Enlightenment. Therefore, Wisdom is the proximate cause of pacifying *saṅkhāra,* which has the proximate cause that of Ignorance (Ñāṇamoli, 47). Therefore, Wisdom is the proximate cause of a Peaceful and a Blissful state.

**Step 3: Opposite Ideas of the Proximate Causes**

As the opposite, when the first foundation of Mindfulness is not mentally cultured the first perversion (*vipallāsa*), admiring Physical states arises. Then the human views beauty in ugliness. When the second foundation is not mentally cultured, the second perversion, admiring Feeling arises. Then the human sees pleasure in the painful. When the third foundation is not mentally cultured, the third perversion, admiring the consciousness arises. Then the human sees permanence in impermanence. When the fourth foundation of Mindfulness is not mentally cultured, the fourth perversion, admiring cognizable objects arises. Then human sees the self in selflessness. (Ñāṇamoli, 117-118). Hence, human view volitional-activities or saṅkhāra at this stage as permanent, praiseworthy and self. This is the Ignorance, the origin of suffering.

---

[338] Agitation or the basic condition of making energy (Varma, 171).

[339] Knowledge (Varma, 106); knowledge, intelligence, insight, conviction, recognition (PED, 287) meditation (Nanamoli, 47).

## 5.1.7.3 Translation

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

The proximate cause of Mindfulness is its four foundations, which are the constant awareness of Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and Cognizable objects. The process gradually develops five Controlling Faculties namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom. The proximate cause of Faith is the firm confidence. The proximate cause of Vigour is Right Endeavour. The proximate cause of Meditation is knowledge (*ñāna*). The proximate cause of Wisdom is non-perplexity as Four Truths.

The meditator acquires the highest and the established Wisdom, when he/she reaches up to the state of right Meditation (*sammā samādhi*), the last requite of the path of Enlightenment. Therefore, Wisdom is the proximate cause of pacifying *saṅkhāra,* which has the proximate cause that of Ignorance. Therefore, Wisdom is the proximate cause of a Peaceful and a Blissful state.

As the opposite, when the first foundation of Mindfulness is not mentally cultured the first perversion (*vipallāsa*), admiring Physical states arises. Then the human views beauty in ugliness. When the second foundation is not mentally cultured, the second perversion, admiring Feeling arises. Then the human sees pleasure in the painful. When the third foundation is not mentally cultured, the

third perversion, admiring the consciousness arises. Then the human sees permanence in impermanence. When the fourth foundation of Mindfulness is not mentally cultured, the fourth perversion, admiring cognizable objects arises. Then human sees the self in selflessness. Hence, human view volitional-activities or saṅkhāra at this stage as permanent, praiseworthy and self. This is the Ignorance, the origin of suffering.

### 5.1.7.4 Constraints of the Mode

The Mode, first explains the near reason or the cause for a particular idea, followed by the opposites of the same. It exemplifies both the profitable and unprofitable sides of a phenomenon in order to bring an absolute understanding. Thus, it is applicable, two aspects:

i) Mainly for a reader belongs to the second group, as the explanation is neither brief nor lengthy

ii) For a reader, who is in the first group as he has the higher skills of understanding than the second

iii) Mainly for a passage which is expanded in facts, but suitable for condensed or detailed texts too

## 5.1.8 *Vibhatti hāra*, the Mode of an Analysis

The Mode analyses the meaning of a statement, considering four aspects of the text: intended meaning; the Mode of teachings according to the reader; the footing of ideas; one of the three factors of authority. The analysis is combined with the *Vichaya hāra* (2) and the *Yutti hāra* (3) thus, the meaning must be based

on one of the three factors of *Sutta, Vinaya* and *Dhammatā* as is prescribed. (Ñāṇamoli, 142-43)

### 5.1.8.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The first step is paraphrasing the verse and the second is step is illustrating the intended meaning. There are four terms in the text as 'acquired Mindfulness,' 'developed Faculties,' 'pacified *saṅkhāra*' and 'achieved a peaceful and a blissful state.' The Mode does not expect explanation on each idea at this point. The intention of the verse herein is correlated with the type of the discourses called, Penetration (*nibbhedabhāgiya sutta*) as is mentioned in the Mode 6, *Catubyuha hāra*. Examples are provided in *Netti* (Ñāṇamoli, 55-57) as well.

The third step is to explain the meaning of the text applying the proximate cause as is instructed in the Mode 4, *Padaṭṭhāana hāra*.

The fourth step is to examine the Mode of the teachings of the text. Ideas in this verse belong to the category of 'escape' (*nissaraṇa*). Therefore, the meaning must be explained in terms of 'means' and 'injunctions' as instructed in the Mode 1 (Ñāṇamoli, 17).

The fifth step is applying one of the three principles of authority as initiated in the Mode (3). When a Mode is combined with the Mode (2) or (3), one of the three formulas must follow the interpretation: the Four Noble Truths; the eradication of lust, hatred and delusion; the Law of Dependent Origination. The translation at this point will be constructed on the formula of Four Noble Truths.

## 5.1.8.2 Translation Procedure

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the Verse**

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

**Step 2: Illustrating the Intention of the Verse**

The intention of the verse is to emphasise that if a person seeks Peace and Bliss, for that she/he must start following the path from Mindfulness onwards. Then the meditator would pacify *saṅkhāra*, which is caused by Ignorance.

**Step 3: Explaining the Meaning Applying the Proximate Cause**

The proximate cause of Mindfulness is its four foundations, which are the constant awareness of Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and Cognizable objects. The process gradually develops five Controlling Faculties namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom. The proximate cause of Faith is the firm confidence. The proximate cause of Vigour is Right Endeavour. (Ñāṇamoli, 47). The proximate cause of Meditation is knowledge (*ñāna*). The proximate cause of Wisdom is non-perplexity as Four Truths. (Ñāṇamoli, 47)

The meditator acquires the highest and the established Wisdom, when he/she reaches up to the state of right Meditation (*sammā samādhi*), the last requite of the path of Enlightenment. Therefore, Wisdom is the proximate cause of pacifying *saṅkhāra,* which has the proximate cause that of Ignorance (Ñāṇamoli, 47). Therefore, Wisdom is the proximate cause of a Peaceful and a Blissful state.

**Step 4: Examine the Mode of the Teachings of the Text**

In other words, Mindfulness is illustrated herein as the leading technique of Escaping from the conditional world. Five Controlling Faculties and the other requisites are the Fruits of the gradual development towards Enlightenment. Pacifying *saṅkhāra* by viewing them as impermanent and sorrowful is the Means (*upāya*).

**Step 5: Applying one of the Three Principles in the Mode (3)**

The idea in the verse can be connected to the Four Noble Truths. When Mindfulness is in Mental Culture as the proximate cause, subject matters of Enlightenment are arisen (Ñāṇamoli, 52). This is the True path to attain Nibbana. With the systematic development of the eight-fold Noble Path, the meditator finally would come to the stage of realising that *saṅkhāra* is suffering and then views *saṅkhāra* as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less. This realisation is in accordance with understanding the Truth of misery and the Truth of ceasing misery. That way, the cause of misery is diagnosed and it causes for its remedy, which bestows Peace and Bliss called *Nibbāna* (Ñāṇamoli, 143).

## 5.1.8.3 Translation

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*

(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

The intention of the verse is to emphasise that if a person seeks Peace and Bliss, for that she/he must start following the path from Mindfulness onwards. Then the meditator would pacify *saṅkhāra*, which is caused by Ignorance.

The proximate cause of Mindfulness is its four foundations, which are the constant awareness of Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and Cognizable objects. The process gradually develops five Controlling Faculties namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom. The proximate cause of Faith is the firm confidence. The proximate cause of Vigour is Right Endeavour. The proximate cause of Meditation is knowledge (ñāna). The proximate cause of Wisdom is non-perplexity as Four Truths.

The meditator acquires the highest and the established Wisdom, when he/she reaches up to the state of right Meditation (samma samādhi), the last requite of the path of Enlightenment. Therefore, Wisdom is the proximate cause of pacifying *saṅkhāra,* which has the proximate cause that of Ignorance. Therefore, Wisdom is the proximate cause of a Peaceful and a Blissful state.

In other words, Mindfulness is illustrated herein as the leading technique of Escaping from the conditional world. Five Controlling Faculties and the other requisites are the Fruits of the gradual development towards Enlightenment.

Pacifying *saṅkhāra* by viewing them as impermanent and sorrowful is the Means (upāya). Attaining peaceful and blissful state detaching from the conditional world is Injunction.

The Four Noble Truths can express through the ideas in the verse. When Mindfulness is in Mental Culture as the proximate cause, subject matters of Enlightenment are arisen. This is the True path to attain Nibbana. With the systematic development of the eight-fold Noble Path, the meditator finally would come to the stage of realising that *saṅkhāra* is suffering and then views *saṅkhāra* as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less. This realisation is in accordance with understanding the Truth of misery and the Truth of ceasing misery. That way, the cause of misery is diagnosed and it causes for its remedy, which bestows Peace nd Bliss called *Nibbāna*.

.

### 5.1.8.4 Constraints of the Mode

The particular Mode explains briefly the intended meaning and exemplifies one of the three aspects of authority mentioned in the Mode (3). It does not provide much details aiming at the ordinary reader. Therefore, it is appropriate

i) Especially for the reader, who belongs to the third group as the reader requires more details than the other groups

ii) Generally for the readers in the first and the second group as they have a higher skills than the third group

iii) For a text, which is in medium length since the Mode does not provide lengthy interpretations like Modes 1, 2 and 3

## 5.1.9 *Parivattana hāra*, the Mode a Reversal

The Mode explains the meaning, applying the opposite ideas of a text. The approach exhibits a complete image of a concept associating with the paraphrased meaning, if the text is in the form of verse. (Ñāṇamoli, 143)

### 5.1.9.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The first step is paraphrasing the verse and the second step is explaining the opposite meaning of the text. The verse implies a profitable idea, thus the explanation must be the opposite idea or an unprofitable side of the concepts given. If a text reflects unprofitable aspects, the translator has to explain the profitable. Examples are available in *Netti* for further clarifications (Ñāṇamoli, 77-79; 143).

### 5.1.9.2 Translation Procedure

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the Verse**

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

**Step 2: Explaining the opposite meaning of the text**

As the condition of the wrong-effort *(micchā vāyāma)*, the wrong-mindfulness is occurred. When the wrong-mindfulness is arisen, the four Perversions (*vipallāsa*) occupy the mind. Thus, one assumes beauty in uglyness, feels pleasure in painful things, perceives self in the non-self and sees permanence in impermanence (Ñāṇamoli, 120) With the condition of four Perversions, Ignorance arises (Ñāṇamoli, 45). With the condition of Ignorance, *saṅkhāra* arise (Ñāṇamoli, 47). Then human perceives all the *saṅkhāra* or volitional-activities as permanent, admirable and self due to Ignorance. Thus, Ignorance, as the cause of misery leads to becoming, birth, decay, death, sorrow, lamentation, ill, grief, and despair.

## 5.1.9.3 Translation

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*

(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

As the condition of the wrong-effort *(micchā vāyāma)*, the wrong-mindfulness is occurred. When the wrong-mindfulness is arisen, the four Perversions occupy the mind. Thus, one assumes beauty in ugliness, feels pleasure in painful things, perceives self in the non-self and sees permanence in impermanence. With the condition of four Perversions, Ignorance arises. With the

condition of Ignorance, *saṅkhāra* arise. Then human perceives all the *saṅkhāra* or volitional-activities as permanent, admirable and self, due to Ignorance. Thus, Ignorance, as the cause of misery leads to becoming, birth, decay, death, sorrow, lamentation, ill, grief, and despair.

### 5.1.9.4 Constraints of the Mode

The Mode shows the profitable or unprofitable aspect to the reader according to the theme of the text. It provides the meaning in a condensed form therefore, is suitable,

i) For the readers, who belong to the first group

ii) For the three types of passages, which express meaning in brief, in expansion and in details

## 5.1.10 *Vevacana hāra*, the Mode of Synonyms

The Mode applies synonyms to elicit the essential factors in the text. It also observes the number of ideas in the text and clarifies each single idea in as many ways by providing synonyms. (Ñāṇamoli, 143-44)

### 5.1.10.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The first step is paraphrasing the verse. Numerical figures of main ideas in the text are considered in this Mode. Key concepts are to be selected among variously presented ideas. It avoids over interpretations and repetitions. This

particular verse has four concepts: 'acquired mindfulness,' 'developed faculties,' 'pacified *saṅkhāra*' and 'peaceful and blissful state.'

The second step is explaining main ideas applying synonyms. Single idea can be explained by using one or more synonyms according to the need of the reader. A dictionary of synonyms is provided in *Netti* (Ñāṇamoli, 80-84).

## 5.1.10.2 Translation Procedure

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the Verse**

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

**Step 2: Explaining Main Ideas by Synonyms**

Acquiring Mindfulness, diligence, prudence or concentration is the fruit of constant awareness or the continuous contemplating of Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and the Cognizable objects. (Ñāṇamoli, 166). The state will gradually develop the subject matters of Enlightenment called Four Supreme Efforts or Energies, Efforts or Psychic Powers and the developed Five Controlling Faculties respectively. Five faculties are namely Faith; Vigour or energy; Mindfulness; Meditation or concentration; Wisdom or intelligence. By completing all the thirty-seven factors or the requisites in the path, the nun acquired the

highest Wisdom or Science or Insight. (Ñāṇamoli, 81) With the arisen Wisdom she pacified, appeased *saṅkhāra,* determinations or volitional-activities. This state the nun explained as Blissful, Safe, Untainted, Peaceful and Happy (Ñāṇamoli, 82).

## 5.1.10.3 Translation

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*

(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra.*'

Acquiring Mindfulness, diligence, prudence or concentration is the fruit of constant awareness or the continuous contemplating of Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and the Cognizable objects. The state will gradually develop the subject matters of Enlightenment called Four Supreme Efforts or Energies, Efforts or Psychic Powers and the developed Five Controlling Faculties respectively. Five faculties are namely Faith; Vigour or energy; Mindfulness; Meditation or concentration; Wisdom or intelligence. By completing all the thirty-seven factors or the requisites in the path, the nun acquired the highest Wisdom or Science or Insight. With the arisen Wisdom she pacified, appeased *saṅkhāra,* determinations or volitional-activities. The the stated the state nun explained as Blissful, Safe, Untainted, Peaceful and Happy.

### 5.1.10.4 Constraints of the Mode

This is one of the most flexible Modes, which is suitable for applying for the three types of readers as well for the three types of doctrinal expositions. The number of synonyms can be incorporated, considering the criterion mentioned. For instance, more synonyms can be included for the target reader in the third group, who require many details. Thus, it is suitable for,

i) The readers, who belong to all the three groups,
ii) The passages, which express meaning in all the three styles: condensed, expanded and detailed,

## 5.1.11 *Paññatti hāra*, the Mode of Concepts

The Mode deals with knowability of a concept and explicates the meaning of a text as a notion or a description. However, 'any type of explanatory idea that describes the nature of Four Noble Truths' is a designation in this context (Ñāṇamoli, 84). In other words, whatever the explanation is given, but it must express the Four Noble Truths. Synonyms too can be incorporated to explain the facts further. (Ñāṇamoli, 144)

### 5.1.11.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The first step is paraphrasing the verse. Like the Mode 10, *Vevachana hāra* the key concepts are to be selected among variously presented ideas to avoid over

interpretations and repetitions. The verse has four concepts: 'acquiring mindfulness,' 'developed faculties,' 'pacifying *saṅkhāra*' and 'peaceful and blissful state.'

The second step is explaining concepts in terms of Four Noble Truths and the instructions are as is stated in the Mode 1. Apart from that, synonyms can be used to clarify the meaning if necessary (Ñāṇamoli, 84-92). Thus, the Mode designate the meaning of a text, correlating the Four Noble Truths and synonyms.

### 5.1.11.2 Translation Procedure

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the verse**

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

**Step 2: Explaining Concepts in Terms of 'Four Noble Truths'**

The whole idea of the verse can be explain in terms of the Four-Noble Truths. When Mindfulness or the attentiveness is in Mental Culture as the proximate cause, subject matters of Enlightenment are arisen (Ñāṇamoli, 52). This is the True path to attain Peace, Science and Bliss called Nibbāna. With the systematic development of the eight-fold Noble Path, the meditator finally would come to the stage of realising the *saṅkhāra*, the volitional activities or preparations

as suffering and a misery. Then he/she views *saṅkhāra* as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less. This realisation is in accordance with understanding the Truth of misery and the Truth of ceasing misery. That way, the cause or the origin of misery is diagnosed and it causes for its remedy, which bestows Peace and Bliss called *Nibbāna* (Ñāṇamoli, 143).

## 5.1.11.3 Translation

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*

(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

The idea of the verse can be explain in terms of the Four-Noble Truths. When Mindfulness or the attentiveness is in Mental Culture as the proximate cause, subject matters of Enlightenment are arisen (Ñāṇamoli, 52). This is the True path to attain Peace, Science and Bliss called Nibbāna. With the systematic development of the eight-fold Noble Path, the meditator finally would come to the stage of realising the *saṅkhāra*, the volitional activities or preparations as suffering and a misery. Then he/she views *saṅkhāra* as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less. This realisation is in accordance with understanding the Truth of misery and the Truth of ceasing misery. That way, the cause or the origin of misery is diagnosed and it causes for its remedy, which bestows Peace and Bliss called *Nibbāna* (Ñāṇamoli, 143).

### 5.1.11.4 Constrains of the Mode

Function of the Mode is similar to the 'Mode of conveying by synonyms' (5.2.10). However, the meaning should be explicit within the formula of Four Truths. Number of descriptions can be arranged by using synonyms according to the necessity of the reader. For instance, more synonyms are required for the reader, included in the third group as s/he realises the doctrine with detailed descriptions. The Mode is thus, suitable for,

i) The readers who belong to all the three groups,
ii) Three types of texts, which are brief or expanded or detailed in meaning,

## 5.1.12 *Otaraṇa hāra*, the Mode of Ways of Entry

The term '*otaraṇa*' denotes 'conquering,' and what is to be conquered is *sansāraogha* or the flood of persuading rebirths. The Mode suggests to explain the meaning of a text in <u>one</u> of the five aspects, which represent the key concepts of the doctrine: Dependent origination; Controlling Faculty of Wisdom;[340]Aggregates;[341] Elements; Bases (Ñāṇamoli, 144-45).

[340] (Netti, 96); (Varma, 122).
[341] *Khandha*: aggregates (Varma, 94); categories (Ñāṇamoli, 294).

## 5.1.12.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The first step is paraphrasing the verse and the second step is connecting the meaning of the text with one of the five formulas. Unlike other Modes, herein the translation of the text would be one of them. The Mode experiments on a particular piece of meaning with its different ways of phrasing. The styles of entering ideas are provided in *Netti* with examples (Ñāṇamoli, 93-100). However, all the five options will be described below to facilitate the translator.

## 5.1.12.2 Translation Procedure

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the verse**

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

**Step 2: Connecting the Meaning of the Text with One of the Five Formulas**

**1. The Way of Entry by Dependent Origination**

The idea of the verse can be explain in terms of Dependent Origination because it explains the relation between the cause and its effect. Any kind of phenomenon in

the conditional world does not exist by its own but is dependent. Hence, depending upon the development of Mindfulness there the five Controlling Faculties namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom (Ñāṇamoli, 52) are progressed. With the gradual developments of the five Controlling Faculties, the meditator attains the constituents of the eight-fold Noble Path. This is the state of achieving the highest training, highest Wisdom, (*adhi paññā*), Insight (Ñāṇamoli, 81).[342] With the arising of Wisdom, comes cessation of ignorance. From cessation of ignorance, comes cessation of *saṅkhāra*. From cessation of saṅkhāra comes, cessation of consciousness. From cessation of consciousness comes cessation of Mentality and Materiality (*nāma rūpa*). From cessation of Mentality and Materiality comes, cessation of the six senses. From cessation of the six senses comes, cessation of contact. From cessation of feeling comes, cessation of craving. From the cessation of craving comes, cessation of becoming. From cessation of becoming comes, cessation of birth. From cessation of birth comes, cessation of decay, death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief and illnesses.

### 2. The way of Entry by Faculties

Due to the systematic progression of Mindfulness there develop Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom. With the gradual developments of the five Controlling Faculties, the meditator attains the constituents of the eight-fold Noble Path. This is the state of achieving the highest training, highest Wisdom, (*adhi paññā*), Insight (Ñāṇamoli, 81). Established Wisdom is predominant over Ignorance, which is the proximate cause of *saṅkhāra.* Therefore,

[342] A set of synonyms is provided to describe the state. (G. 81)

the meditator would view all *saṅkhāra* as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less through arisen Wisdom. Stilling or pacifying *saṅkhāra* is the fruit of seeing through. That way, the cause of suffering is diagnosed and abandoned. It is the supreme state of achieving a Peaceful and a Blissful state called *Nibbāna* (Ñāṇamoli, 143).

### 3. The way of Entry by Aggregates

When Mindfulness become established, there the meditator achieves a three kinds of aggregates namely, Virtue, Meditation and the Wisdom *(sīla, samādhi, paññā*) (Ñāṇamoli, 93). With arisen Wisdom, the meditator would view all *saṅkhāra* as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less. That way, the cause of suffering is diagnosed and abandoned. It is the supreme state of achieving a Peaceful and a Blissful state called *Nibbāna* (Ñāṇamoli, 143).

### 4. The way of Entry by Elements

When Mindfulness is established in the mind, the contact, which discriminates Elements, come to cessation. The eye element, sight element, eye-consciousness element; the ear element, sound element, ear-consciousness element; the nose element, odour element, nose-consciousness element; the tongue element, taste form element, tongue-consciousness element; the body element, touch element, body -consciousness element; the mind element, cognizable object element, mind-consciousness element are ceased (Ñāṇamoli, 80; 93-94). This is the state of pacifying *saṅkhāra* or volitional-activities. That way the cause of

suffering is diagnosed and abandoned. It is the supreme state of achieving a Peaceful and a Blissful state called *Nibbāna* (Ñāṇamoli, 143).

**5. The way of Entry by Bases**

The sight element is included in the eye-base. The sound element is included in the ear- base. The taste element is included in the tongue-base. The odour element is included in the nose-base. The touch element is included in the body-base. The cognisable object element is included in the mind base (Ñāṇamoli, 94).

When Mindfulness is achieved there is a abandon of discriminating those six Sense- Bases. That way there is a cessation of discriminating eye-base, ear-base, tongue-base, nose-base, body-base and the mind base along with their respective external objects. This is the state of pacifying *saṅkhāra* or volitional-activities, which are comprised with Bases. That way, the cause of suffering is diagnosed and abandoned. It is the supreme state of attaining Peace and Bliss called *Nibbāna.*

## 5.1.12.3 Translation

Unlike the other Modes, the translation would be one of the interpretations of the five.

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*

(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra.*'

The idea of the verse can be explain in terms of Dependent Origination because it explains the relation between the cause and its effect. Any kind of phenomenon in the conditional world does not exist by its own but is dependent. Hence, depending upon the development of Mindfulness there the five Controlling Faculties namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom are progressed. With the gradual developments of the five Controlling Faculties, the meditator attains the constituents of the eight-fold Noble Path. This is the state of achieving the highest training, highest Wisdom, (*adhi paññā*), Insight. With the arising of Wisdom, comes cessation of ignorance. From cessation of ignorance, comes cessation of saṅkhāra. From cessation of saṅkhāra comes, cessation of consciousness. From cessation of consciousness comes cessation of Mentality and Materiality (*nāma rūpa*). From cessation of Mentality and Materiality comes, cessation of the six senses. From cessation of the six senses comes, cessation of contact. From cessation of feeling comes, cessation of craving. From the cessation of craving comes, cessation of becoming. From cessation of becoming comes, cessation of birth. From cessation of birth comes, cessation of decay, death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, grief and illnesses.

### 2. The way of Entry by Faculties

Due to the systematic progression of Mindfulness there develop Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom. With the gradual developments of the five Controlling Faculties, the meditator attains the constituents of the eight-fold Noble Path. This is the state of achieving the highest training, highest Wisdom, (*adhi paññā*), Insight (Ñāṇamoli, 81).[343] Established Wisdom is

[343] A set of synonyms are provided to describe the state. (G. 81)

predominant over Ignorance, which is the proximate cause of *saṅkhāra.* Therefore, the meditator would view all *saṅkhāra* as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less through arisen Wisdom. Stilling or pacifying *saṅkhāra* is the fruit of seeing through. That way, the cause of suffering is diagnosed and abandoned. It is the supreme state of achieving a Peaceful and a Blissful state called *Nibbāna* (Ñāṇamoli, 143).

### 3. The way of Entry by Aggregates

When Mindfulness become established, there the meditator achieves a three kinds of aggregates namely, Virtue, Meditation and the Wisdom (*sīla, samādhi, paññā*). With arisen Wisdom, the meditator would view all *saṅkhāra* as impermanent, sorrowful and soul-less. That way, the cause of suffering is diagnosed and abandoned. It is the supreme state of achieving a Peaceful and a Blissful state called *Nibbāna..*

### 4. The way of Entry by Elements

When Mindfulness is established in the mind, the contact, which discriminates Elements, come to cessation. The eye element, sight element, eye-consciousness element; the ear element, sound element, ear-consciousness element; the nose element, odour element, nose-consciousness element; the tongue element, taste form element, tongue-consciousness element; the body element, touch element, body -consciousness element; the mind element, cognizable object element, mind-consciousness element are ceased. This is the state of pacifying *saṅkhāra* or volitional-activities. That way the cause of suffering is diagnosed and

abandoned. It is the supreme state of achieving a Peaceful and a Blissful state called *Nibbāna.*

**5. The way of Entry by Bases**

The sight element is included in the eye-base. The sound element is included in the ear- base. The taste element is included in the tongue-base. The odour element is included in the nose-base. The touch element is included in the body-base. The cognisable object element is included in the mind base.

When Mindfulness is achieved there is a abandon of discriminating those six Sense- Bases. That way there is a cessation of discriminating eye-base, ear-base, tongue-base, nose-base, body-base and the mind base along with their respective external objects. This is the state of pacifying *saṅkhāra* or volitional-activities, which are comprised with Bases. That way, the cause of suffering is diagnosed and abandoned. It is the supreme state of attaining Peace and Bliss called *Nibbāna*

## 5.1.12.4 Constraints of the Mode

The Mode implies one aspect out of five at a time to make the reader aware of a particular idea. However, the translator can select suitable option, concerning the reader. It accepts expanded accounts and is appropriate,

i) Mainly for the reader belongs to the second groups,

It is not suitable for the third group as the mod is less informative.

ii) For the reader belongs to the first group, as s/he has higher comprehending level than the second group

iii) For the texts, imply all the three styles of condensed, expanded or detailed.

## 5.1.13 *Sodhana hāra*, the Mode of Clearing- up

The Mode examines whether the core message of the text, particularly in the form of a question has been clarified by the text itself or not. If not, the question is considered as unanswered (Ñāṇamoli, 100-103). Answer in this context means the 'instigation' or the 'initial subject matter'[344] (*ārambha*) of the text. It clarifies that the idea of 'why the teaching has been taught' (Ñāṇamoli, 145)

### 5.1.13.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The first step is paraphrasing the verse and the second step is examining the Instigation of the text. This verse is not in the form of a question. However, the instigation of the verse herein has also not been cleared up since the 'initial fact that leads to be mindful' is yet to be clarified. (Ñāṇamoli,102)

[344] Ñāṇamoli,101

## 5.1.13.2 Translation Procedure

Eg: satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā
paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ,
(ST.7-2/182)

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the verse**

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

**Step 2: Examining the Instigation of a text**

Wisdom is the initial force, which restrained all the streams called sufferings in the conditional world and Wisdom is the same initiative force, which leads a human towards Mindfulness. (Ñāṇamoli, 102). Therefore, Wisdom is the light or science instigates beings to be mindful and attain peaceful and blissful state called Nibbāna.

## 5.1.13.3 Translation

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ,*
(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

Wisdom is the initial force, which restrained all the streams called sufferings in the conditional world and Wisdom is the same initiative force, which leads a human towards Mindfulness. (Ñāṇamoli, 102). Therefore, Wisdom is the light or science instigates beings to be mindful and attain peaceful and blissful state called Nibbāna.

### 5.1.13.4 Constraints of the Mode

As the Mode only clears up instigation of the ideas in the text, it is less detailed. It is applicable,

i) For only the reader in the first group,

ii) For all types of passages: condensed, expanded and detailed,

## 5.1.14 *Adhiṭṭhāna hāra* the Mode of Terms of Expression

The Mode explains how to deal with alternative terms to convey the meaning of a text. Ideas in the text will be included under the heads of 'unity' (*ekatthatā*) and 'diversity' (*vemattatā*). However, the basic attitude of a text must not be changed. For instance, a positive attitude must imply, if the text expresses the same (Ñāṇamoli,145-46).

### 5.1.14.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The first step is paraphrasing the word and the second step is explaining the ideas of the text in terms of unity and diversity. When a word is in unity, the meaning can be explained by applying various aspects (Ñāṇamoli,103-109). In a

situations of asking a question in terms of unity, the answer should be in unity and vice versa (Ñāṇamoli, 109). In this verse, there are four key concepts. Acquiring Mindfulness, developing Faculties and pacifying *saṅkhāra* are unified terms while the terms 'a peaceful state' and 'a blissful state' are in diversity.

## 5.1.14.2 Translation Procedure

EX: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the verse**

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

**Step 2: Explaining the Text in terms of Unity and Diversity**

Acquiring Mindfulness is unity. Achieving constant awareness of Physical states, Constant awareness of Feeling Consciousness is the third foundation of mindfulness and constant awareness of Cognizable objects is diversity (Ñāṇamoli, 166).

Developed Faculties is unity. Developing Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom is diversity.

Pacifying *saṅkhāra* is unity. Ceasing volitional activities called in-breath and out-breath, thinking and exploring, perception or feeling, memories and intentions is diversity (Ñāṇamoli, 29).

Attaining Peace and Bliss are Diversity. Attaining Nibbāna is unity.

## 5.1.14.3 Translation

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

Acquiring Mindfulness is unity. Achieving constant awareness of Physical states, Constant awareness of Feeling Consciousness is the third foundation of mindfulness and constant awareness of Cognizable objects is diversity.

Developed Faculties is unity. Developing Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom is diversity.

Pacifying *saṅkhāra* is unity. Ceasing volitional activities called in-breath and out-breath, thinking and exploring, perception or feeling, memories and intentions is diversity.

Attaining Peace and Bliss are Diversity. Attaining Nibbāna is unity.

## 5.1.14. 4 Constraints of the Mode

The Mode permits to enhance the meaning of a concept from the nuclear point to a far end of diversity. The translator is able to make the core idea clear for the target group, bringing more interpretations. The function of the Mode is quite similar to the Modes of Synonyms (10) and Descriptions (11). It is suitable,

i) For the readers, who belongs to all the three groups

ii) For all the three types of passages, which are condensed, expanded and detailed in meaning.

## 5.1.15 *Parikkhāra hāra*, the Mode of Requisites

The Mode illustrates how a particular idea generates more ideas due to the relation between cause and the condition. The idea that generates another idea becomes the requisite of the former (Ñāṇamoli, 109-14; 146-47)).

### 5.1.15.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The step one is paraphrasing the verse and the second step is clarifying the main ideas of the text applying the relation, cause and effect. The ideas of the verse itself are in consecutive order. There are terms four main concepts in the text: acquiried Mindfulness; developed Faculties; pacified *saṅkhāra*; achieved a peaceful and a blissful state. The cause and condition do not exist together at a time but are consecutive. (Ñāṇamoli,109-114).

## 5.1.15.2 Translation Procedure

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the verse**

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

**Step 2: Clarifying the Main Ideas of the Text Applying their Cause and Condition**

With Wisdom as condition, Mindfulness arises. Its cause is its individual essence or else its Primary Material Qualities.[345] With Mindfulness as condition, the five Controlling Faculties namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness Meditation and Wisdom arise (Ñāṇamoli, 28).

With Ignorance as condition, *saṅkhāra* arise. Its cause is its individual essence or else its Primary Material Qualities. With *saṅkhāra* as condition, Consciousness arises. Its cause is its individual essence or the Primary Material Qualities. With Consciousness as condition, the Mentality and Materiality[346] arise.

When Wisdom is achieved by acquiring Mindfulness, the Wisdom interrupts the cause and therefore it ceases Consciousness. This is the state of

---

[345] *Sabhāva rūpa*: primary material qualities or the Conditional Material Qualities, which have their own kinds and characteristics and also called Material Qualities of Differential Characteristics (Varma,p.128); individual essence (Ñāṇamoli, 305 )

[346] *Nāma rūpa*, (Varma, 106); name and form (Ñāṇamoli, 297 :302 )

pacifying *saṅkhāra*, No Mentality and Materiality exists without cause and its condition (Ñāṇamoli, 30). The fruit is Piece and Bliss called Nibbāna.

## 5.1.15.3 Translation

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ,*

(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.

With Wisdom as condition, Mindfulness arises. Its cause is its individual essence or else its Primary Material Qualities. With Mindfulness as condition, the five Controlling Faculties namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness Meditation and Wisdom arise.

With Ignorance as condition, *saṅkhāra* arise. Its cause is its individual essence or else its Primary Material Qualities. With *saṅkhāra* as condition, Consciousness arises. Its cause is its individual essence or the Primary Material Qualities. With Consciousness as condition, the Mentality and Materiality arise.

When Wisdom is achieved by acquiring Mindfulness, the Wisdom interrupts the cause and therefore it ceases Consciousness. This is the state of pacifying *saṅkhāra*, No Mentality and Materiality exists without cause and its condition. The fruit is Piece and Bliss called Nibbāna.

### 5.1.15.4 Constraints of the Mode

The relationship of condition and cause clarifies how an idea generates and continues as a phenomenon. It demands higher skills of understanding. It is applicable,

i) Mainly for the reader, who belongs to the second group

ii) For the reader from first group as he has higher comprehending skills than the second group

iii) For all the three types of passages: brief, expanded and detailed in meaning

## 5.1.16 *Samāropaṇa hāra*, the Mode of Co-ordination

The Mode coordinates four aspects for conveying meaning: proximate cause; synonymy; the techniques of Mental Culture; abandoning Taints.[347] These components are considered as successive phenomena towards the path of Nibbāna (Ñāṇamoli, 114-118; 147).

### 5.1.16.1 Instructions for Applying the Mode

The first step is paraphrasing the verse and the second step is explaining the key ideas of the text applying those five concepts. The verse has four consecutive ideas: acquiring Mindfulness; developing Faculties; pacifying *saṅkhāra;* achieving peaceful and a blissful state. Applying the proximate causes and synonyms are

[347] *Kilesa*: taints; corruptibilities; torments (Varma, 96); defilements (Ñāṇamoli, 294).

stated as Mode 3 and Mode 10 respectively. The techniques of Mental Culture and abandoning Taints are illustrated in *Netti* in details.

## 5.1.16.2 Translation Procedure

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

**Step 1: Paraphrasing the verse**

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

**Step 2: Applying Five Criterions on Key Concepts**

The proximate cause of Mindfulness is its four foundations, which are the constant awareness of Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and Cognizable objects. The process gradually develops five Controlling Faculties namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom. The proximate cause of Faith is the firm confidence. The proximate cause of Vigour is Right Endeavour. (Ñāṇamoli, 47). The proximate cause of Meditation is knowledge. The proximate causes of Wisdom is non-perplexity as Four Truths. (Ñāṇamoli, 47) The meditator acquires the highest and the established Wisdom, when he/she reaches up to the state of right Meditation (*sammā samādhi*), the last requite of the path of Enlightenment. Therefore, Wisdom is the proximate cause of pacifying *saṅkhāra,* which has the proximate cause that of Ignorance (Ñāṇamoli, 47). Therefore, Wisdom is the

proximate cause of a Peaceful and a Blissful state. (Correlated with proximate cause)

In other words, acquiring Mindfulness, diligence, prudence or concentration is the fruit of constant awareness or the continuous contemplating of Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and the Cognizable objects. (Ñāṇamoli, 166). The state will gradually develop the subject matters of Enlightenment called Four Supreme Efforts or Energies, Efforts or Psychic Powers and the developed Five Controlling Faculties respectively. Five faculties are namely Faith; Vigour or energy; Mindfulness; Meditation or concentration; Wisdom or intelligence. By completing all the thirty-seven factors or the requisites in the path, the nun acquired the highest Wisdom or Science or Insight. (Ñāṇamoli, 81) With the arisen Wisdom she pacified, appeased *saṅkhāra,* determinations or volitional-activities. The state the nun explained as Blissful, Safe, Untainted, Peaceful and Happy (Ñāṇamoli, 82). (Correlated with Synonym)

The idea of the verse can be explained in terms of *bhāvanā* or Mental Culture. When Mindfulness is in the state of Mental Culture, the four Foundations, namely Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and Cognizable objects are emanated. Their manifestation is constant awareness or watchfulness (Ñāṇamoli, 166). When those four Foundations of Mindfulness are in the state of Mental Culture, there the four Supreme Efforts are emanated. When the four Supreme Efforts are in the state of Mental Culture, there the four Psychic Powers are emanated. When the four bases of Psychic Powers are in the state of Mental Culture, there the five Controlling Faculties, Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom are developed. When the five Controlling Faculties are in the state of Mental Culture, there the five Forces are developed. When the five Forces are in the state of Mental Culture, there the seven Factors of Enlightenment are emanated. When the seven Factors of Enlightenment are in the state of Mental

Culture, there the eight-fold Noble Path is emanated. Therefore, all the requisites or the subject matters in the path towards Enlightenment are emanated through Mental Culture, since those factors have a shared characteristic of Enhancing (Ñāṇamoli, 52). This development pacifies *saṅkhāra*, which are the volitional-activities in the conditional world. Where *saṅkhāra* is stilled there the state of Peace and Bliss called Nibbāna. (Correlated with Mental Culture)

The process, illustrated in the verse can be explained in terms of cessation. The constant awareness of Physical states abandons the first perversion, viewing beauty in ugliness. The constant awareness of Feeling abandons the second perversion, viewing pleasure in the painful. The constant awareness of the Consciousness abandons the third perversion, seeing permanence in impermanence. The constant awareness of Cognizable objects abandons the fourth perversion, seeing self in selflessness (Ñāṇamoli, 117-118). There comes the state of cessation of *saṅkhāra,* when all the requisites of the path of Enlightenment are achieved by the gradual development of Mindfulness. It is the state of supreme Bliss and Peace. (Correlated with the ways of abundance)

## 5.1.16.3 Translation

Eg: *satiṃ upaṭṭhapetvāna - bhikkhunī bhāvitindriyā*
*paṭivijjhi padaṃ santaṃ - saṅkhārūpasamaṃ sukhaṃ*
(ST.7-2/182)

'Acquiring mindfulness the nun with developed faculties, achieved the peaceful and blissful state by pacifying the *saṅkhāra*.'

The proximate cause of Mindfulness is its four foundations, which are the constant awareness of Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and Cognizable objects. The process gradually develops five Controlling Faculties namely Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom. The proximate cause of Faith is the firm confidence. The proximate cause of Vigour is Right Endeavour. The proximate cause of Meditation is knowledge (*ñāna*). The proximate causes of Wisdom are non-perplexity as Four Truths. The meditator acquires the highest and the established Wisdom, when he/she reaches up to the state of right Meditation (*sammā samādhi*), the last requite of the path of Enlightenment. Therefore, Wisdom is the proximate cause of pacifying *saṅkhāra,* which has the proximate cause that of Ignorance. Therefore, Wisdom is the proximate cause of a Peaceful and a Blissful state.

In other words, acquiring Mindfulness, diligence, prudence or concentration is the fruit of constant awareness or the continuous contemplating of Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and the Cognizable objects. The state will gradually develop the subject matters of Enlightenment called Four Supreme Efforts or Energies, Efforts or Psychic Powers and the developed Five Controlling Faculties respectively. Five faculties are namely Faith; Vigour or energy; Mindfulness; Meditation or concentration; Wisdom or intelligence. By completing all the thirty-seven factors or the requisites in the path, the nun acquired the highest Wisdom or Science or Insight. With the arisen Wisdom she pacified, appeased *saṅkhāra,* determinations or volitional-activities. The nun explained this state as Blissful, Safe, Untainted, Peaceful and Happy.

The idea of the verse can be explained in terms of *bhāvanā* or Mental Culture. When Mindfulness is in the state of Mental Culture, the four Foundations, namely Physical states, Feeling Consciousness and Cognizable objects are emanated. Their manifestation is constant awareness or watchfulness. When those

four Foundations of Mindfulness are in the state of Mental Culture, there the four Supreme Efforts are emanated. When the four Supreme Efforts are in the state of Mental Culture, there the four Psychic Powers are emanated. When the four bases of Psychic Powers are in the state of Mental Culture, there the five Controlling Faculties, Faith, Vigour, Mindfulness, Meditation and Wisdom are developed. When the five Controlling Faculties are in the state of Mental Culture, there the five Forces are developed. When the five Forces are in the state of Mental Culture, there the seven Factors of Enlightenment are emanated. When the seven Factors of Enlightenment are in the state of Mental Culture, there the eight-fold Noble Path is emanated. Therefore, all the requisites or the subject matters in the path towards Enlightenment are emanated through Mental Culture, since those factors have a shared characteristic of Enhancing. This development pacifies *saṅkhāra*, which are the volitional-activities in the conditional world. Where *saṅkhāra* is stilled there the state of Peace and Bliss called Nibbāna.

The process, illustrated in the verse can be explained in terms of cessation. The constant awareness of Physical states abandons the first perversion, viewing beauty in ugliness. The constant awareness of Feeling abandons the second perversion, viewing pleasure in the painful. The constant awareness of the Consciousness abandons the third perversion, seeing permanence in impermanence. The constant awareness of Cognizable objects abandons the fourth perversion, seeing self in selflessness. There comes the state of cessation of *saṅkhāra,* when all the requisites of the path of Enlightenment are achieved by the gradual development of Mindfulness. It is the state of supreme Bliss and Peace.

### 5.1.16.4 Constraints of the Mode

Correlating the idea with four different ways as proximate cause, synonymy, Mental Culture and abandoning defilements will clarify the meaning of a text fully. It is appropriate,

i) For the reader in the third group
ii) For the readers in the other two groups
iii) For a text brief in content but can apply on a expanded content as well

## 5.2. Conclusion for the Demonstration- I

Techniques of explaining the doctrine in *Netti* entail a higher capacity for clarification and aim at precise understanding. Modes of conveying messages enhance communicability. As is elaborated in the second chapter, the Modes of interpretation, which are the fundamentals of translation as well, can apply with a thorough investigation of two interrelated principles.

1) The styles or types of expressions in the text
2) The level of comprehending skills of the target group

The first criterion refers the three main Modes of expressing meaning of a text in the Buddhist system, namely the condensed, expanded and detailed.

i) A text, which is condensed in meaning, expresses the technique of Escape

ii) A text, which is expanded in meaning, expresses two techniques of 'Disappointment' and Escape

iii) A text, which is detailed in meaning, expresses the techniques of Gratification, Disappointment and Escape

The second criterion stands for the intensity of comprehension of the target group, which is correlated to the first, as is stated below (Ñāṇamoli,15).

i) A reader/listener, who may realize the doctrine in the beginning, which is condensed in meaning. (He understands 'what is heard' by wisdom.)

ii) A reader/listener, who may realize the doctrine, which is expanded in meaning. (He understands 'what has been heard' by the cognition.)

iii) A reader/listener, who may realize the doctrine, which is detailed in meaning. (He understands 'what has been heard' by Diligence and Cognition.)

All those three cases have ascendant relationship with the time. The first group would realise the doctrine within a minimum period. The term 'heard' (*suta*) signifies the quickest understanding at that 'very moment' of hearing (or reading). Thus, the reader, who may fall in the first group, must have a thorough knowledge in Buddhist doctrine along with wisdom. The second group takes more time than the first group to comprehend the doctrine because their realisation is associated

with Cognition. The readers, who may fall in the third group, require more doctrinal disquisitions than the two other groups since they understand the doctrine through both Cognition and Diligence. A non-Buddhist English speaking reader, who has been selected as the target group in this study thus falls into the third group. The explanation, provided for the third group is perceivable by two other groups as well effortlessly, due to their high skills in perception.

The sixteen Modes can divide into three basic groups, according to their aptness of applying on the target reader, concerning the quantity of details provided by each Mode. The particular set of Modes function only with the appropriate target group, thus the selection criteria must be followed strictly in translation.

Four Modes are suitable for the reader, who belongs to the first group out of sixteen Modes as is illustrated below.

i) *Padaṭṭhāna hāra* (4), the Mode of Footing,
ii) *Lakkhaṇa hāra* (5), the Mode of Characteristics,
iii) *Catubyūha hāra* (6), the Mode of conveying Four-fold Arrangements,
iv) *Sodhana hāra* (13), the Mode of a Clearing up

They are only applicable for the reader in the first group, who realises the meaning of a passage quickly. They clarify the meaning in brief, which is able to comprehend through wisdom. The texts, which are condensed in meaning, can therefore clarify further a little, applying those Modes. However, readers duly understand the meaning of a text, expanded or detailed in meaning. Apart from them, the three Modes (10), (11) and (14) prescribed for the third group of the

readers are applicable for this target group, as the Modes have the quality of adjustment irrespective of the text and the reader.

Four Modes are suitable for the reader in the second group as is stated below.

i) *Āvatta hāra* (7), the Mode of Conveying a Conversion

ii) *Parivattana hāra* (9), the Mode of conveying a Reversal

iii) *Otaraṇa hāra* (12), the Mode of conveying Ways of entry of Truth

iv) *Parikkhāra hāra* (15), the Mode of conveying Requisites

Those Modes are designed for providing more explanations than the Modes belong to the first group. Thus, the meaning of a text can expand at this level, as the reader of the second group needs cognitive skills to comprehend the meaning of a text. The first group understands the expanded text, but not the third group.

Eight Modes are suitable for the third group of the readers, where the non-Buddhist English reader represents as are illustrated below.

i) *Desanā hāra* (1), the Mode of conveying Teachings,

ii) *Vicaya hāra* (2), the Mode of conveying an Investigation,

iii) *Yutti hāra* (3), the Mode of conveying a Construing,

iv) *Vibhatti hara* (8), the Mode of an Analysis

v) *Vevacana hāra* (10), the Mode of conveying Synonyms,

vi) *Paññatti hāra* (11), the Mode of conveying Description,

vii) *Adhiṭṭāna hāra* (14), the Mode of conveying Terms of Expression

viii) *Samāropaṇa hāra* (16), the Mode of Co-ordination,

Those eight Modes facilitate to grasp the meaning without paying much effort, due to its enhancing quality. Thus, the Modes can apply for translating the doctrine in the sample text, Therigāthā for the non-Buddhist English reader.
It is noteworthy that the three Modes numbered, (10), (11) and (14) are adjustable for all the three categories and shared the function with the readership.

The translator retains the option to select one or more of those Modes for the target group three. An advantage of focusing on the third group is its broad based representation over the other two groups. For instance, group two stands for the group one, excluding the third group. Inevitably, this translation will be equally useful:

1) For the English reader of the first group, who is well acquainted with the doctrine, and endowed with wisdom and,
2) For the English reader of the second group, having only a medium level of knowledge of the doctrine, and accesses ideas by cognition

Translations, producing by those eight Modes are different in terms of length, though their treatment is similar in conveying meaning. Subsequently, the translator may come across passages of teachings different in length too. It may create technical matters. Hence, one option is that the translator can avoid a Mode, which provides a lengthy interpretation for a detailed text. That way, those eight Modes can be divided into three optional sets (A, B, C) considering the criteria of length.[348]

[348] The division of *Nikāyas* in the *Sutta Piṭaka* is classified accordingly.

i) Set A,

Four Modes numbered (1), (2), (3), and (16) are relatively enriched in providing details than the other Modes. Therefore, passages, which are brief can successfully explicate by applying those Modes.

ii) Set B,

The Mode numbered (8) is suitable for a medium length text as it endows with a medium amount of details. The explanation would be neither lengthy nor brief.

iii) Set C,

Modes numbered (10), (11) and (14) are flexible and can make lengthy or brief clarifications according to the necessity of the reader. Those Modes are appropriate for lengthy texts.

## 5.3 Instructions for Applying the Method on the Full Text

Buddhist canonical texts deal with two basic factors:

i) A religious message, with a significant purpose,
ii) A reader (or a listener), with a particular need

The purpose has already been discussed in the first chapter broadly as for the well-being of the society. Teachings of the Buddha are focused only on one aim, persuading the humans to follow the path of the doctrine through righteousness and do not warrant academic analysis, philosophical arguments or aesthetic props. Similarly, the meanings of all verses in *Therigāthā,* ultimately merge into the

single thought of explaining the state of happiness or Nibbāna though the expressions differ in phraseology.

The target group herein is the non-Buddhist English reader, who may fall in the third group, possibly will understand the alien doctrine by detailed interpretations.

*Therigāthā* contains seventy-three collections of verses including 522 verses, which can divide into three categories, following the criterion of *Netti* as is stated below.

i) Sixty collections of verses as 'condensed in meaning'

ii) Five collections of verses as 'expanded in meaning'

iii) Eight collections of verses as 'detailed in meaning'

Those collections of verses must be treated in two ways because they bear different weight of expressions.

i) Explaining all verses of the set in detail

Each verse of those sixty collections of verses in the first set is needed to be described following this method, as they are condensed in meaning.

ii) Explaining few verses of the set in detail

A small number of verses in the second and the third groups convey ideas in brief thus they prefer detailed interpretations. The rest are clear in meaning to a certain extent as they are expanded and/or detailed. They can construe by relatively brief descriptions as the *Netti* recommend, without leaving them un-interpreted.

## 5. 3.1 Positing Modes for the Verses in the First Category

The first category consists of sixty collections, which bear hundred and ninety-five verses (1-195), from the first chapter to the seventh.

| Chapter | Verses in Each Collection | Number of Collection |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | O1 | 18 |
| 2 | 02 | 10 |
| 3 | 03 | 08 |
| 4 | 04 | 01 |
| 5 | 05 | 12 |
| 6 | 06 | 08 |
| 7 | 07 | 03 |
| **Total** | - | 60 |

All the verses herein are concise, thus must be construed further for the benefit of the third group. The most efficient Modes will be suggested below out of eight Modes, which are suitable for the group. They can adopt individually or combine.

As finalised in Application-I, the eight Modes imply three kinds of styles in lengthwise. Three options have been posited below, according to the descending order of aptness.

Set (A)

Selecting one of four Modes:

*Desanā hāra,* the Mode of conveying Teachings

*Vicaya hāra,* the Mode of conveying an Investigation

*Yutti hāra,* the Mode of conveying a Construing

*Samāropana hāra,* the Mode of Co-ordination for explaining the meaning

Mostly those Modes are apt for the verses or any type of brief texts due to its provision of lengthy descriptions. The three-fold teaching techniques called 'gratification,' 'disappointment' and 'escape,' included in the first three Modes are especially meant for the reader in the third group. Such clarifications facilitate the reader to understand the essence of the doctrine, the Four Noble Truths. The fourth Mode Samāropana hāra, describes the path of Nibbana, developing five components based on 'the theory of cause and effect,' which also has the same effect.

Set (B)

*Vibhatti hāra*, (8) the Mode of Analysis

It is primarily suitable for a text, which is expanded in meaning as it bears medium amount of details. It can be selected for a text, which expresses ideas in brief as well when it is needed.

Set ( C)

Selecting one of the three Modes:

*Vevacana hāra*, the Mode of Synonyms

*Paññatti hāra*, the Mode of Description

*Adhiṭṭāna hāra*, the Mode of f conveying Terms and Expressions

These Modes are mostly suitable for a lengthy text, which is detailed in meaning, and already makes clear the meaning to a certain extent. The Translator can apply them, if he needs to avoid lengthy explanations that are produced by the first and the second sets of options.

However, the translator has the freedom to change the order of options to reach the target, within the limits of those eight Modes.

## 5.3.2 Positing of Modes for the Verses in the Second Category

The second category consists of five collections of verses, which bear fifty-six verses (196- 251), from the eighth chapter to the thirteenth.

| **Chapter** | **Verses in Each Collection** | **Number of Collections** |
|---|---|---|
| 8 | 08 | 01 |
| 9 | 09 | 01 |
| 10[349] | 11 | 01 |
| 11 | 12 | 01 |
| 12 | 16 | 01 |
| **Total** | - | 05 |

All the five collections of verses are generally considered as expanded in meaning. Less number of verses still requires more interpretation than other verses, though the ideas are interconnected within the limits of a collection.

[349] The ten collections of verses (*dasaka nipāta*) are absent in the text, thus the Pali text has omitted the 10th cp. However, herein it is included to maintain the general order of chapters.

| The Collection | Verses Brief in Ideas | Total |
|---|---|---|
| (8-1)[350]/ 196-203[351] | 196, 199, 201, 203 | 04 |
| (9-1) / 204-212 | 205, 206, 208, 209 | 04 |
| (10.1) / 213-223 | 215, 222, 223 | 03 |
| (11.1) / 224-235 | 227, 228, 233, 234, 235 | 05 |
| (12.1) / 236-251 | 248, 249 | 02 |
| | | **18** |

The approach on applying Modes must pursue two ways as is stated below. Those eighteen condensed verses can explain by following the same order of options, discussed in the first category (5.3.1). The reader in the third group requires more information to comprehend the idea, as those verses are inaccessible for them. The rest, which are expanded in meaning, can construed by selecting options. The meaning of those verses has been clarified to a certain degree. Thus, a Mode/s, which prefers the medium level of interpretation, would be appropriate. Three options are stated below, according to the descending order of its aptness.

[350] The first digit indicates the chapter and the second the number of the particular collection of verses respectively. Edition of Therigāthā published by PTS and BJT follows the style.
[351] Number of verses followed by TT-1 and TT-2,

1) Set (B)

*Vibhatti hāra*, the Mode of Analysis

The Mode is duly apt for a text, which is expanded in meaning because,

i) It contributes medium amount of details, and is sufficient for a text, which has been already explained to a certain extent and thus,

ii) It does not make the translation swell up with over interpretations,

Four types of aspects: ways of phrasing, purpose, source of teachings and its consecutiveness, cause comprehension easy.

2) Set (C)

Selecting one of the three Modes:

*Vevacana hāra*, the Mode of Synonyms

*Paññatti hāra*, the Mode of Description

*Adhiṭṭāna hāra*, the Mode of conveying Terms and Expressions

The Modes are suitable for the texts irrespective of length, as the structure is adjustable. The Number of synonyms or descriptions can be regulated according to the requirement of the reader's comprehending level. Thus, they are suitable here in terms of providing relatively lesser explanations than the third option.

3) Set (A)

Selecting one of the four Modes:

*Desanā hāra,* the Mode of conveying Teachings

*Vicaya hāra,* the Mode of conveying an Investigation

*Yutti hāra,* the Mode of conveying a Construing

*Samāropana hāra,* the Mode of Co-ordination

Mostly those Modes are apt for conveying the meaning of texts in brief, due to their provision of lengthy descriptions. The Modes can be applied as the first option, if a translator accepts lengthy descriptions and their style of repetition as a technique of making the reader attentive,

Similar to the first category, the translator enjoys the freedom to change the order of options to reach the target, within the limits of eight Modes.

## 5.3.3 Positing of Modes for the Verses in the Third Category

The third category consists of eight collections including two hundred and seventy-two verses (252-522) from the thirteenth chapter to the sixteenth.

| **Chapter** | **Verses in Each Collection** | **Number of Collection** |
|---|---|---|
| 13 | 19/ 20/ 21/ 26/ 28[352] | 05 |
| 14 | 33 | 01 |
| 15 | 47 | 01 |
| 16 | 74 | 01 |
| | - | 08 |

Each collection of this category is included with extended explanations. Only a small number of verses require further clarifications.

| **Collection** | **Verses Brief in Ideas** | **Total** |
|---|---|---|
| (13-1) / 252-270 | - | - |
| (13-2) / 271-290 | 289 | 01 |
| (13-3) / 291-311 | 307, 310 | 02 |
| (13-4) / 312-337 | 315, 322 | 02 |
| (13-5) / 338-365 | 347, 361, 363, 364 | 04 |
| (14-1)/ 366-399 | 369, 385, 388, 389 | 04 |
| (15-1)/ 400-447 | 432, 434 | 02 |

[352] Numbers of the verses of each collection are illustrated orderly.

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| (16-1) / 448-522 | 456, 480, 481, 515, 516, 522 | 06 |
| | | **21** |

Following the second category, those collections will be treated in two ways as the styles of expressions are varied.

i) Twenty-one verses, which are condensed can be clarified by the same order of options discussed in the first category (ABC)

ii) The rest, which are detailed in meaning, can be construed by selecting option/s stated below.

Verses, detailed in meaning, are prescribed for the reader in the third group. The text is already comprehensible in terms of meaning to the readers of the first and the second groups. However, the reader needs relatively a small measure of interpretation even at this level to gather the core meaning from the verbalised. Therefore, an optional arrangement of those eight Modes is stated below.

1) Set (C )

Selecting one of the four Modes for explaining the meaning

*Vevacana hāra*, the Mode of Synonyms,

*Paññatti hāra*, the Mode of Description, and

*Adhiṭṭāna hāra,* the Mode of Terms and Expressions

These Modes are suitable for a detailed text, as the number of synonyms or descriptions can be adjusted according to the necessity of the reader. They are apt to make the text clear as well as to limit over interpretation.

2) Set (B)

*Vibhatti hāra*, the Mode of Analysis

The Mode provides a medium amount of details. It is appropriate when a translator prefers details on the way of phrasing, purpose, sources of teachings and the consecutiveness of facts. It facilitates the reader in accessing the meaning, somewhat cleared by the text itself.

3) Set (A)

Selecting one of the four Modes for explaining the meaning

*Desanā hāra,* the Mode of conveying Teachings,

*Vicaya hāra,* the Mode of conveying an Investigation,

*Yutti hāra,* the Mode of conveying a Construing or

*Samāropana hāra,* the Mode of Co-ordination

Lengthy descriptions of Modes would be the least suitable option for the verses in this category. However, they are accepted when the translator approves of details and repetitions as the techniques of clarifying.

## 5.4 Conclusion on Applying Modes on a Full Text

Selecting a Mode in interpreting and translating does not depend on the personal interest of the interpreter/translator but on the comprehending skills of the reader. The translator's freedom of selecting the Modes is identified within the particular group of the readers. Each Mode is endowed with distinct characteristics, which guides the translator/interpreter. The most required

qualification here is to know the way of application and the conditions of each Mode.

Doctrinal explanations included in *Netti* itself are rich enough to construct a fruitful translation without borrowing information from other Buddhist canonical texts in Tipiṭaka. However, there is no restriction with regard to referring to the Tipiṭaka if necessary. The condition at this point is to lay out all ideas into the phrasing structures as well as the three-fold framework of meaning structure, *sutta-vinaya-dhammatā* recommended by the *Netti*.

The method has been demonstrated in *Netti* by applying it on a single verse selected from the text, Exclamation (*udāna*) out of the nine-fold Divisions of the teachings of the Buddha. Herein, the method is demonstrated on another division, *gāthā* or the form of Verses.

According to the *Netti*, the entire method can be applied on the other seven sets of the Tipiṭaka, namely, the Threads (*sutta*), Prose-expositions (*geiya*), Grammar (*veiyākaraṇa*), Sayings (*itiuttaka*), Birth stories (*jātaka*), Wonderful and Marvellous ideas (*acchariya abbhūtadhamma*), and Answers to questions (*vedalla*).

## Chapter Six

# Conclusion

In this study on the 'Problems of Translating Buddhist Texts in Pali, with Special Reference to *Therigāthā*', we have attempted to focus on the problems of interpretation and translation of the message intended in a Buddhist canonical text that would transmit through English language to a reader belonging to a non-Buddhist community. The entire argument/s of the thesis is based on the hypothesis of the reader's non-acquaintance with Pali Tipiṭaka, the Theravāda Buddhist canon. Problems that occur in the process of English translations are spelt out in three segments in the light of the examination of the works of the translators:

i) The English translators do not seem to take into account the differing comprehending levels of the reader on the subject of the Buddhist doctrine

ii) The mainstream English translators have mostly read the Buddhist texts from the vantage point of their cultural experience and thus tended to neglect the main purpose of the Buddhist canonical texts

iii) The English translators are not acquainted with the ancient Buddhist methodology, which clarifies the purpose and elucidates a specific method of interpretation and translation

Owing to the above enumerated failings, translations often turn out to be misinterpretations. Therefore, the current research has made a case for a more

informed method of translation and has attempted to make the translator aware of the above-highlighted failings that characterise the existing field of Buddhist translations. The objectives that guided the research could be enumerated as stated below.

a) The research is intended to draw attention to the need to understand the purpose of the Buddhist canonical texts
b) The research is an attempt to re-introduce the methodology propounded by the Buddhist tradition
c) The work is also aimed to demonstrate the said methodology on a Buddhist canonical text

The translator is advised to be acquainted with the primary necessities stated below in order to minimise the problem of misinterpretation:

i. The purpose of a Buddhist canonical text
ii. The methodology in *Netti*
iii. Awareness of the applicability of the method in *Netti* with regard to a Buddhist canonical text

The attempt is therefore to re-introduce the method in *Netti*ppakaraṇa for producing a more practical, pragmatic and lucid translation as well. Also, we aim to establish a general method in the field of translating Buddhist canonical texts rather than endorsing the translator's complete autonomy, which has tended to cause misinterpretations in the field. In this regard, the Buddhist texts in the Tipiṭaka are viewed as only a code of conduct for the well-being of the human beings.

## 6.1 Chapter-wise Summary

The research project consists of six chapters. The first chapter, the Introduction, is constituted of two parts and the former is dedicated to a discussion on methodology. Three key concepts are explained under the heading of 'conceptual clarity' within the context of Theravāda Buddhist system as stated below:

i) 'The purpose of a canonical text' is defined as a practical guide to achieve the goal of Nibbāna

ii) 'The Buddhist methodology' is defined as the one used at the time of the Buddha and the one sent to Sri Lanka in the 3rd century BC, which is identical with the method included now in *Netti*

iii) Thirdly, interpretation and translation are recognized as systematic 'modes' that were employed since the commencement of Buddhism, interpretation being the fundamental act in the process of translation

Literature on 'the problems of translating Buddhist texts, highlighting the value of *Netti*ppakaraṇa' is hardly available. The relevant materials that we have are the introduction of *The Guide*, the English translation of *Netti*, and the three articles written by George D Bond on the interpretation method of *Netti*. Similarly, reviews on *Therigāthā* as a translated text are also hardly available. The two English translators of the text have discussed their own methods. Generally the literary features and the women's perspectives of *Thig* are widely discussed rather than the text as a code of conduct for women's life. The available literature on *Thig* is lacking in terms of three main points:

i) The authors of these texts conclude that the method in *Netti* is only the Theravāda method of interpretation
ii) They do not demonstrate the 'method' in *Netti* while translating Buddhist canonical texts
iii) The sample text *Thig* is not yet viewed as a path to happiness of women

The need to fill the gaps in the field was recognized including three aspects, stated below:

i) To prove that the method in *Netti* is not only used for Interpretation, but also used in Translating
ii) To facilitate the translator by demonstrating the 'method', providing instructions from it on the process of translating
iii) To view the *Thig* as a women's final goal of happiness called Nibbāna as it is stated in Buddhist canonical texts.

The second part of the introduction discusses important factors under two subtitles. 'Attempts of Preserving Buddhist Teachings' examines the efforts made in India and Sri Lanka to protect the Tipiṭaka from destruction and corruption. India formed three councils within a period of three hundred years since the 6$^{th}$ century B.C., while Sri Lanka preserved them by way of translating as well as converting the texts into written form. 'The Problems of Translating Buddhist Texts into English' considers the various ideologies that determined the translation of Buddhist texts during colonial and post-colonial periods, briefly.

Here we discuss the impact of such ideologies in misrepresenting and misinterpreting the Buddhist canonical texts in the act of translation. Colonisation exercised a positive influence in the sense that it helped to introduce and spread the Buddhist canonical texts, and was instrumental in arousing academic interest in the texts all over Europe, mainly through translations. Nevertheless, the cultural supremacy enjoyed by the translators resulted in errors. This is because while interpreting concepts, the Western translators failed to understand the consciousness of the natives and the fundamentals of the Indian philosophical traditions. The two main likely reasons for the misrepresentation of Buddhist texts identified by us are as follows:

1. The dominancy of Christianity and Biblical views
2. The dominancy of 'Modern' ideologies

The first phase of Christian dominance was in sway approximately until the beginning of the twentieth century. The second phase started once Christianity started losing its autonomy with the advent of the 'Modern' era governed by the 'sciences.' The dominancy of 'isms,' and/or 'logies' identified the Buddhist teachings as having 'inadequacies' and modifications were recommended in the lights of Metaphysics, Marxism, Feminism and Homosexuality & Gender Studies. Those errors, definitions and proposals could be considered as misinterpretations in general, since they were the result of negligence *or ignorance or oversight of the main purpose of Buddhist teachings,* the well-being of the community.

It should be noted here that we are not envisaging an orthodox position that the Buddhist canonical texts must not be discussed from the modern point of views. However, there is a danger of misinterpretation if one ventures to interpret

these doctrines without considering the interpretive traditions and cultural milieu the Buddhist texts themselves are part of. Whatever be the ideological framework one uses to discuss the Buddhist canonical text, one must have a sound knowledge of the Buddhist interpretive traditions in order to arrive at the 'meaning' of the text within the Buddhist discourse. In our considered opinion, *Netti* provides such a ground.

The second chapter, 'the Buddhist Interpretation Method,' is constituted of five sub sections. 'Introduction to the *Nettippakaraṇa*' discusses the author and the authority of the text. The authorship, which was attributed to Mahākaccayāna by the tradition, is accepted herein too. The research recognizes him as the compiler. The methodology of the whole text is divided into two divisions as meaning and phrasing techniques.

(A) Meaning techniques

i) Six meaning-related terms

ii) Three Guidelines

*Nandiāvatta* or (1) the Conversion of Relishing

*Tipukkhala* or (2) the Trefoil

*Sīhavikkhīḷita* or (3) the Lions Play

(B) Phrasing techniques

i) Six phrase-related terms

ii) The sixteen Modes of conveying

iii) Two Guidelines

*Disālocana* or (4) the Plotting of Directions

*Aṅkusa* or (5) the Hook

The second sub section includes the summary of the sixteen Modes of conveying meaning.

The first Mode, *Desanā hāra*, the Mode of Conveying Teaching, sums up the doctrine under five questions: what is to be taught; how is the meaning constructed; how are the teachings variously presented; what are the phases of teaching to be concerned; and for whom is the teaching intended. The Four Noble Truths in six ways of teachings, combination of phrasing and meaning terms, three style of expressions, three phases of discourses, and three levels of reader groups form the respective answers for them. The Mode successfully illumines core and metaphoric meanings for the benefit of non-Buddhist English readers.

The second Mode, *Vicaya hāra*, the Mode of an Investigation, explains a text, considering four different ways. If the text is in verse form it must be paraphrased. The Mode examines whether the core idea is a single statement (term), or a question, or an answer. The simultaneity of the ideas and the six Modes of teachings are to be included. All the ideas at the end are clarified by the formula of Nine-fold Teachings.

The third Mode, *Yutti hāra*, the Mode of a Construing, is based on the concept of authority. It concerns whether the ideas are different in meaning or different in phrasing, or whether they have a single meaning, though the phrasings are different. Explanations must be within the three fold formula of the Four Noble Truths; the eradication of three roots; and the Law of Dependent Origination.

The first three are the representative Modes of the method of interpretation and translating in *Netti*, and therefore the definitions and instructions provided by them are relevant to the rest of the Modes.

The fourth Mode, *Padaṭṭhāna hāra*, the Mode of Proximate Causes, provides the near reasons, footings for each core idea, in the text.

The fifth Mode, *Lakkhaṇa hāra*, the Mode of Characteristics, explains the meaning of a text providing shared characteristics, which can be related to a single idea.

The sixth Mode, *Catubyuha hāra*, the Mode of a Four-fold Arrangement, explains the meaning in accordance with four types of aspects: the way of phrasing ideas; the purpose of the text; the source of the teachings; and the consecutivity of facts.

The seventh Mode, *Āvaṭṭa hāra*, the Mode of Conveying a Conversion, involves an explanation by the proximate cause of the concept and then converting it into the opposite.

The eighth Mode, *Vibhatti hāra*, the Mode of an Analysis, elucidates the meaning of a statement considering three aspects: the intention; the Mode of teaching; and one of the facts of authority, since the Mode is combined with the second Mode, *Vichaya hāra* and the third Mode, *Yutti hāra*.

The ninth Mode, *Parivattana hāra*, the Mode of Conveying a Reversal, explains the meaning of a text through opposite ideas. Exemplifying the negative or positive aspects of the text brings a proper and a complete image of the concept.

The tenth Mode, *Vevacana hāra*, the Mode of Synonyms, explains the meaning of a text with synonyms. This Mode observes the number of ideas in the text and clarifies each single idea in as many ways as possible by providing synonyms.

The eleventh Mode, *Paññatti hāra*, the Mode of Concepts, conveys the meaning of a text as an expression of the Four Noble Truths, by applying synonyms.

The twelfth Mode, *Otaraṇa hāra*, the Mode of Ways of Entry of the Truth, applies one of the five methods to explain the meaning: the law of Dependent Origination; Controlling Faculty of Wisdom; Aggregates; Elements; and Bases.

The thirteenth mode, *Sodhana hāra*, the Mode of Clearing- up, examines whether the text has been clarified by the text itself or not. Or else whether the text is answered by itself or remains unanswered concerning the instigation of a statement.

The fourteenth mode, *Adhiṭṭhāna hāra*, the Mode of Terms of Expression, shows how to deal with alternative terms to convey meanings. Ideas that appear in the text will be included under the headers of unity and diversity.

The fifteenth mode, *Parikkhāra hāra*, the Mode of Requisites, illustrates how a single idea generates more ideas due to the relation called the cause and effect and how the theory can be applied on the process of conveying meaning.

The sixteenth mode, *Samāropaṇa hāra*, the Mode of Co-ordination explains the meaning of a text in four ways: by proximate cause; by synonymy; by the techniques of Mental Culture; and by the concept of cessation.

The third sub-section provides 'Five Guidelines,' and they are of two kinds: meaning and phrasings. Meaning Guidelines explain concepts and demarcate possible interpretation areas to avoid misinterpretations. The Guideline Nandiyāvatta or 'the Conversion of Relishing' explains how craving exercises dominance over human beings and the Buddhist techniques of eliminating it. The Guideline *Sihavikhīḷita* or 'the Lion's Play' is an expression of the three types of Enlightened personalities: the Buddha, Paccheka Buddha and the *Arahantas*. The third meaning Guideline, *Tipukkhala*, or 'the Trefoil,' connecting with the second phrasing Guideline *Aṅkusa*, or 'the Hook,' analyses the behaviour of human beings in terms of profitable and unprofitable concepts or Root-terms. The other phrasing Guideline *Disālocana* or 'the Plotting of Directions' puts fourth appropriate ideas and their roots in respective directions. The Guideline provides instructions on factors such as the variations of the Threads, different human personalities and their ways of progressing. Functions of methods, their application possibilities, benefits, and examples also are summarised at the end.

The third chapter, 'Nibbāna as Women's Final Goal in *Therigāthā*', includes six sub-sections. 'Introduction to the Text' deals with the historical background of ancient Indian women who recited those verses and the establishment of nunnery in Buddhism. 'Authorship and the Structure' discusses the debate on authorship, content, and the arrangements of the chapters of the text, which consists of the seventy-three collections of the verses in the text. 'The Main

Purpose of the Text' is a discussion on how the text depicts its aims of exhibiting how women individually succeeded in realizing the supreme happiness, Nibbāana, and directed other women towards attainment of the goal. In addition, it is discussed how the text can be viewed by the criterion, the Four Noble Truths, prescribed as the *Netti*. 'Reasons for Embracing Homelessness,' discusses Craving as the main problem, and social problems and problems regarding body as the consequences. Disappointment with regard to sensual pleasure, beauty, wealth and other material stuff are the consequences of craving. Social problems accrue with regard to marital status, male dominance, polygamy, child marriages and widowhood. Ailments like aging, diseases, and feebleness are considered as problems regarding the body.

'Escape from Suffering,' is concerned with the reasons of sufferings peculiar to women, and techniques of eliminating suffering. Proper instigating, determination, seeing peril in the body, cessation of intoxicants, not committing evil deeds, and being mindful are the few techniques. 'Description of the Goal' discusses different descriptions of Nibbāna. The major point herein is the attainability of Nibbāna in this very lifetime. Subsequently, femaleness was recognized as painful and troublesome in general, but after attaining Nibbāna they questioned "what can 'femaleness' (*itthibhāvaṃ*) do to us, when the mind is well-tamed and when perfect knowledge has been obtained, having insight into the doctrine." This is the message to contemporary women to understand the difference between the worldly aspect of happiness and happiness as highlighted by the Buddhist point of view.

The fourth chapter, 'The Discussion on English Translations,' consists of six sections. It introduces two available standard English translations of *Thig*, *The*

*Psalms of Sisters,* by Rhys Davids (1909) and the *Elders Verses II,* by K.R. Norman (1971). 'Organisation of Translated Texts' illustrates the outline of translations and reasons out the relevance of organising features, while the 'Effect of the Organising Factors of the Translation' talks about their impact. 'Style of the Translated Texts' analyses the two translations individually, and finally compares their styles.

'Procedures of Translating' discusses how Biblical values governed translation of Buddhist canonical texts during the period of colonisation and how later academic interests overpowered the scenario of Buddhist translations. Finally, we have discussed how translators used their own methods, which failed to convey the purpose.

The fifth chapter, 'Application of *Nettippakaraṇa*, the Method,' is comprised of four sub sections. The first one is 'Demonstration - I: Applying Sixteen Modes on a Single Verse,' which demonstrates each Mode as an individual piece with three sub sections: instructions, procedure of translation, the final product of the translation and the constraints. Sixteen different translations as final draft are done in this account. Constraints are discussed considering the content and the length of the text as well as the target reader.

'Conclusion of the Demonstration- I' constitutes one of the major parts of this study, which classified the modes according to the reader and the style of expression of a text. Three suitable modes for the reader of the first group were selected as illustrated below, since the reader in the first group realises the meaning quickly with wisdom.

i) *Padaṭṭhāna hāra* (4), the Mode of Footing,

ii) *Lakkhaṇa hāra* (5), the Mode of Characteristics,

iii) *Catubyūha hāra* (6), the Mode of Conveying Four-fold Arrangements,

iv) *Sodhana hāra* (13), the Mode of a Clearing up

Four suitable modes for the reader in the second group were selected as stated below.

i) *Āvatta hāra* (7), the Mode of Conveying a Conversion

ii) *Parivattana hāra* (9), the Mode of Conveying a Reversal

iii) *Otaraṇa hāra* (12), the Mode of Conveying Ways of Entry of Truth

iv) *Parikkhāra hāra* (15), the Mode of Conveying Requisites

Explanations, which are provided by those modes, are expanded in meaning and understandable with cognitive skills. They are relevant for the reader in the first group, as he understands the doctrine with wisdom.

Eight appropriate modes have been selected for the target reader of the study, the non-Buddhist English reader, who may fall in the third group.

i) *Desanā hāra*, (1), the Mode of Conveying Teachings

ii) *Vicaya hāra*, (2), the Mode of Conveying an Investigation

iii) *Yutti hāra* (3), the Mode of Conveying a Construing

iv) *Vibhatti hāra* (8), the Mode of an Analysis

v) *Vevacana hāra* (10), the Mode of Conveying Synonyms

vi) *Paññatti hāra* (11), the Mode of Conveying Description

vii) *Adhiṭṭāna hāra* (14), the Mode of Conveying Terms of Expression

viii) *Samāropaṇa hāra* (16), the Mode of Co-ordination

Those eight modes have been divided into three optional sets as A, B, and C, considering their length. The modes, (1), (2), (3), and (16), included in Set-A, are relatively enriched in details when compared to other Modes. They are appropriate for a text, which is condensed in meaning.

The mode (8) in Set-B is suitable for a text that adopts an expanded style, as it includes a medium amount of details. The (10), (11) and (14) Modes in Set-C can be adjusted according to the level of the reader and therefore the style of the text. They are mainly suitable for lengthy descriptions.

The fourth section, 'Instructions of Applying the Methods on a Full Text,' suggests how to apply the method on *Thig*. The collections of verses are divided into three categories following the method of *Netti*: condensed in meaning; expanded in meaning; and detailed in meaning. The first category consists of sixty collections (1-195) while the second has five (196-251) and the third has eight (252-522). The second and the third categories have 18 and 21 verses, which are condensed in meaning respectively. The instructions given for applying Modes can be summarised as stated below. A, B, and C are the optional sets of Modes, which are so classified aiming the non-Buddhist English reader.

| Collections of Verses | Order of Options |
|---|---|
| Condensed in meaning | A, B, C |
| Expanded in meaning | B, C, A |
| Detailed in meaning | C, B, A |

The second category, the collections of verses, which are expanded in meaning, can pursue the order, B.C.A., while the last category can apply C.B.A. At this point, the translator is free to select the appropriate method from the set of Modes, knowing their advantages and limitations. However, he/she is advised not to overstep the boundaries, where the readership is positioned.

The study has pointed out a few important factors, which have not been considered or paid the required attention, in the field of translating Buddhist texts till now. The method of *Nettippakaraṇa* used to be identified only as the interpretation method of Theravāda Buddhism, but in the course of this dissertation, it is discussed, demonstrated and verified as an appropriate method of Translation. Constraints of the sixteen Modes, classification of the Modes taking into account the readership, and their optional suggestions on the expressions of the text, are defined based on the methodology. They are not mentioned in the *Netti* or elsewhere in the literatures, but would facilitate contemporary translators to apply the method confidently. Further, the method can be introduced as a reader friendly approach.

The view of 'Nibbāna as the final goal of women' would assist to identify other Buddhist canonical texts in the same light, as the way to happiness or the

attainment of Nibbāna. Understanding this purpose along with the Buddhist methodology together will minimize the problem of misinterpretation.

## 6.2 Suggestions for Future Studies

The present study is mainly based on the theoretical approaches found within the Buddhist method of interpretation and translation. However, the practical application of the eight modes to the full text of Therigāthā still remains to be done and the entire text could be translated accordingly. Besides, the procedure of application of the modes can be applied on the other seven sets of texts in the 'Nine-fold Divisions of Teachings' as mentioned in the *Netti*. Presently, the method has been identified as the Theravāda Buddhist method of Interpretation and Translation. However, there are other sects of Buddhist canonical texts like the Tripitaka in the Mahayana tradition. As the methodology deals with Buddhist teachings in general, there would be an opportunity to bring those texts also into the light for a comparative, identical, or contrastive study.

Another important area that offers itself up for further study would be comparative studies on *Netti*, with hermeneutic approaches in India and outside the country. The suggestion of Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli, the English translator, to link the *Netti* with Indian methods of exegesis, is yet to be carried out. The method in *Netti* is enriched with theoretical approaches, which can be viewed in relation to the field of historical linguistics as well as postmodern concepts such as Deconstruction.

The method used in the third chapter in this research to analyze the content of the *Thig* can be applied to other Buddhist canonical texts and it would assist in analyzing texts in the light of the core principles of Buddhism, the Four Noble Truths. The attempt will stand not only to converse with and motivate women as the *Thig* has expressed, but would also support human beings in starting their journey to find enduring happiness in this very life itself irrespective of gender, language or geographical barriers.

Finally, it would be a very fruitful and much-required exercise to produce current translations on *Nettippakaraṇa* in English and Sinhala mediums. Both the available and the standard translations, which have been selected as primary sources in the present research, can be regarded as antiquated. Though *The Guide* is a pioneering work in the field, at places it may confuse the reader due to certain wrong usages of words. For instance, the Pali interpretative technique patiniddesa (Re-descriptive Expositions) has been translated to convey exactly the opposite of the meaning, the 'counter demonstrations' (Ñāṇamoli, 4) The term, 'Nine Fold Thread of Arguments,' which stands for nine different divisions of teachings is equally used for a different formula of 'Nine Fold Questions of Investigation' (Ñāṇamoli, 35). 'Grammatical Expositions,' 'Volitional activities' and 'Wisdom' would be more suitable than the usages of Linguistic (*nirruti*), elements (*saṅkhāra*), and Understanding (*paññā*) respectively. Especially, technical terms demand modifications in the light of clarity and accuracy. A Sinhala translation is highly required in inielligible language and style which is suitable for exposition of theories. The present translation is replete with Sanskritised and archaic words, though the subject matter is accurate.

# Bibliography


Abenayake, Oliver. 'Reappraisal of the Position of Women in Buddhism,' Journal of Buddhist Studies, Vol.1 Sri Lanka: Centre for Buddhist Studies, 2003.

Adhikaram, E.W. Early History of Buddhism in Ceylon. 1946. Colombo: M. D. Gunasena & Company Ltd, 1953.

Alwis, James. De. The Buddhist Scriptures and Their Language, The Pali, Sri Lanka, 1862.

'Aṭṭhakathā,' Encyclopaedia of Buddhism, ed. G.P. Malalasekera, Vol.1. Ceylon: Government of Ceylon, 1961.

Barua, A. ed. Petavatthu, London: PTS, 1949.

Bassnett McGuire, Susan. Translation Studies. London: Methuen, 1980.

Batuvantudawa and Sumangala. ed. Mahavaṃsa. Colombo: Govt. of Ceylon, 1908.

Beaugrande, Robert de. Factors in a Theory of Poetic Translation. Netherlands: Van Gorcum. 1978.

Beinorius, Audrius. 'Buddhism in the Early European Imagination: A Historical Perspective.' ISSN 1648-2662. ACTA ORIENTALIA VILLNENCIA, 6.2. 2005. 7-22. <http://www.jstor.org.about/terms>.

Blackstone, K. R. Women in the Footsteps of the Buddha. 1998. New Delhi: MB, 2000.

Bode, Mabel Haynes. Index to Pali words: Discussed in Translations. Journal of PTS. London: PTS, 1901. 2-42.

Bond, George D. 'The Nature and Meaning of the Netti-Pakarṇa.' Studies in Pali and Buddhism: A Memorial Volume in Honor of Bhikkhu Jagadish Kashyap. ed. A.K. Narain. Delhi: B.R. Publishing Corporation, 1979. 29-39.

--------. 'The Netti-Pakaraṇa; A Theravāda Method of Interpretation.' Buddhist Studies in Honor of Walpola Rahula. Somaratna Balasuriya, Andrew Barean, Richard Gombrich, Siri Gunasinghe, Udaya Mallawarachchi, Edmund Perry. London: Gordon Fraser; Sri Lanka: Vimamsa Publishers, 1980. 16 -28.

--------.The Gradual Path as a Hermeneutical Approach to the Dhamma,' Buddhist Hermeneutics, ed. Donald S. Lopez, Jr. Delhi: MB, 1988. 29-46.

--------. 'Nettippakaraṇa: Summary,' Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies, ed. Karl H. Potter. Vol. 7. 1996. Delhi: MB. 2006. 403-416.

--------. 'Peṭakopadesa: Summary,' Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies, Vol.7. 1996. Delhi: MB, 2006. 381-401.

Bodhi, Bhikkhu. Mahākaccāyana: Master of Doctrinal Expositions. Sri Lanka: The Wheel Publications, 1995.

Buck Giinther. The Structure of Hermeneutic Experience and Problem of Tradition. New Literacy Histrory Vol.X, Autumn, No.1. 1978. 31-47.

Buddhadatta, Aggamahapaṇḍita, Polwatte. Theravada Bauddha Darshanaya. Colombo: Rathna Book Publishers, 2002.

--------. Some Difficult Passages in Pali Literature. UCR. Vol. 6, No.3. July. 1948. 201- 209.

Beaugrande, Robert de. Factors in a Theory of Poetic Translation, Netherlands: Van Gorcum, 1978.

Cabezon, Jose Ignacio. Ed. Buddhism Sexuality and Gender. 1992, New York: State University; Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications, 1992.

Chakravarti, Uma. Problem Stratification of Pali Texts, Oxford University Press, New Delhi. 1987.

Cone, Margaret. Ed. A Dictionary of Pāli. Part I. Oxford: PTS, 2001.

Conze, Edward. The Concept of Buddhist Nirvāna. Delhi: Bharatiya Vidya Prakashan, 1975.

Crosby, Kate. 'The Origin of Pāli as a language Name in Medival Theravada Literature, Journal of the Centre for Buddhist Studies in Sri Lanka, Vol. 2. Sri Lanka: Centre for Buddhist Studies, 2004. 70-116.

Crystal, David. ed. Reader's Digest Universal Dictionary, London: Reader's Digest, 1987.

Davids, Rhys C.A.F. Psalms of the Early Buddhists: Psalms of the Sisters. 1909. London: PTS, 1948.

--------. Outlines of Buddhism. London: Methuen & co. Ltd, 1938.

Davids, Rhys T.W. and J.E. Carpenter. Eds. Dīgha Nikāya. 3 Vols. London: PTS. 1890-1911: Dialogues of the Buddha. trans. T.W. Rhys Davids and C.A.F. Rhys Davids. 3 Vols. London: PTS, 1899-1921.

--------, William Stede, Eds. Pali English Dictionary. 1905. London: Oxford; New Delhi: Asian Educational Services, 2004.

Devananda Thero. Halgastota. Ed. The Therigāthā Pāli, Pali Text Series, Vol. 21. Ceylon: Tripitaka Publication Press, 1970.

'Dhammapāla,' Encyclopedic Dictionary of Pali Literature, N.K.Singh and B.Baruah. eds. Vol.1. Delhi: Global Vision Publishing House, 2003.178 182.

Dhammavihari Thera. Women in Buddhism. Sri Lanka: BPS, 2002.

Dhirasekara, Jotiya. 'Buddhaghosa and the Tradition of the First Council,' UCR. Vol.15. No1 & 2. January - April.1957. 167 - 181.

Free, L. ed. Saṃyutta Nikāya. 6 Vols. London: PTS, 1884-1894.

Geiger, Wilhelm. Pali Literature and Language, trans. T. Ghosh. 1943, Culcutta: Culcutta University Press; New Delhi: Munshiram Manoharlal Publishers Pvt. Ltd. 1978.

Gentzler, Edwin. Contemporary Translation Theories. London & New York: Routledge, 1983.

Goenka, Sayagyi S.N. Chaṭṭa Saṅgāyanā CD-ROM. Vipassanā Research Institute, Dhammagiri, Igatpuri, India

Gombrich, Richard F. Theravāda Buddhism. 1988, London & New York: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd, 2002.

Gunawardhana W.F, Simon de Silva and Mendis Gunasekera. Ed. Nikāysaṅgrahaya, Ceylon: Ceylon Govt. Press, 1907.

Guruge, Ananda P. Ed. Encyclopedia of Buddhism. Sri Lanka: Govt. of Sri Lanka, 1989.

Hardy, E. Ed. Nettippakarṇa. 1902. London: PTS, 1961.

---------, Ed. Peṭakopadesa. 1902 London: PTS, 1949.

---------, and R. Morris. Ed. Aṅguttara Nikāya. 5 Vols., London: PTS, 1885-1900: The Book of the Gradual Sayings. trans. F. L. Woodward and E.M. Hare. 5 Vols. London: PTS, 1932-1936.

Hazra, K. L. Pāli Language and Literature: A Systematic Survey and Historical Study. New Delhi: D. K. Print World, 1994.

Hiriyanna M. N. Outlines of Indian Philosophy. London: Jorge Allen & Unwin, 1956.

Holms, James S. 'The name and Nature of Translation,' TSR, ed. Lawrenc Venuti. 2000. London & New York: Routledge, 2003. 172-185.

Horner, I. B. Women Under Primitive Buddhism. 1930. New Delhi: MB, 1975.

Indra, C.T. 'Horizon of Expectations: Hermeneutics and Translation,' Translation, Text and Theory: The Paradigm of India, ed. Rukmini Bhaya Nair. London: Thousand Oaks; New Delhi: Sage Publications, 2002. 153-170.

Jakobson, Roman. 'On Linguistic Aspect of Translation,' TSR. ed. Lawrenc Venuti. 2000. London & New York: Routledge, 2003. 113-118.

Jayathillake, K.N. The Early Buddhist Theory of Knowledge. 1963. New Delhi: MB, 1980.

--------. The Message of the Buddha, ed. Ninian Smart. Sri Lanka: BPS, 2000.

Jayawickrama, N.A. 'Buddhaghosa and the Traditional Classifications of the Pali Canon.' UCR., Vol.17. Nos.1&2. January - April 1959. 1-17.

--------. 'Some Linguistic Peculiarities of the Therigatha,' UCR, 1955. 17-23

--------. trans. Therigatha (Sinhala) Colombo: M. D. Gunasena & Company Ltd, 1958.

Joseph, Marco. 'Translating Style, and Styles of Translating,' The Journal of Language and Literature, UK: Sage Publications, 2004. 73-90.

Kalupahana, David J. Buddhist Philosophy: A Historical Analysis. 1933, Honolulu: The University Press of Hawaii, 1976.

Lankananda, Thero Labugama. trans. ed. Nettippakaraṇa. 1980, Colombo: The Democratic Socialist Republic of Sri Lanka, 2005.

Lefevere, Andre. 'Mother Courage's Cucumbers,' TSR. ed. Lawrence Venuti. 2000. London & New York: Routledge, 2003. 233-249.

Lie, Raymond S.C. 'Buddhist Sacred Texts in English Translation,' Encyclopedia of Literary Translation into English, ed. Olive Classe. Vol. 1. London. Chicago: Fitzroy Dearborn Publishers, 2000. 190-192.

Ling, Trevor. Buddha, Marx and God. New York: Macmillan Publishers, 1966.

Lopez, Donald S. Jr. ed. Buddhist Hermeneutics. New Delhi: MB, 1988.

Marco, Joseph. 'Translating Style, and Styles of Translating.' The Journal of Language and Literature, Vol.13, No.1 (Feb.) UK: Sage Publications, 2004. 79-90

Malalasekara, G.P. The Pāli Literature in Ceylon. 1928. Sri Lanka: BPS, 1994.

--------. ed. Encyclopedia of Buddhism. Vol.1 & 2. Ceylon: Govt. of Ceylon, 1966.

--------. ed. The Dictionary of Pāli Proper Names, Vol.1 & 2. 1937. London: John Murray; New Delhi: Asian Educational Services, 2003.

Munday, Jeremy. Introducing Translation Studies. 2001.Oxon: Routladge, 2005.

Ñānamoli, Bhikkhu. trans. The Guide (*Nettippakaraṇam*). London: PTS, 1962.

--------. ed. A Pāli-English Glossary of Buddhist Technical Terms. 1994, Sri Lanka: BPS, 1998.

Ñāṇananda Bhikkhu, K., Seeing Through: A Guide to Insight Meditation. Sri Lanka: Quality Printers, 1999.

--------. Concept and Reality in Early Buddhist Thought, 1978. Sri Lanka: BPS, 1997.

Ñāṇānanda, P. trans. ed. Dīpavaṃsa. Panadura, Sri Lanka: Star Press, 1927.

Nida, Eugine. 'Principles of Correspondence,' TSR, ed. Lawrence Venuti. 2000. London & New York: Routledge, 2003. 126-140.

Narasimhaiah C.D. and C.N. Srinath. eds. Problems of Translation. Mysore: A Dhvanyaloka Publications, 1987.

Norman, K.R. trans. The Elders Verse I : Theragāthā. London: PTS, 1969.

---------. trans. The Elders Verse II : Therigāthā, London: PTS, 1971.

---------. Collected Papers, Vol. 4. Oxford: PTS, 1993.

Oldernberg, H. Buddha: his life, his doctrine, his order. London, 1882.

--------. The Religion of The Veda, Delhi: MB, 1916.

--------. ed. Vinayapitaka. 5 Vols. London: PTS, 1879-1883.

--------. and R. Pichel Ed. Thera- And Therigāthā. 1882, London: PTS.

Paul, Dyana Y. Women in Buddhism: Image of Feminine in Mahayana Tradition. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Radhakrishnan, S. and C.A. Moore. Ed. A Source Book in Indian Philosophy. 1957. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1973.

Rahula, Walpola. History of Buddhism in Ceylon: The Anurādhapura Period, 3rd century BC- 10th Century AC, 1956, Colombo: M.D. Gunasena & Co. Ltd, 1966.

Rambukvelle, Vipassi, trans. Theri-gāthā. Colombo: Samayawardhana Book Shop Private Ltd, 2003.

Reiss, Katharina. 'Decision Making in Translation,' TSR, 167 ed. Lawrence Venuti. 2000. London & New York: Routledge, 2003. 160-171.

Reynolds, Frank K. and Charls Hallisey. 'Buddhism: An Overview,' The Encyclopaedia of Religion, ed. Mircea Eliade, Vol. 2 (New York: Macmillan Publishing Company; London: Collier Macmillan Company, 1987. 334-351.

Robinson, Douglas. 'Literary Translation,' RETS, ed. Mona Baker. London & New York: Routledge, 1998.

Saddātissa, B. Ed. Mahāvagga, Alutgama, Sri Lanka, 1922.

Sankrityāyana Rahul. 'The Rise and Fall of Buddhism in India.' Selected Essays of Rahul Sankrityāyana, Peoples Publishing House, New Delhi,1984.

Sannasgala, P.B. Sinhala Sahitya Vamsaya, Colombo: Lake House Publishers, 1961.

Schleiermacher, Fr, D.E. 'The Hermeneutics; Outline of the 1819 Lectures.' New Literary History. Vol.10. No. 1 (Autumn 1978) 1. 1-29.

Silva, Lily de. 'Some Exegetical Techniques Employed in The Pali Commentaries, 'Sri Lankan Journal of Buddhist Studies. Vol. 2. Sri Lanka: Buddhist and Pali University, 1988. 91-108.

Singhe, N.K. and B. Baruah. (eds.), Encyclopedic Dictionary of Pali Literature, Vol.1 & 2. New Delhi: Global Vision Publishing House, 2003.

Tharu, Sushi, and K. Lalitha. ed. Women Writing in India: 600 B.C. To The Present. Vol. 1. Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1993. 65-69.

The New Encyclopedia Britannica (Micropeadia), Vol. 2, Chicago: Encyclopedia Britannica International, 2007.

Thurman, Robert A.F. 'Buddhist Hermeneutics,' JSTOR. Vol. 46, No.1. (Mar. 1978), 19-39.

Tosmo, Karma Lekshe. ed. Buddhist women Across Cultures. New Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications, 2000.

Trenckner, T. and R. Chalmers. eds. Majjhima Nikāya. 3 Vols. London: PTS. 1887-1901: Middle Length Sayings. trans. I.B. Horner. 3 Vols. London: PTS, 1954-1959.

Tulku, Doboom. ed. Buddhist Translations: Problems and Perspectives. New Delhi: Manohar Publishers, 1995.

Varma, C.B. ed. Dictionary of Abhidhammic Terms, Ranchi, India: SlP.2002.

--------. ed. Abhidhammatthasaṅgaha Sarūpa, Delhi: SIP, 2002.

--------. ed. A Concise Encyclopeadia of Buddhist Philosophy. Delhi: Eastern Book Publishers, 1992.

Venuti, Lawrence. The Translation Studies Reader. ed. 2000. London & New York: Routladge, 2003.

Wijayaratna, Mohan. Buddhist Nuns. Colombo: Wisdom Publications, 2001.